Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect



5 6

 $\frac{14}{15}$ 

Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/ympev

# 

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46 47

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

# A comprehensive species-level molecular phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae)

# 7 Q1 Alexis F.L.A. Powell<sup>a,\*</sup>, F. Keith Barker<sup>a</sup>, Scott M. Lanyon<sup>a</sup>, Kevin J. Burns<sup>b</sup>, John Klicka<sup>c</sup>, Irby J. Lovette<sup>d</sup>

8 <sup>a</sup> Department of Ecology, Evolution and Behavior, and Bell Museum of Natural History, University of Minnesota, 100 Ecology Building, 1987 Upper Buford Circle, St. Paul, MN 55108 LISA

10 <sup>b</sup> Department of Biology, San Diego State University, San Diego, CA 92182, USA

<sup>c</sup> Barrick Museum of Natural History, University of Nevada, Las Vegas, NV 89154, USA

12 <sup>d</sup> Fuller Evolutionary Biology Program, Cornell Lab of Ornithology, Cornell University, 159 Sapsucker Woods Road, Ithaca, NY 14950, USA

#### ARTICLE INFO

3 718Article history:19Received 5 June 201320Revised 11 November 201321Accepted 18 November 2013

- 22 Available online xxxx
- 23 Keywords:
- 24 Blackbird 25 Classificat
- 25 Classification26 Icteridae
- 27 Phylogeny
- 28 Systematics
- 29 Taxonomy

#### ABSTRACT

The New World blackbirds (Icteridae) are among the best known songbirds, serving as a model clade in comparative studies of morphological, ecological, and behavioral trait evolution. Despite wide interest in the group, as yet no analysis of blackbird relationships has achieved comprehensive species-level sampling or found robust support for most intergeneric relationships. Using mitochondrial gene sequences from all ~108 currently recognized species and six additional distinct lineages, together with strategic sampling of four nuclear loci and whole mitochondrial genomes, we were able to resolve most relationships with high confidence. Our phylogeny is consistent with the strongly-supported results of past studies, but it also contains many novel inferences of relationship, including unexpected placement of some newly-sampled taxa, resolution of relationships among major clades within Icteridae, and resolution of genus-level relationships within the largest of those clades, the grackles and allies. We suggest taxonomic revisions based on our results, including restoration of *Cacicus melanicterus* to the monotypic *Cassiculus*, merging the monotypic *Ocyalus* and *Clypicterus* into *Cacicus*, restoration of *Dives atroviolaceus* to the monotypic *Ptiloxena*, and naming *Curaeus forbesi* to a new monotypic genus, *Anumara*. Our hypothesis of blackbird phylogeny provides a foundation for ongoing and future evolutionary analyses of the group.

#### 48

#### 49 1. Introduction

The New World blackbirds (Icteridae) are among the best 50 known and studied songbirds, both through exemplar species such 51 as the Red-winged Blackbird (Agelaius phoeniceus) and collectively 52 as a model clade in numerous studies of morphological, ecological, 53 and behavioral trait evolution. The size of the family (~108 54 55 species) and its variability along several dimensions of general theoretical interest makes Icteridae especially attractive for compara-56 tive studies. Topics that have been investigated comparatively in 57 blackbirds include mating systems (Searcy et al., 1999), brood par-58 59 asitism (Lanyon, 1992), sexual size dimorphism (Webster, 1992), sexual dichromatism (Irwin, 1994; Hofmann et al., 2008a, 2008b; 60 Friedman et al., 2009), plumage pattern divergence (Omland and 61 62 Lanyon, 2000; Price and Whalen, 2009), chemical bases of plumage color (Hofmann et al., 2006, 2007, 2008a, 2008b; Friedman et al., 63 **O2** 2011), ultraviolet and structural color (Eaton, 2006; Shawkey 64 65 et al., 2006), ecological correlates of plumage color (Johnson and Lanyon, 2000) and female song (Price, 2009; Price et al., 2009), 66

\* Corresponding author. Fax: +1 612 624 6777. E-mail address: alveypowell@yahoo.com (A.F.L.A. Powell).

1055-7903/\$ - see front matter © 2013 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.11.009 song divergence (Price and Lanyon, 2002b, 2004a; Price et al., 2007), migration (Kondo and Omland, 2007), biogeographic history (Sturge et al., 2009), and ecological niche divergence (Eaton et al., 2008).

Knowledge of phylogeny is a prerequisite for comparative analysis and the basis for systematic classification, but past analyses of blackbird relationships lacked comprehensive species-level sampling and failed to find robust support for most intergeneric relationships. The first molecular phylogenies of Icteridae with broad taxonomic sampling provided revolutionary insights into relationships within the family (Lanyon, 1994; Freeman and Zink, 1995; Lanyon and Omland, 1999) and its subgroups (Johnson and Lanyon, 1999; Omland et al., 1999; Price and Lanyon, 2002a, 2004a; Barker et al., 2008). Those findings were a huge advance over the diffuse hypotheses of relationship presented in taxonomic reviews based on informal evaluation of the external anatomy of museum skins (e.g. Ridgway, 1902; Hellmayr, 1937; Blake, 1968) or very limited molecular sampling (e.g. Sibley and Monroe, 1990). Sequence-based molecular studies, for the first time, brought together large numbers of informative characters with objective analytical methods to resolve relationships among most species and clades, tasks for which morphological characteristics

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211

212

2

89

90

91

A.F.L.A. Powell et al./Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

had proven to be weakly informative (e.g. Björklund, 1991) or even—in combination with informal and speculative methods of inference—misleading (e.g. Beecher, 1950, 1951).

92 In contrast to the other diverse families within the New World 93 nine-primaried oscine clade-namely, the tanagers (Thraupidae), 94 cardinal-grosbeaks (Cardinalidae), New World sparrows (Ember-95 izidae), and wood-warblers (Parulidae)-among which many spe-96 cies and genera have recently been shuffled, the constitution of 97 Icteridae has been unaffected by results from molecular phylogenetic studies (e.g. Burns, 1997; Klicka et al., 2000, 2007; Burns 98 et al., 2002, 2003; Lovette and Bermingham, 2002; Yuri and 99 Mindell, 2002; Klein et al., 2004; Alström et al., 2008; Lovette 100 et al., 2010; Barker et al., 2013). Apparently, features that have 101 traditionally been used to recognize blackbirds such as bill shape 102 103 (e.g. casque of maxilla; see Webster, 2003), morphology related 104 to gape-feeding by many species (Beecher, 1951; Orians, 1985), 105 and general similarities in shape, plumage, voice, display, and 106 ecology, have led to their accurate diagnosis. The only contrary 107 assertions have been the following: (1) placement of Spiza in Icteridae (Beecher, 1951; Raikow, 1978), which was immediately 108 109 disputed (see e.g. Tordoff, 1954) and is not currently supported 110 (e.g. molecular evidence places *Spiza* deep within the Cardinalidae; Klicka et al., 2007); (2) unsubstantiated suggestions of affinity 111 between Compsothraupis loricata and Icteridae (Jaramillo and 112 113 Burke, 1999); and (3) lack thereof for Amblycercus (Fraga, 2011). 114 Comprehensive genus-level multi-locus molecular sampling of 115 the nine-primaried oscines strongly supports the monophyly of Icteridae (Barker et al., 2013) as traditionally defined. 116

Although molecular phylogenetic studies of Icteridae (e.g. 117 118 Lanyon, 1992, 1994; Freeman and Zink, 1995; Lanyon and Omland, 119 1999) did not lead to its redefinition, they shed considerable light 120 on relationships within the family, including recognition of constit-121 uent clades and discovery that several genera-Molothrus, Agelaius, 122 *Cacicus*, and *Psarocolius*—as then defined, were not monophyletic. 123 Lanyon and Omland (1999) found that Icteridae comprises five 124 deeply-divergent lineages: the meadowlarks and allies (Sturnella, 125 *Dolichonvx*. *Xanthocephalus*): cup-nesting caciques (*Amblvcercus*): 126 caciques and oropendolas (Cacicus, Psarocolius, Clypicterus, Ocya-127 lus); orioles (Icterus); and a large set of genera collectively referred 128 to as the grackles and allies (e.g. Agelaius, Quiscalus, Molothrus). 129 However, they were unable to resolve basal divergences among 130 those lineages. Similarly, Johnson and Lanyon (1999) found strong support for several groups within the grackles and allies clade, 131 132 including cowbirds (Molothrus), marsh blackbirds (Agelaius), and grackles (Quiscalus), but poor support for the relationships among 133 134 those lineages. Among the more surprising findings of these stud-135 ies was a clade of South American endemics ("group 1" of Johnson 136 and Lanyon, 1999) within the grackles and allies, composed largely 137 of morphologically and ecologically enigmatic genera together 138 with species that had been thought to be members of genera out-139 side that clade (e.g., Molothrus, Agelaius). Subsequent studies have explored relationships within the basal icterid clades, especially the 140 orioles (e.g. Omland et al., 1999; Jacobsen et al., 2010) and caciques 141 and oropendolas (Price and Lanyon, 2002a, 2004a). Until recently 142 143 (Barker et al., 2013; this study), none has aimed to resolve relationships among the basal icterid clades or major groups within the 144 145 grackles and allies (but see Powell et al., 2013) with additional sequence or taxon sampling. Past phylogenies of Icteridae have not 146 147 been comprehensive, and except within the orioles (Allen and Om-148 land, 2003; Jacobsen et al., 2010; Jacobsen and Omland, 2011) and 149 some meadowlarks (Barker et al., 2008), they have relied solely 150 upon mitochondrial DNA. Therefore, a revision of the phylogeny 151 of Icteridae, using new methods and additional data, is in order. 152 The overall goal of the present study was to infer phylogenetic

relationships among all ~108 species of New World blackbirds (Icteridae) using both mitochondrial and nuclear DNA sequences. Key objectives were as follows: (1) sample all currently-recognized 155 species not included in previous studies; (2) robustly resolve rela-156 tionships among major clades within Icteridae; (3) robustly resolve 157 relationships among the grackles and allies, especially within a 158 phenotypically and ecologically diverse clade of South American 159 endemics, which previous studies failed to resolve with confi-160 dence; (4) compare patterns of relationship found in previous 161 mitochondrial studies to results from nuclear loci, and (5) suggest 162 taxonomic revisions based on our results. Preliminary results from 163 this project (i.e. phylogenies inferred from less comprehensive 164 versions of our dataset) have already informed studies of female 165 song (Price, 2009; Price et al., 2009) and plumage color evolution 166 (Friedman et al., 2011). 167

2. Methods

#### 2.1. Taxon and character sampling

Our analyses encompassed 114 ingroup and four outgroup taxa (Table 1). Sampling within Icteridae included all species currently recognized by taxonomic authorities (Dickinson, 2003; Remsen et al., 2012; Gill and Donsker, 2012) or in prominent references (Jaramillo and Burke, 1999; Fraga, 2011) except that we did not obtain samples of Psarocolius b. bifaciatus, Agelaioides badius fringillarius and Molothrus aeneus armenti (see also Dugand and Eisenmann, 1983) and we chose not to include samples of Psarocolius angustifrons alfredi (see Section 4.4) and Agelaius phoeniceus gubernator (see Dufort and Barker, 2013). About 10% of the sampled taxa had not been included in previous molecular phylogenies of Icteridae, including three meadowlarks (Sturnella militaris, S. loyca, S. defilippii), three caciques and oropendolas (Cacicus koepckeae, Psarocolius cassini, P. guatimozinus), an oriole (Icterus jamacaii), and three members of the grackles and allies subfamily (Dives atroviolaceus, Curaeus forbesi, Macroagelaius subalaris). We included more than one sample of a species if, in past studies, some of its subspecies appeared to be deeply divergent and geographically distinct lineages. Outgroups were selected based on results of recent molecular analyses of New World nine-primaried oscines with comprehensive genus-level sampling (Barker et al., 2013) and consisted of Icteria virens, Teretistris fernandinae, Seiurus aurocapillus, and Oreothlypis gutturalis.

Our molecular sampling design was informed by simulations and empirical phylogenetic studies (especially Wiens, 2005, 2006; Wiens et al., 2005; Wiens and Morrill, 2011) that found that incomplete data matrices, when properly assembled, can yield robust results. Our dataset included many more characters than previous studies, but practical limitations on obtaining all loci of interest from all taxa necessitated that most taxa be represented by a subset of characters. We aimed to sample strategically the types of loci most likely to be useful for resolving relationships in greatest need of additional study. To that end, our dataset comprised three overlapping "scaffolds" (Wiens, 2006)-two mitochondrial genes from >100 taxa, four nuclear loci from 46 of those taxa, and whole mitogenomes from 23 taxa-to which we opportunistically added other sequences as available (Table 1). This structure resulted in a substantial number of characters being shared among taxa, even though, overall, most characters were missing for most taxa. As a percentage of the complete data matrix, more characters were shared among more taxa than in less conservative, yet analytically successful, "sparse supermatrix" analyses (e.g. Thomson and Shaffer, 2010).

The set of 46 taxa (Table 1) from which we sequenced four nuclear loci (5266 bp total) included at least one representative from21326 of 28 ingroup genera (lacking only *Hypopyrrhus* and *Clypicterus*)215and all four outgroup species. From each of those taxa, we216

#### Table 1

Please cite this article in press as: Powell, A.F.L.A., et al. A comprehensive species-level molecular phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.11.009

Taxa, specimens, and GenBank sequences used in phylogenetic analyses of New World blackbirds (Icteridae). Samples from multiple specimens of a given taxon were combined to form chimaeric sequences for analyses. Bolded text indicates the subset of taxa included in 46-taxon analyses. If tissue and skin specimens of the same individual are housed at different institutions, both are listed (tissue in parentheses). Loci or sets of loci not collected for a given specimen are indicated with a dash.

Taxon	English name <sup>a</sup>	Voucher specimen or tissue <sup>b</sup>	Collecting locality	mtDNA sample description	GenBank numbers of mtDNA samples	GenBank numbers of nucDNA loci (ACO1-I9, FGB-I5, MB-I2, RAG1)
Clypicterus oseryi <b>Psarocolius decumanus</b>	Casqued Oropendola Crested Oropendola	LSUMZ 120394 FMNH 324065 CUMV-Bird 52534 (MACN- Or-ct 1130)	Peru: Loreto Peru: Madre de Dios Argentina: Jujuy	ND2, Cyt b ND2, Cyt b COX1	AF472408, AF472383 AF472400, AF472375 FJ028159	KF810987, -, KF810968, - KF810988, KF810953, KF810969, KF810938 -
		none	Panama	16S	AY283889	-
Psarocolius viridis	Green Oropendola	USNM 609202	Guyana	ND2, Cyt b	AY117726, AY117698	-
		USNM 639199	Guyana: Cuyuni-Mazaruni	COX1	JQ175997	-
Psarocolius atrovirens	Dusky-green Oropendola	FMNH 324106	Peru: Cuzco	ND2, Cyt b	AF472391, AF472366	-
Psarocolius a. angustifrons	Russet-backed Oropendola	LSUMZ 120397	Peru: Loreto	ND2, Cyt b	AF472389, AF472364	-
Psarocolius wagleri	Chestnut-headed Oropendola	LSUMZ B27280	Costa Rica: Cartago	ND2, Cyt b	AF472394, AF472369	KC007919, KC007643, KC007727, KC007834
Psarocolius montezuma	Montezuma Oropendola	LSUMZ 164424	Panama: Colón	ND2, Cyt b	AF472403, AF472378	KC007921, KC007645, KC007729, KC007836
Psarocolius cassini	Baudo Oropendola	ANSP 147013	Colombia: Choco	Cyt b	KF810925	-
Psarocolius bifasciatus yuracares	Olive Oropendola	FMNH 324076	Peru: Madre de Dios	ND2, Cyt b	AF472404, AF472379	-
Psarocolius guatimozinus	Black Oropendola	LSUMZ B48620	Panama: Darién	Cyt b	KF810926	-
Ocyalus latirostris	Band-tailed Oropendola	ANSP 177928 (LSUMZ B3625)	Peru: Loreto	ND2, Cyt b	AF472407, AF472382	KC007920, KC007644, KC007728, KC007835
Cacicus cela cela	Yellow-rumped Cacique	KUMNH 88289 (USNM B04259)	Guyana: Berbice	ND2, COX1, Cyt b	AY117731, JQ174227, AY117703	-
Cacicus cela vitellinus	Yellow-rumped Cacique	LSUMZ 163850	Panama: Colón	ND2, Cyt b	AY117732, AY117704	-
Cacicus haemorrhous	Red-rumped Cacique	USNM 621068	Guyana	ND2, Cyt b	AY117733, AY117705	-
		USNM 586489	Guyana: Barima-Waini	COX1	JQ174230	-
Cacicus uropygialis uropygialis	Subtropical Cacique	LSUMZ B6093	Ecuador: Morona-Santiago	ND2, Cyt b	AY117736, AY117708	-
Cacicus uropygialis microrhynchus	Scarlet-rumped Cacique	STRI PACUR-PC99	Panama	ND2, Cyt b	AY117738, AY117710	-
		USNM 608010	Panama: Bocas del Toro	COX1	JQ174233	-
Cacicus uropygialis pacificus	Pacific Cacique	ANSP 182884	Ecuador: Esmeraldas	ND2, Cyt b	AY117735, AY117707	-
Cacicus chrysopterus	Golden-winged Cacique	USNM 620761	Argentina	ND2, Cyt b	AY117740, AY117712	-
		MACN-Or-ct 987	Argentina: Jujuy	COX1	FJ027255	-
Cacicus chrysonotus chrysonotus	Southern Mountain Cacique	LSUMZ 103278	Bolivia: La Paz	ND2, Cyt b	AY117745, AY117717	
Cacicus chrysonotus leucoramphus	Northern Mountain Cacique	ANSP 182883	Ecuador: Imbabura	ND2, Cyt b	AY117743, AY117715	
Cacicus sclateri	Ecuadorian Cacique	ANSP 177931 (LSUMZ B103568)	Peru: Loreto	ND2, ND2–COX3, Cyt b	AY117746, KF810923,AY117718	KC007922, KC007646, KC007730, KC007837
Cacicus koepckeae	Selva Cacique	LSUMZ B48621	Peru: Loreto	Cyt b	KF810927	_
Cacicus solitarius	Solitary Cacique	FMNH 324089	Peru: Cuzco	ND2, Cyt b	AY117747, AY117719	KF810989, –, KF810970, –
		MACN-Or-ct 1403	Argentina: Corrientes	COX1	FJ027264	-
Cacicus melanicterus Amblycercus h.	Mexican Cacique Yellow-billed Cacique	UWBM 52185 KUMNH 1928	Mexico: Oaxaca Mexico: Yucatán	ND2, Cyt b ND2, Cyt b	AY117749, AY117721 AY117722, AY117750	KF810990, –, KF810971, – –
noioscriceus		USNM 608009	Panama: Bocas del Toro	COX1	JQ174007	-

YMPEV 4758 2 December 2013

A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

(continued on next page)

Table 1	(continued)
---------	-------------

Taxon	English name <sup>a</sup>	Voucher specimen or	Collecting locality	mtDNA sample	GenBank numbers of mtDNA	GenBank numbers of nucDNA loci (ACO1-I9
		tissue <sup>b</sup>		description	samples	FGB-I5, MB-I2, RAG1)
Amblycercus	Yellow-billed Cacique	LSUMZ 98900	Peru: Puno	ND2, ND2–COX3, Cyt b	AF472411, KF810921,	KC007923, KC007647, KC007731, KC007838
holosericeus australis					AF472386	
Icterus icterus	Venezuelan Troupial	LSUMZ B11328	Puerto Rico	ND2, Cyt b	AF099335, AF099296	_
	Ĩ	LSUMZ B48559	Guyana	COX1	KF810934	-
Icterus croconotus	Orange-backed Troupial	FMNH 324092	Peru: Madre de Dios	ND2, Cyt b	AF099336, AF089031	-
		USNM 632494	Guyana: Upper Takutu- Upper Essequibo	COX1	JQ175139	-
Icterus jamacaii	Campo Troupial	LGEMA 2742	Brazil: Piaui	COX1	JN801752	-
Icterus pectoralis	Spot-breasted Oriole	MMNH 42544	USA: Florida	ND2, Cyt b	AF099348}, AF099304	-
		KUMNH 109733	El Salvador: La Paz	COX1	DQ432954	_
Icterus graceannae	White-edged Oriole	ANSP 181810	Ecuador: Loja	ND2, Cyt b	AF099329, AF089030	_
Icterus mesomelas	Yellow-tailed Oriole	LSUMZ 109279	Panama: Darién	almost whole	JX516068	KF810991, KF810954, KF810972, KF810939
Icterus cayanensis	Epaulet Oriole	MPEG 40.357	Brazil: Rondônia	ND2, Cyt b	AF099316, AF089027	-
-	•	USNM 625332	Guyana	COX1	JQ175135	_
Icterus chrysocephalus	Moriche Oriole	FMNH 339734	Venezuela: Sucre	ND2, Cyt b	AF099317, AF099279	_
		USNM 625748	Guyana	COX1	JQ175138	_
Icterus pyrrhopterus	Variable Oriole	FMNH 334608	Bolivia: Santa Cruz	ND2, Cyt b	AF099319, AF099280	_
		USNM 614726	Argentina: Entre Ríos	COX1	JQ175136	_
Icterus bonana	Martinique Oriole	STRI MA-IBO2	Martinique	ND2, COX1, ATP8-ATP6,	AF109445, AF109429,	_
	I.			Cyt b	AF109413, AF099277	
Icterus laudabilis	St. Lucia Oriole	STRI SL-ILA4	St. Lucia	ND2. COX1. ATP8-ATP6.	AF109455, AF109439,	-
				Cvt b	AF109423, AF099298	
Icterus oberi	Montserrat Oriole	STRI MO-IOB4	Montserrat	ND2, COX1, ATP8–ATP6, Cyt b	AF109447, AF109431, AF109415, AF099303	-
Icterus dominicensis	Hispaniolan Oriole	AMNH NKK1112	Dominican Republic	Cyt b, CR	AY216867, AY211217	_
Icterus portoricensis	Puerto Rican Oriole	STRI PR-IDO1	Puerto Rico	ND2, COX1, ATP8–ATP6, Cvt b	AF109451, AF109435, AF109419 AF099288	-
Icterus melanopsis	Cuban Oriole	MNHNCu 4/8/92	Cuba	ND2. Cvt b	AF099324, AF099286	-
Icterus northropi	Bahama Oriole	BNT REF024	Bahamas: Andros	ND2. Cvt b	AF099325, AF099287	-
Icterus prosthemelas	Black-cowled Oriole	KUMNH 89517	Mexico: Campeche	ND2, COX1, ATP8-ATP6	AF109448, AF109432,	_
1			ľ		AF109416	
		MMNH 42542	Mexico: Yucatán	Cyt b	AY211213	-
Icterus spurius	Orchard Oriole	NCSM	USA: Colorado	ND2	AF099352	-
		USNM 626504	USA: Florida	COX1	DQ432955	-
		FMNH 381975	USA: Illinois	Cyt b, CR	AY211198, AY211230	-
Icterus fuertesi	Ochre Oriole	MMNH 42538	Mexico: Veracruz	ND2, Cyt b, CR	AF099351, AY211215,	-
					AY211219	
Icterus cucullatus	Hooded Oriole	BB-BEHB25	unknown	-	-	KF810992, KF810955, KF810973, KF810940
		FMNH 341931	USA: California	ND2, Cyt b	AF099323, AF099284	-
		UWBM 48323	USA: Arizona	COX1	DQ433692	-
Icterus wagleri	Black-vented Oriole	MZFC QRO-216	Mexico: Querétaro	ND2, Cyt b	AF099353, AF099308	
Icterus maculialatus	Bar-winged Oriole	INIREB SRF-387	Mexico: Chiapas	ND2, Cyt b	AF099340, AF099299	-
Icterus parisorum	Scott's Oriole	FMNH 341943	USA: California	ND2, Cyt b	AF099347, AF089035	KC007924, KC007648, KC007732, KC00783
		FMNH 334367	USA: Arizona	COX1	DQ432953	-
Icterus auricapillus	Orange-crowned Oriole	FMNH 261843	Colombia: Boyacá	Cyt b	KF810928	-
Icterus chrysater	Yellow-backed Oriole	UWBM 69019	Nicaragua: Chinandega	ND2, Cyt b	AF099321, AF099281	-
Icterus graduacauda	Audubon's Oriole	LSUMZ B-4023	USA: Texas	ND2, Cyt b	AF099330, AF099291	-
Icterus galbula	Baltimore Oriole	UMMZ 226382	USA: Michigan	12S, ND2–COX1, COX2– ATP6	AF447237, AF447287, AF447337	-
		FMNH 350604	USA: Illinois	Cyt b, CR	AY607656, AY607621	-
		ROM 1B-131	Canada: Ontario	COX1	EU525431	-
Istomus abaillai	Black-backed Oriole	MZFC 9657	Mexico: Ouerétaro	ND2	AF099311	-
icterus ubennen						

2 December 2013

**YMPEV 4758** 

ARTICLE IN PRESS

A.F.L.A. Powell et al./Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

Pl Ph	Icterus bullockii	Bullock's Oriole	MBMC jk95-095	USA: Oregon	ND2, Cyt b	EF529839, EF52
eas Iylo			UWBM 59056	USA: Washington	COX1	DQ433689
og			UWBM 55975	USA: Washington	CR	AY611475
ene	Icterus pustulatus	Streak-backed Oriole	UWBM 52129	Mexico: Chiapas	ND2, Cyt b	AF099349, AF09
e ti et.			MZFC keo38	Mexico: Jalisco	CR	AY611477
his Ev	Icterus leucopteryx	Jamaican Oriole	FMNH 331145	Jamaica: Trelawny	ND2, COX1, ATP8-ATP6	AF109443, AF1
ol.						AF109411
(2			FMNH 33144	Jamaica: Trelawny	Cyt b	AF089032
:le	Icterus auratus	Orange Oriole	UAM 7222	Mexico: Yucatán	ND2, Cyt b	AF099312, AF09
3) in	Icterus nigrogularis	Yellow Oriole	STRI TR-INI1	Trinidad	ND2, COX1, ATP8-ATP6,	AF109456, AF10
, pr					Cyt b	AF109424, AF09
ess			USNM 627066	Guyana	COX1	JQ175145
a:	Icterus gularis	Altamira Oriole	FMNH	Mexico: Oaxaca	ND2, Cyt b	AF099332, AF09
dx ::	-		UWBM 52191	Mexico: Oaxaca	COX1	DQ433697
ov .dc	Nesopsar nigerrimus	Jamaican Blackbird	FMNH 331150	Jamaica: Portland	whole	JX516054
ve]	Gymnomystax	Oriole Blackbird	FMNH 339743	Venezuela: Falcón	whole	JX516075
grid	mexicanus					•
/10	Macroagelaius subalaris	Colombian Mountain	LACM 40973	Colombia: Santander	Cyt b	KF810929
21 E	0	Grackle			5	
<b>9</b> , <b>P</b>	Macroagelaius imthurni	Golden-tufted	FMNH 339783	Venezuela: Bolívar	whole	IX516073
et 6/j	5	Mountain Grackle				5
al. .yr	Hvpopyrrhus	Red-bellied Grackle	ICN 33977 (IAvH 2078)	Colombia: Antioquia	ND2. Cvt b	AY572450, AY5
A	pyrohypogaster					,
ev co	Lampropsar tanagrinus	Velvet-fronted	ANSP 177921 (LSUMZ	Peru: Loreto	almost whole	IX516057
.20		Grackle	B103505)			J
ore	Gnorimonsar choni	Chopi Blackbird	FMNH 334679	Bolivia: Santa Cruz	whole	IX516055
he he	Curaeus curaeus	Austral Blackbird	AMNH 826156	Chile: Magallanes	whole	IX516070
ns 1.0	Curaeus forbesi	Forbes's Blackbird	MPEG 72143 CPE-II 040	Brazil: Pernambuco	ND2-COX3 Cvt b	KF810920 KF82
09	Amblyramphus	Scarlet-headed	FMNH 334662	Bolivia: El Beni	whole	IX516063
st	holosericeus	Blackbird	111111 33 1002	Doninal Di Deni		j.1010000
Dec	Agelasticus	Pale-eved Blackbird	FMNH 324094	Peru: Madre de Dios	whole	IX516059
lies	xanthonhthalmus	Fuie eyeu blackbira	1111111111111	rerur maare de bios		j.1010000
<u>-</u>	Agelasticus cvanonus	Unicolored Blackbird	FMNH 334636	Bolivia: El Beni	whole	IX516076
eve	Agelasticus thilius	Yellow-winged	FMNH 334615	Bolivia: Oruro	whole	IX516069
-	- geneerene ennee	Blackbird				J.1010000
nol	Chrysomus ruficanillus	Chestnut-capped	FMNH 330775	Brazil: Rio Grande do Sul	whole	IX516056
ec	eniyeeniae rajicapinae	Blackbird		Brazini nao oranae ao bar		j.1010000
ula	Chrysomus	Yellow-hooded	FMNH 339772	Venezuela: Sucre	whole	IX516060
ur I	icterocenhalus	Blackbird		Venezaciai Sacre		jnorodod
ohy	Xanthonsar flavus	Saffron-cowled	FMNH 330747	Brazil: Rio Grande do Sul	whole	IX516065
/lo	inanciepeni jiarae	Blackbird		Brazini nao oranae ao bar		jnorocoo
gei	Pseudoleistes guirahuro	Yellow-rumped	FMNH 330795	Brazil: Rio Grande do Sul	whole	IX516071
ny	i comorene gan mini e	Marshbird		Brazini nao oranae ao bar		jnoroon
of	Pseudoleistes virescens	Brown-and-vellow	FMNH 330796	Brazil: Rio Grande do Sul	whole	IX516066
th		Marshbird				j
ez	Oreonsar holivianus	Bolivian Blackbird	FMNH 334687	Bolivia: El Beni	whole	IX516058
Vev	Agelaioides hadius	Baywing	FMNH 330801	Brazil: Rio Grande do Sul	whole	JX516074
~ /	Molothrus rufoaxillaris	Screaming Cowbird	FMNH 330805	Brazil: Rio Grande do Sul	ND2 ND2-COX3 Cvt b	AF109961 KF8
Vo	mototin us rujoukinu is	Serealing combina	111111 330003	Bruzh, hio Grunde do Sur	1102, 1102 CONS, Cyr b	AF089044
rld			none	Argentina: Formosa	CR	FU199785
[ b]	Molothrus orvzivorus	Giant Cowbird	FMNH 324097	Peru: Madre de Dios	Cvt b	AF089060
ac			I SUMZ 134021	Bolivia: Pando	125 ND2 ND6-CR	AF407089 AF4
kb			ESOME IS IDEI	bolivia, rando	125, 1192, 1190°CK	AF407132
ird			USNM 587829	Guyana	COX1	IO175403
) s	Molothrus geneus	Bronzed Cowhird	BB-73 James	Mexico: Puebla	whole	JQ175405 IX516067
Ict	Molothrus honariensis	Shiny Cowbird	I SUM7 113963	Peru: Lambayeque	125 ND2 ND6	AF407090 AF40
eri	motornas ponunciisis	Shiny Cowbitu	250WIZ 115505	reiu, Lambayeque	125, 1102, 1100	AF407133
da			MACN-Or-ct 3062	Argentina: Buenos Aires	COX1	FI027842
e).			FMNH 334768	Puerto Rico	Cvt h	AF089043
R				. acres raco	-ye b	
ol.						

EF529950	-
AF099305	-
AF109427,	-
AF099276 AF109440, AF099302	-
AF099293	-
	KC007925, KC007649, KC007733, KC007840 KC007926, KC007650, KC007734, KC007841
	-
	KC007938, KC007663, KC007747, KC007854
, AY572451	-
	KC007937, KC007662, KC007746, KC007853
KF823980	KC007935, KC007660, KC007744, KC007851 KC007934, KC007659, KC007743, KC007850 KF810993, KF810956, KF810974, KF810941 KC007933, KC007658, KC007742, KC007849
	KF810994, -, KF810975, -
	KC007929, KC007653, KC007737, KC007844 KF810995, KF810957, KF810976, KF810942
	-
	KF810996, KF810958, KF810977, KF810943
	KC007928, KC007652, KC007736, KC007843
	KF810997, KF810959, KF810978, KF810944
	KC007932, KC007657, KC007741, KC007848
, KF810924,	KC007936, KC007661, KC007745, KC007852 KC007942, KC007667, KC007751, KC007858 KF810999, KF810960, KF810979, KF810945
AF407046,	– KF810998, KF810961, KF810980, KF810946 –
	-
AF407047,	-

\_

A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

(continued on next page) сī

Table 1	(continued)
---------	-------------

Taxon	English name <sup>a</sup>	Voucher specimen or	Collecting locality	mtDNA sample	GenBank numbers of mtDNA	GenBank numbers of nucDNA loci (ACO1-I
Tullon	Linghish hanne	tissue <sup>b</sup>	concerning rocarry	description	samples	FGB-I5, MB-I2, RAG1)
		none	Argentina: Buenos Aires	CR	DQ683553	_
Molothrus ater	Brown-headed	FMNH 350707	USA: Chicago	-	-	KC007943, KC007668, KC007752, KC00785
	Cowbird	10.077		100 ND2 00V1 00V2		
		UMMZ none	USA: Michigan	125, ND2-COX1, COX2-	AF447241, AF447291,	-
		BIOLIC:SPP1681-70648	Canada: Ontario	COX1	DO434680	_
		MBMC ik 96–016	USA: Minnesota	Cvt b	EF529951	_
Dives atroviolaceus	Cuban Blackbird	FMNH 375251	Cuba: Pinar del Río	Cyt b	KF810930	_
Dives dives	Melodious Blackbird	MBMC 7100	Honduras: Copán	whole	JX516061	KC007939, KC007664, KC007748, KC00785
Dives warczewiczi	Scrub Blackbird	LSUMZ 113959	Peru: Lambayeque	ND2, Cyt b	AF109962, AF089021	KF811000, KF810962, KF810981, KF81094
Agelaius phoeniceus	Red-winged Blackbird	BB-96 Tordoff	USA: Minnesota	whole	JX516062	-
Analaina anaimilia	Dad should and	FMNH 341893	USA: Louisiana	- Cut h	-	KC007930, KC007654, KC007738, KC00784
Agelalus assimilis	Blackbird	MINHINCU	Cuba	Cyt b	AF089004	-
Agelaius tricolor	Tricolored Blackbird	LSUMZ 130833	USA: California	ND2, Cyt b	AF109949, AF08911	KF811001, KF810963, KF810982, KF81094
		USNM 632199	USA: California	COX1	JQ173923	-
Agelaius humeralis	Tawny-shouldered Blackbird	none	Cuba	ND2, Cyt b	AF109947, AF089006	-
Agelaius xanthomus	Yellow-shouldered Blackbird	BB-SML 86–1	Puerto Rico	ND2, Cyt b	AF109948, AF089012	KF811002, KF810964, KF810983, KF810949
Euphagus carolinus	Rusty Blackbird	FMNH 333317	USA: Illinois	ND2, Cyt b	AF109950, AF089023	KF811003, KF810965, KF810984, KF81095
		ROM 1B-3617	Canada: Ontario	COX1	AY666525	-
Euphagus cyanocephalus	Brewer's Blackbird	FMNH 342000	USA: California	whole	JX516072	-
		FMNH 341985	USA: California	-	-	KC007941, KC007666, KC007750, KC00785
Quiscalus quiscula	Common Grackle	FMNH 341733	USA: Illinois	whole	JX516064	KC007940, KC007665, KC007749, KC00785
Quiscalus lugubris lugubris	Carib Grackle	FMNH 339797	Venezuela: Falcon	ND2, Cyt b	AF109952, AF089054	-
		USNM 627469	Guyana: Mahaica-Berbice	COX1	JQ176090	-
Quiscalus lugubris contrusus	Carib Grackle	USNM 612608	St. Vincent	ND2, COX1, Cyt b	FJ389553, JQ176089, FJ389562	-
		STRI SV-QLU2125	St. Vincent	ATP8-ATP6	AF132427	-
Quiscalus mexicanus E	Great-tailed Grackle	MBMC JMD1014	USA: Texas	ND2, Cyt b	FJ389555, FJ389564	-
Quiacalus movicanus ME	Creat tailed Creakle	UWBM 52154	Mexico: Chiapas	COXI ND2 Cut h	DQ434032	- VE911004 VE910066 VE910085 VE91005
Quisculus mexiculus vv	Boat-tailed Grackle	FMNH 341975	USA: Louisiana	ND2, Cyt b	AF109953 AF089055	–
Quisculus mujor	bout tuned Grackie	USNM 626311	USA: Florida	COX1	D0433156	-
Quiscalus palustris	Slender-billed Grackle	USNM 194170	Mexico: Estado de México	Cyt b	FJ389557	-
Quiscalus nicaraguensis	Nicaraguan Grackle	MBMC 4375	Nicaragua: Tipitapa	ND2, Cyt b	FJ389549, FJ389558	KF811005, KF810967, KF810986, KF81095
Quiscalus niger	Greater Antillean Grackle	FMNH 331153	Jamaica: Trelawny	ND2, Cyt b	AF109955, AF089057	Ā
Sturnella militaris	Red-breasted Blackbird	FMNH 339777	Venezuela: Falcón	ND2, Cyt b	KF810937, KF810931	-
		USNM 625917	Guyana	COX1	JQ176296	
Sturnella superciliaris	White-browed Blackbird	FMNH 334657	Bolivia: Santa Cruz	Cyt b	AF089038	KC007846, FJ154707, KC007655, KC00773
		LSUMZ B9630	Bolivia: Pando	12S, ND2–COX1, COX2– ATP6	AF447239, AF447289, AF447339	-
		USNM 635873	Uruguay: Atigas	COX1	JQ176299	-
		NRM 947221	Paraguay	ND3	JN715497	-
Sturnella bellicosa	Peruvian Meadowlark	ANSP 178118	Ecuador: Bolívar	ND2, Cyt b	FJ154660, AF089062	FJ154708, -, -, -
Sturnella defilippii	Pampas Meadowlark	AMNH 816591	Argentina: Buenos Aires	Cyt b	KF810932	-
Charles all a lances	Long-tailed	MACN-Ur 68357	Argentina: Buenos Aires	ND2, Cyt b	KF810936, KF810933	-
Sturnella loyca	Meadowlark					
Sturnella loyca	Meadowlark	AMNH DOT-13514	Argentina: Río Negro	COX1. CR	FI028336, IN417869	IN417982

A.F.L.A. Powell et al./Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

6

2 December 2013

**YMPEV 4758** 

		UMMZ 227823	USA: Louisiana	12S, ND2-COX1, COX2-	AF447257, AF447307,	-
				ATP6	AF447357	
		ROM SMM 88-1	Canada: Ontario	COX1	AY666282	-
Sturnella lilianae	Lilian's Meadowlark	FMNH 393903	Mexico: Sonora	ND2, Cyt b	FJ154691, FJ154636	FJ154725, -, -, -
		ROM JCB5473	USA: Texas	COX1	AY666267	-
Sturnella neglecta	Western Meadowlark	FMNH 341967	USA: California	ND2, Cyt b	FJ154698, FJ154651	-
		ROM 1B-1038	Canada: Ontario	COX1	EU525529	-
		FMNH 330040	USA: California	-	-	KC007931, KC007656, KC007740, KC007847
Xanthocephalus	Yellow-headed	LSUMZ 126564	USA: California	ND2, COX1, COX1-	KC007584, KF810935,	KC007927, KC007651, KC007735, KC007842
xanthocephalus	Blackbird			COX3, Cyt b	KF810922, AF089067	
Dolichonyx oryzivorus	Bobolink	FMNH 334721	Bolivia: Santa Cruz	-	_	FJ154706, KC007669, KC007753, KC007860
		UMMZ 234583	USA: Michigan	12S, ND2-COX1, COX2-	AF447226, AF447276,	-
				ATP6, Cyt b	AF447326, AF447367	
		BIOUG: LMA 8101-91770	Canada: Ontario	COX1	DQ434587	-
Outgroups:						
Icteria virens	Yellow-breasted Chat	UWBM CDS4131 (STRI	USA: Washington	ND2–ATP6, Cyt b	GU932138, AF383028	GU931924, GU932031, GU932352, KC007812
		USIVI 4131)	-	-		
		LSUMZ B3892	USA: Louisiana	12S	AF447236	-
Seiurus aurocapilla	Ovenbird	STRI-PRSAU1	Puerto Rico: Patillas	ND2-ATP6, Cyt b	GU932043, GU932365	GU931829, GU931936, GU932257, KC007800
-		UMMZ 224992	USA: Michigan	12S	AF447254	_
Oreothlypis gutturalis	Flame-throated	LSUMZ B26458	Panama: Chiriquí	ND2-ATP6, Cyt b	GU932041, GU932363	GU931827, GU931934, GU932255, KC007792
	Warbler			-		
Teretistris fernandinge	Yellow-headed	ANSP-B5548 (STRI CUTFE	Cuba: Guantánamo	ND2-ATP6, Cyt b	GU932143, AF382999	GU931929, GU932036, GU932357, KC007804
i ci cuoti to jei nunullitte		EE 40)		-		

ral History Museum ernardino Rivadavia; MBMC = Marjorie Barrick Museum of Natural History; MNHNCu = Museo Nacional de Historia Natural Cuba; MMNH = James Ford Bell Museum of Natural History; MPEG = Museu Paraense Emílio Goeldi; MZFC = Museo de Zoología de la Facultad de Ciencias, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México; NCSM = North Carolina State Museum of Natural Sciences; NRM = Swedish Museum of Natural History; ROM = Royal Ontario Museum; STRI = Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute; UAM = University of Alaska Museum; UMMZ = University of Michigan Museum of Zoology; USNM = Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History; UWBM = University of Washington, Burke Museum of Natural History and Culture. 

<sup>c</sup> Eastern and western lineages of *Quiscalus mexicanus* are treated as separate taxa.

A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

 $\overline{}$ 

2 December 2013

A.F.L.A. Powell et al./Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

217 sequenced one protein-coding autosomal gene, two autosomal in-218 trons, and one sex-linked (Z chromosome) intron. Those loci were, 219 respectively, recombination activating gene 1 (RAG1), myoglobin 220 intron 2 (MB-I2), β-fibrinogen intron 5 (FGB-I5), and aconitase 1 in-221 tron 9 (ACO1-I9). We also sequenced MB-I2 and ACO1-I9 from four 222 additional taxa (including Clypicterus) and added ACO1-I9 or FGB-223 I5 sequences of another four taxa that were available in GenBank 224 (Table 1).

225 How comprehensively the mitochondrial genome was represented in our dataset varied considerably among taxa (Table 1). 226 We obtained sequences of the cytochrome b gene (1143 bp) for 227 228 all 118 taxa in our study except Icterus jamacaii, for which we only 229 had COX1 sequence from GenBank. Cytochrome b was the only gene that we sequenced from nine rarely-collected or extinct spe-230 231 cies that were sampled using DNA from toe-pads of museum skins. 232 For all other taxa, we also obtained ND2 gene sequences (1041 bp). 233 Preliminary phylogenetic analyses indicated that within the South 234 American endemic clade our initial mitochondrial and nuclear 235 dataset was unable to resolve any but a few trivial relationships, 236 so we turned to more extensive mitochondrial sampling as a 237 source of additional signal. We utilized whole mitochondrial gen-238 ome sequences (~16,775 bp) of 23 species (20 of them within 239 our 46-taxon set; Table 1). For five other ingroup taxa in the 46-240 taxon set and for the four outgroups, we obtained sequences of a 241  $\sim$ 5000 bp fragment encompassing ND2, COX1, COX2, ATP8, ATP6, 242 and several tRNA genes. Further, we filled in remaining missing 243 sequence for each taxon to the extent possible using GenBank 244 records, provided we could be confident of their taxonomic identities. Most additional mitochondrial sequences were from the 245 246 COX1, ATP6, and 12S rRNA genes. Whenever possible, all nuclear 247 and mitochondrial gene sequences were obtained from the same 248 specimen; for 45 taxa, we assembled chimaeric sequences from two or more individuals (Table 1). 249

#### 250 2.2. Laboratory procedures and sequence preparation

251 Genomic DNA was extracted from frozen tissue and toe-pad 252 samples as described in Powell et al. (2008) or with conventional 253 phenol/chloroform methods (e.g. as in Lanyon, 1994). To avoid 254 contamination, we processed toe-pad specimens in a lab not other-255 wise used for extraction or amplification of avian DNA. Target DNA 256 fragments were amplified via the polymerase chain reaction (PCR). See the following references for details of primers and cycling 257 258 parameters: cytochrome b and ND2 (Barker et al., 2008; Powell et al., 2008); whole mitogenomes and large fragments (Powell 259 260 et al., 2013); RAG1 (Barker et al., 2002); and MB-I2, FGB-I5, and 261 ACO1-I9 (Barker et al., 2008, 2013). Purification of PCR products, 262 sequencing, sequence editing, and alignment were as described 263 in Powell et al. (2013) except that some products were sent to 264 Beckman Coulter Genomics (Danvers, MA) for sequencing.

#### 265 2.3. Data partitioning and phylogeny inference

To probe for misleading effects of character and taxon sampling 266 267 on phylogeny inference, we assembled the following datasets for 268 analysis and comparison: (1) concatenated (to analyze with stan-269 dard phylogenetic inference) and (2) unconcatenated (to analyze 270 with species tree methods) nuclear sequences of the 46 taxa for 271 which all four loci were sampled; (3) concatenated nuclear se-272 quences of the 54 taxa with any nuclear data; (4) cytochrome b, 273 (5) combined ND2 and cytochrome *b*, and (6) full mitochondrial 274 alignments of the 46-taxon and (7-9) 117 or 118-taxon sets. Based 275 on results from those datasets, we assembled the following data-276 sets for our final analyses: (10) concatenated and (11) unconcate-277 nated combined nuclear and full mitochondrial alignments of the 278 46-taxon sample; and (12) concatenated combined nuclear and full

mitochondrial alignments of all 118 taxa. To maximize sequence279coverage for *Molothrus* in the 46-taxon analyses of combined nu-280clear and mitochondrial loci, we utilized a chimaeric sequence281composed of the mitogenome of *M. aeneus* with the nuclear se-282quences of *M. ater.*283

All datasets were partitioned for analysis. Partitioning was 284 accomplished by finely dividing each dataset according to a priori 285 categories (such as gene and codon position), then using Partition-286 Finder 1.0.1 (Lanfear et al., 2012)-set to assess all models with the 287 greedy algorithm under the Bayesian information criterion (BIC; 288 Schwarz, 1978)-to find an optimal scheme for grouping subsets 289 according to similarities in evolutionary tendencies. The most com-290 plicated datasets were the full-length mitochondrial alignments. As 291 described in Powell et al. (2013), alignment positions of those data-292 sets were sorted into 48 initial subsets according to all possible 293 combinations of the following categories: noncoding/coding, hea-294 vy/light template strand, protein/RNA-coding, gene identity (done 295 for rRNA and protein-coding genes only), codon position, and 296 paired/unpaired bases in RNA secondary structure. Initial subdivi-297 sion of nuclear markers was limited to separation by locus and, 298 for RAG1, codon position. On occasion, PartitionFinder returned 299 an inappropriately complicated model that led to spurious param-300 eter estimates for a data subset. To reassess those cases, or when we 301 needed to identify best models for individual data blocks, we used 302 the BIC in jModelTest 2 (Darriba et al., 2012). We used the  $\chi^2$  test of 303 homogeneity of base frequencies across taxa, as implemented in 304 PAUP\* 4.0b10 (Swofford, 2002), and  $\chi^2$  goodness-of-fit tests of indi-305 vidual taxa compared to the among-taxon average (Gruber et al., 306 2007), to check for overall stationarity of base composition at vari-307 able alignment positions within data subsets. 308

For single-locus and concatenated-loci datasets, we inferred 309 phylogenetic relationships under maximum likelihood (ML) using 310 GARLI 2.0 (Zwickl, 2006) and with Bayesian methods using 311 MrBayes-3.2.1 (Ronquist et al., 2012). We also used Bayesian 312 methods as implemented in \*BEAST 1.7.4 (Drummond et al., 313 2012) to infer species trees from our unconcatenated multilocus 314 46-taxon datasets. Most GARLI analyses were run on the CIPRES 315 Science Gateway (Miller et al., 2010), where we conducted heuris-316 tic searches for ML trees using 50 random starting points (i.e. 317 searchreps) and evaluated nodal support with 500 bootstrap repli-318 cates, each with a single random starting point. Analyses with 319 MrBayes used Metropolis coupling (four chains with default heat-320 ing) and generally ran for 6-12 million generations, sampling every 321 100 generations, with a burn-in of 10–25%. We found that default 322 settings in MrBayes yielded unrealistically long tree-length 323 estimates in partitioned analyses, so following Marshall (2010), 324 we set a shorter prior on mean branch length (brlenspr = uncon-325 strained:exp (100.0)). Analyses using \*BEAST ran for 200 million 326 generations, sampling every 10,000 generations, with a burn-in 327 of 10%. For all partitions or loci in those analyses, we used a lognor-328 mal relaxed clock model of evolutionary rate, with an exponential 329 prior (mean = 0.1). All mitochondrial partitions in \*BEAST analyses 330 were linked under the same tree model. We used Tracer 1.5 (Ram-331 baut and Drummond, 2009) and the AWTY server (Wilgenbusch 332 et al., 2004) to check that effective sample sizes for parameter esti-333 mation in Bayesian analyses were adequate (i.e. >200) and that 334 estimates of nodal posterior probability had converged. 335

Because sampling completeness varied substantially among 336 taxa, we examined the results of the various datasets to assess 337 their sensitivity to completeness of marker and taxon sampling, 338 as well as congruence between inferences from nuclear loci and 339 the mitochondrial genome. We looked for significant differences 340 between analyses in their support for hypotheses of relationship, 341 especially instances of strong conflict in pairwise comparisons 342 (i.e. cases in which each of two incongruent hypotheses of relation-343 ship were supported by  $\geq$  70% of bootstrap replicates or  $\geq$  95% of 344

9

A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

345 posterior samples at incompatible nodes). To further investigate 346 conflict and congruence among the five independent loci used in 347 this study, we inferred the phylogeny of the 46-taxon set separately for each locus under ML with 500 bootstrap replicates, then 348 compared the bipartitions inferred from each locus to those in-349 ferred from each of the other loci at 70% and 90% thresholds of 350 351 bootstrap support. For each pairwise comparison of loci, we tallied instances of strongly supported nodal conflict and congruence, and 352 examined the extent to which the bipartitions inferred from each 353 locus matched the nodes of the single best 46-taxon topology in-354 ferred from all loci combined. 355

#### 3. Results 356

#### 3.1. Partitions, substitution models, and base composition 357

358 Optimal partitioning was achieved using relatively few data 359 groups. As in Powell et al. (2013), we found that the most salient 360 categories for mitogenomic partitioning were codon position, 361 RNA secondary structure pairing, and the coding/noncoding dis-362 tinction (Table 2). The best scheme for cytochrome b, for both 46 and 117-taxon analyses, was by codon position. The ND2 plus cyto-363 364 chrome *b* datasets were partitioned by codon position and by gene 365 for 3rd positions. Nuclear markers sorted separately from mito-366 chondrial data groups. Even though codon position was a significant variable within RAG1, the best schemes for the 367 368 concatenated datasets utilized only four nuclear data groups (Table 369 2) because some loci were so similar that they grouped together.

Base composition of variable sites in the nuclear data subsets 370 371 did not differ significantly among taxa. The mitochondrial genome 372 varies regionally (Powell et al., 2013), so testing that locus for sta-373 tionarity was complicated by differences in the extent of sampling 374 across species. No significant deviations were apparent within portions of the alignment with good taxonomic representation and 375 376 nearly complete coverage for all sampled taxa (e.g. cytochrome b, ND2, COX1). As discussed in Powell et al. (2013), the composition 377 378 of the mitochondrial genome of *Dives dives* differed significantly from the average of the 23 taxa for which we sequenced whole 379 mitogenomes, but that difference appeared inconsequential for 380 381 phylogeny inference because compositional similarity was not cor-382 related with tree topology.

#### 383 3.2. Phylogenies

384 Analyses of the datasets that we assembled using GARLI, MrBa-385 yes, and \*BEAST, yielded a set of >20 summary phylogenetic trees. 386 The primary purpose of most analyses was to investigate sensitiv-387 ity of results to sampling and inference methods; consequently, 388 most trees are not shown, but comparisons among them are de-389 scribed below and in Appendix S1. For a given dataset, different 390 optimality criteria yielded trees without strongly-supported topo-391 logical differences and with few differences in assignments of strong nodal support (see Section 3.7). For simplicity, we refer 392 393 mainly to results from ML analyses in Sections 3.3-3.6. A represen-394 tative set of trees, including those we consider to be our best esti-395 mates of phylogeny, are as follows: 118-taxon analyses of the full 396 mitochondrial dataset (Fig. 1); 46-taxon analyses of the nuclear 397 dataset (Fig. 2); 46-taxon analyses of the combined mitochondrial 398 and nuclear datasets (Fig. 3); and the 118-taxon analyses of the 399 combined mitochondrial and nuclear datasets (Fig. 4).

#### 3.3. Effects of taxon sampling on phylogeny inference 400

401 Taxon addition can sometimes bolster phylogeny inference 402 (Wiens, 2005; Wiens and Tiu, 2012), but in this study, after prun-

full mitochondri	al alignment and four nuclear loci.					
Data subset	Positions	Number	of position	S	Model <sup>a</sup>	Parameter values
		Total	Variable	Parsimony informative		(ΓAG. ΓAG. ΓΑΤ. ΓCG. ΓCT. ΓGT.), ( $\pi_{A}$ , $\pi_{G}$ , $\pi_{T}$ ), $\alpha$ , $p_{iv}$
mtDNA 1	Codon 1st positions of ATP6, COX2, Cyt b, ND1–6	2958	716	507	$TVM + I + G^{p}$	(0.54, 10.67, 0.70, 0.15, 10.67, 1), (0.30, 0.33, 0.18, 0.18), 0.671, 0.620
mtDNA 2	Codon 2nd positions (all mitochondrial)	3620	251	138	$TrN + I + G^{b}$	(4.11, 73.33, 1, 4.11, 17.64, 1), (0.19, 0.29, 0.12, 0.40), 0.535, 0.870
mtDNA 3	Codon 3rd positions of all except ND1–2	3121	2601	2034	GTR + I + G	(0.22, 14.47, 0.58, 0.22, 9.89, 1), (0.43, 0.42, 0.04, 0.10), 1.991, 0.030
mtDNA 4	Codon 3rd positions of ND1–2	672	624	554	$TrN + G^{c}$	(1, 43.93, 1, 1, 27.45, 1), (0.41, 0.37, 0.07, 0.15), 3.408, NA
mtDNA 5	RNA paired positions; codon 1st positions of COX1 and COX3	2880	270	160	$K81 + I + G^{b}$	(1, 22.91, 0.23, 0.23, 22.91, 1), (0.25, 0.25, 0.25, 0.25), 0.627, 0.830
mtDNA 6	RNA unpaired positions; codon 2nd positions of ND6	2160	384	241	TIM + I + G <sup>b</sup>	(1, 8.35, 0.58, 0.58, 12.13, 1), (0.44, 0.23, 0.12, 0.21), 0.557, 0.667
mtDNA 7	Noncoding positions; codon 1 st positions of ATP8	1290	390	267	HKY + I + G	(1, 6.11, 1, 1, 6.11, 1), (0.31, 0.30, 0.11, 0.28), 0.607, 0.533
nucDNA 1	AC01-19, FGB-15	1673	425	147	HKY + G	(1, 3.76, 1, 1, 3.76, 1), (0.29, 0.17, 0.21, 0.33), 1.043, NA
nucDNA 2	MB-I2, codon 3rd positions of RAG1	1671	295	112	TrNef + I + G <sup>d</sup>	(1, 5.79, 1, 1, 9.20, 1), (0.25, 0.25, 0.25, 0.25), 0.977, 0.522
nucDNA 3	Codon 1st positions of RAG1	961	57	17	HKY + I	(1, 3.61, 1, 1, 3.61, 1), (0.32, 0.20, 0.30, 0.17), NA, 0.892
nucDNA 4	Codon 2nd positions of RAG1	961	35	14	HKY + I	(1, 8.20, 1, 1, 8.20, 1), (0.36, 0.19, 0.18, 0.27), NA, 0.925
<sup>a</sup> Abbreviatior	ns as used in PartitionFinder 1.0.1 (Lanfear et al., 2012).					
<sup>b</sup> GTR + I + G r	nodel implemented in MrBayes.					
c GTR + G moo	del implemented in MrBayes.					
d HKY + I + G I	model implemented in MrBayes.					

2 December 2013

A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx



**Fig. 1.** Phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae) inferred from mitochondrial DNA sequences of 118 taxa (outgroups not shown). The topology shown here is the single best tree (-lnL = 112464.25) found under maximum likelihood (ML). Nonparametric bootstrap percentages from ML analysis appear immediately above or below branches. Filled circles indicate nodes with estimated posterior probabilities of  $\ge 0.95$  in Bayesian analyses of the same concatenated dataset.

Please cite this article in press as: Powell, A.F.L.A., et al. A comprehensive species-level molecular phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae). Mol.

Phylogenet. Evol. (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.11.009

## **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx





ing trees to include only the taxa in the less comprehensive 403 analyses, we found little effect on the pattern or number of 404 strongly-supported nodes. By those measures, ML reconstructions 405 406 from the 46 (Fig. 2) and 54-taxon concatenated nuclear-only data-407 sets were identical, as were results from the 46 and 118-taxon 408 datasets of combined nuclear and mitochondrial sequences (Figs. 3 and 4). Only the trees generated exclusively from mitochondrial 409 410 data exhibited any differences in topology or assignments of strong

support (see Appendix S1), but no discrepancy was an instance of strongly-supported conflict.

411

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

The phylogenetic position inferred for *Nesopsar*, and confidence for its placement, depended on data sampling and analytical method. We were concerned that its unstable placement (e.g. sister to *Agelaius* versus sister to all grackles and allies exclusive of *Molothrus* and *Agelaius*) might disproportionately shape reconstruction of basal divergences in the grackles and allies clade. To test for such

Please cite this article in press as: Powell, A.F.L.A., et al. A comprehensive species-level molecular phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.11.009

# ARTICLE IN PRESS

#### A.F.L.A. Powell et al./Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx



**Fig. 3.** Phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae) inferred from mitochondrial and nuclear DNA sequences of 46 taxa (outgroups not shown). The topology shown here is the single best tree (-lnL = 105577.92) found under maximum likelihood (ML). Nonparametric bootstrap percentages from ML analysis appear immediately above or below branches. Filled circles indicate nodes with estimated posterior probabilities of  $\geq 0.95$  in Bayesian analyses of the concatenated dataset, and filled squares indicate nodes that also received posterior probability estimates of  $\geq 0.95$  in species-tree analyses.

effects, we analyzed the 118-taxon combined full mitochondrial
and nuclear dataset after excluding *Nesopsar* and found the resulting tree topology unchanged apart from its absence. However, ML
bootstrap support for the monophyly of all grackles and allies
exclusive of *Agelaius* increased to 73% from 52%, and support for
monophyly of the remaining grackles and allies exclusive of *Agela- ius* and *Molothrus* increased to 99% from 95%.

#### 3.4. Effects of mitochondrial locus sampling on phylogeny inference

We found that adding sequence, even when unevenly sampled427across taxa, led to addition of strongly-supported nodes, and not to428switches in patterns of strongly-supported relationships. For429example, in the 117 or 118-taxon analyses, the full mitochondrial430dataset yielded a ML tree (Fig. 1) with strong support for 93 of431

426

Please cite this article in press as: Powell, A.F.L.A., et al. A comprehensive species-level molecular phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.11.009

YMPEV 4758 2 December 2013

### **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

#### A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx



**Fig. 4.** Phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae) inferred from mitochondrial and nuclear DNA sequences of 118 taxa (outgroups not shown). The topology shown here is the single best tree (-lnL = 127652.47) found under maximum likelihood (ML). Nonparametric bootstrap percentages from ML analysis appear immediately above or below branches. Filled circles indicate nodes with estimated posterior probabilities of  $\geq 0.95$  in Bayesian analyses of the same concatenated dataset.

Please cite this article in press as: Powell, A.F.L.A., et al. A comprehensive species-level molecular phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.11.009

481

482

483

484

485

486

487

488

489

490

491

492

493

494

495

496

497

498

499

500

501

502

503

504

505

506

507

508

509

510

511

512

513

514

515

516

517

14

A.F.L.A. Powell et al./Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

432 115 nodes, including all 53 and all but one of 78 strongly-sup-433 ported nodes recovered with cytochrome b and the ND2 plus cyto-434 chrome *b* datasets, respectively. Support for the position of 435 Nesopsar differed by dataset. The ND2 plus cytochrome b dataset 436 found strong (76% bootstrap) support for the monophyly of all grackles and allies exclusive of Nesopsar, whereas the full dataset 437 438 supported (70% bootstrap) grouping Nesopsar with Dives, Euphagus, 439 Quiscalus, and the South American endemics. For further details of effects of mitochondrial locus sampling, see Appendix S1. 440

#### 441 3.5. Congruence of inferences from nuclear loci and mtDNA

442 Our analyses of congruence among individual loci (Table 3) re-443 vealed no conflict of the mitochondrial locus with nuclear markers 444 except FGB-I5, which conflicted with other loci at several bipartitions despite its modest resolving power. The nuclear markers with 445 446 the highest resolving power, ACO1-I9 and RAG1, were incongruent at only 1 bipartition. Combined support for nodes of the tree in-447 ferred from the 46-taxon full mitochondrial and nuclear dataset 448 was sometimes higher than might be expected given low or con-449 tradictory support from individual loci (Fig. S1). No node with 450 strong combined support lacked support from at least one locus, 451 and none exhibited strong conflict with mtDNA, but four nodes re-452 ceived strong combined support without strong support from 453 mtDNA and despite, in two cases, strong conflict between nuclear 454 markers. Five clades with strong combined nuclear support did not 455 456 receive strong support from any single nuclear locus (see Appendix 457 S1 for more details).

Phylogenies generated from separate 46-taxon mitochondrial 458 (not shown) and concatenated nuclear datasets (Fig. 2) showed 459 460 strong support for a majority of relationships but yielded somewhat different topologies. However, with one exception, differ-461 462 ences occurred at nodes that were poorly supported by at least 463 one of those two datasets. According to mitochondrial data, Xan-464 thocephalus and Dolichonyx are sister taxa (97% bootstrap support) 465 that compose a clade sister to Sturnella. By contrast, phylogenies 466 inferred from nuclear data placed Xanthocephalus sister to a 467 strongly supported (92% bootstrap) Dolichonyx-Sturnella clade.

468 Placements of the eight taxa with partial data in our 54-taxon 469 nuclear phylogenies (not shown) were congruent with the tree 470 from the 118-taxon full mitochondrial alignment (Fig. 1). The nu-471 clear data recovered the following relationships: Sturnella bellicosa 472 and S. loyca with S. superciliaris, thus supporting monophyly of the 473 red-breasted meadowlarks (83% bootstrap, 100% posterior probability); Sturnella lilianae and S. magna together (73, 98), and that 474 475 pair sister to S. neglecta (99, 100), thus supporting monophyly of the yellow-breasted meadowlarks; Cacicus solitarius and Clypicte-<br/>rus into a poorly-resolved grouping with Ocyalus and Cacicus scla-<br/>teri (90, 100); Cacicus melanicterus outside a well-supported (76,<br/>99) clade containing Psarocolius, Ocyalus, Clypicterus, and all other<br/>Cacicus; and Agelasticus xanthopthalmus with A. cyanopus (99, 100).476<br/>477

# 3.6. Inferences from separate and combined nuclear and mtDNA datasets

In our study, mitochondrial data proved superior for resolving short internodes and relationships among closely-related species, whereas nuclear data were somewhat better at resolving basal relationships. A striking feature of the 46-taxon ML analysis of combined nuclear loci (Fig. 2) was its nearly complete failure to resolve robustly relationships within the South American endemic clade—only one node out of 13 received strong support. By contrast, ML analysis of the mitochondrial dataset, which included full mitogenomic sequences of most species in that clade, recovered 11 well-supported nodes. With respect to the rest of the tree, built from less comprehensive sampling of the locus, the mitochondrial dataset performed no better than the nuclear dataset—both datasets resolved 24 of 30 nodes with confidence.

To the extent that their strengths were complementary, the nuclear and mitochondrial datasets had potential for fusion of their best qualities (Wiens, 2005, 2006). However, the datasets had some limitations in common and they did exhibit some conflict (see Section 3.5). Consequently, the 46-taxon ML phylogeny built from the combined data (Fig. 3) had 37 strongly-supported nodes out of 43, a net gain of only two more than the tree from the mitochondrial dataset. Similarly, the ML analysis of the combined datasets for all 118 taxa (Fig. 4) contained 96 well-supported nodesthree more than the mitochondrial tree (Fig. 1). The combined dataset trees were very similar to the mitochondrial trees. They had strong support at some nodes robustly recovered by nuclear loci, including the sister relationship of Amblycercus to all other caciques and oropendolas, the sister relationship of Icterus to the grackles and allies, and in the case of the 118-taxon tree, robust placement of Cacicus solitarius as sister to the other caciques (excepting C. melanicterus and Amblycercus). On the other hand, the combined dataset trees exhibited lower confidence for some nodes within the South American blackbirds, and placements of Xanthocephalus and Nesopsar were as robustly recovered with nuclear loci but with poor support due to conflict with the mitochondrial signal.

We compared the 46-taxon species-tree from nuclear loci to the species-tree from the combined dataset and found no significant 519

#### Table 3

Congruence among DNA sequences with respect to inferring the phylogeny of New World blackbirds (Icteridae) using a 46-taxon dataset. For each pairwise comparison of loci, the number of conflicting (bold text, above diagonal) and concordant (below diagonal) bipartitions in the trees inferred from them under maximum-likelihood (ML) are shown at two levels of bootstrap support (90% and 70%). Each of those quantities is also shown (in parentheses) scaled as a percentage of the bipartitions retained in a semistrict (combinable component) consensus of the trees being compared. In addition, for each locus, the total number of bipartition conflicts with other loci, the number of bipartitions resolved at a given support level, and the ratio of those values, are given. Note that the total number of conflicts for a given locus can exceed the number of nodes it resolves because a given bipartition can conflict with multiple loci and multiple bipartitions inferred from each locus.

Support level	Locus	Locus					No. conflicting bipartitions	No. resolved bipartitions	Ratio conflict/resolution
		mtDNA	ACO1-I9	FGB-I5	MB-I2	RAG1			
90% ML	mtDNA	-	0 (0)	1 (3.2)	0 (0)	<b>0</b> ( <b>0</b> )	1	30	0.03
	ACO1-I9	5 (16.1)	-	0(0)	0(0)	0(0)	0	6	0
	FGB-I5	3 (9.7)	2 (25.0)	-	0 (0)	1 (8.3)	2	4	0.50
	MB-I2	2 (6.5)	3 (50.0)	2 (40.0)	-	0 (0)	0	3	0
	RAG1	8 (25.0)	2 (14.3)	2 (16.7)	2 (18.2)	-	1	10	0.10
70% ML	mtDNA	-	0 (0)	4 (10.0)	0 (0)	0 (0)	4	35	0.11
	ACO1-I9	14 (35.9)	-	5 (20.0)	1 (4.5)	1 (4.5)	7	18	0.39
	FGB-I5	6 (15.0)	4 (16.0)	-	0 (0)	2 (10.0)	11	11	1.00
	MB-I2	6 (16.2)	4 (18.2)	4 (26.7)	-	1 (6.3)	2	8	0.25
	RAG1	10 (27.0)	8 (36.4)	3 (15.0)	4 (25.0)	-	4	12	0.33

A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

incongruence. Placement of *Nesopsar* as sister to *Agelaius* got strong
 (98% posterior) support using nuclear sequences, but not with the
 combined dataset (87% posterior); the other 14 strongly-supported
 nodes in the former analyses were recovered in the latter, which
 found robust support for 21 of 43 nodes.

# 3.7. Concordance of results from analyses based on different optimality criteria

527 We found no strongly-supported topological differences be-528 tween trees inferred from a given dataset using different optimal-529 ity criteria. Furthermore, analyses using GARLI and MrBayes almost 530 always agreed in assigning support to nodes according to the 531 thresholds that we selected for comparing bootstrap values to pos-532 terior probability ( $\geq$ 70% and  $\geq$ 95%, respectively). However, in a 533 very few cases, assessments were sharply discordant. For exam-534 ple, apart from uniting Xanthopsar with Pseudoleistes, relationships 535 within the South American clade received extremely poor support 536 in ML analyses of the 46-taxon nuclear locus dataset, but the same 537 topology was recovered by MrBayes with strong support at four 538 additional nodes (Fig. 2).

Using the 118-taxon combined dataset, we found that the 539 540 topologies of the single best tree from GARLI and the consensus 541 tree from MrBayes were identical, even at poorly supported nodes, 542 with one exception-the Bayesian tree found Curaeus forbesi sister 543 to Gnorimopsar with poor (58% posterior) support, whereas in ML, 544 those lineages were sequentially nested branches in relationship to 545 other taxa (Fig. 4). Assessments of strong support agreed at all but 546 6 of 115 nodes (Fig. 4). To test whether strong Bayesian support for 547 the monophyly of all other grackles and allies exclusive of a wellsupported Nesopsar-Agelaius clade was peculiar to MrBayes, we 548 used BEAST to analyze the same concatenated dataset and got 549 550 the same result. For further details of effects of optimality criteria, see Appendix S1. 551

#### 552 4. Discussion

553 We present the first comprehensive species-level phylogeny of 554 Icteridae. By using mitochondrial gene sequences from all currently recognized taxa, together with strategic sampling of four nu-555 556 clear loci and whole mitochondrial genomes, we were able to 557 resolve most relationships with high confidence. Our best estimate 558 of phylogeny (Fig. 4) exhibits a topology that is consistent with the 559 strongly supported results of past studies, but that also contains 560 many new and robustly resolved inferences of relationship. These 561 novel hypotheses of relationship include some unexpected place-562 ments of taxa that had not been included in previous molecular 563 phylogenies, resolution of the relationships among major clades within Icteridae, and resolution of genus-level relationships within 564 565 the grackles and allies.

#### 566 4.1. Congruence of results from different analyses

567 Although it is possible that inferences made with our most inclusive dataset were biased by uneven coverage of sequence 568 569 sampling across taxa, previous studies have found phylogenetic analyses robust to missing data when they include an adequate 570 571 number of shared informative characters (Wiens, 2005; Wiens 572 and Moen, 2008; Wiens and Morrill, 2011). We can state with con-573 fidence that heterogeneous addition of data did not undermine 574 recovery of relationships that received robust support with smaller datasets having uniform coverage. The congruent results of our 575 576 analyses demonstrate that most findings were robust to variation 577 in mitochondrial sampling, taxon sampling, and use of signal 578 derived from either the mitochondrial or nuclear genomes. In general, nuclear loci were less successful than mitochondrial loci for inferring relationships at the tips of the tree, but they provided stability to relationships throughout the tree and corroborated many results of previous studies based on mitochondrial data alone.

#### 4.2. Icteridae and its major subclades

Although the composition of Icteridae has rarely been questioned, until recently, robust support for its monophyly (Barker et al., 2013) and basal relationships within it has been lacking. Lanyon and Omland (1999), using mitochondrial cytochrome *b* sequences, found support for five major clades within Icteridae, but not for their interrelationships or for icterid monophyly. Klicka et al. (2007), using ND2 plus cytochrome *b*, found strong support for Icteridae excluding meadowlarks and allies, but not for the family as a whole, for monophyly of the meadowlarks and allies, or for basal relationships. Using our expanded mitochondrial dataset, we recovered Icteridae and the meadowlarks and allies with strong support, but we were unable to resolve robustly relationships among the other four major clades.

Nuclear loci allowed us to reconstruct basal relationships within Icteridae with high confidence, and they resolved homoplasy in the mitochondrial signal such that support values were even higher using the combined dataset. We found a graded pattern of relationship among major clades, with the meadowlarks and allies sister to the rest of Icteridae (as in previous studies). Within the latter, the caciques and oropendolas (including *Amblycercus*) were sister to a pairing of the orioles with the grackles and allies. This pattern does not match mitochondrial topologies, which grouped (with poor support) the orioles with the caciques and oropendolas, a position that concurred with traditional views (e.g. American Ornithologists' Union, 1983).

#### 4.3. Meadowlarks and allies

Meadowlarks (Sturnella) generally inhabit open grasslands and are notable for their stocky build, long bill, relatively short tail. and red or vellow breast versus cryptically-streaked dorsal coloration. Prior to the present study, a thorough molecular treatment was lacking. Lanyon and Omland (1999) included six of 10 species in their study of Icteridae, and Barker et al. (2008) included six species in their treatment of the yellow-breasted meadowlarks, but the three red-breasted species served only as outgroups. We found that placements of the red-breasted species not included in previous studies fit traditional expectations: each is sister to the species with which it has sometimes been considered conspecific-S. militaris with superciliaris, and loyca with defilippii. Both our mitochondrial and nuclear datasets supported monophyly of red and yellowbreasted groups, which are genetically more divergent ( $\sim$ 15%) than any other congeners within Icteridae. The meadowlarks were once divided between Sturnella, Leistes, and Pezites, until Short (1968) merged them for lack of substantial morphological and ecological divergence. Sibley and Monroe (1990) gave new life to Leistes, citing Parker and Remsen (1987), who argued for its continued recognition based on behaviors shared with Agelaius phoeniceus and not with Sturnella. When molecular studies later found S. bellicosa more closely related to L. superciliaris than to the yellow-breasted Sturnella species. Leistes was abandoned since it made Sturnella as then defined (i.e. inclusive of *Pezites*), paraphyletic. We found that all meadowlark genera are monophyletic as originally defined, though support for placement of S. bellicosa with S. loyca and S. defilippii, to constitute Pezites, was weak in most analyses.

One of the most surprising findings of the first molecular phylogenies of Icteridae (Lanyon, 1994; Lanyon and Omland, 1999) was that *Xanthocephalus* is not allied with *Agelaius*, as had been supposed from behavioral and ecological similarities, but rather

Please cite this article in press as: Powell, A.F.L.A., et al. A comprehensive species-level molecular phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.11.009

15

581 582 583

584

585

586

587

588

589

590

591

592

593

594

595

596

597

598

599

600

601

602

603

604

605

606

607

608

609

610

611

612

613

614

615

616

617

618

619

620

621

622

623

624

625

626

627

628

629

630

631

632

633

634

635

636

637

638

639

640

579

705

706

707

708

709

710

711

712

713

714

715

716

717

718

719

720

721

722

723

724

725

726

727

728

729

730

731

732

733

734

735

736

737

755

756

757

758

759

760

761

762

763

764

16

#### A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

641 is most closely related to Dolichonyx and Sturnella. Our nuclear and 642 mitochondrial datasets both supported that unexpected grouping, 643 but in the pattern of divergences among those genera we encoun-644 tered the only instance of conflict between strongly-supported 645 nodes inferred from nuclear versus mitochondrial sequences. Nu-646 clear data placed Xanthocephalus sister to a Dolichonyx-Sturnella 647 clade, whereas mitochondrial data supported a sister relationship between Xanthocephalus and Dolichonyx. We obtained all four nu-648 649 clear loci and a substantial amount of mitochondrial sequence 650 from each of these taxa, so it seems that many more loci will be necessary to resolve these relationships with confidence. Although 651 652 Xanthocephalus and Dolichonyx are more closely related to Sturnella 653 than to other icterids, they are genetically and phenotypically divergent. Dolichonyx is unique among blackbirds for undergoing 654 655 two complete molts per year and is unusual among New World 656 passerines for being an interhemispheric migrant. Xanthocephalus 657 and Dolichonvx are so different from one another that their mor-658 phologies and behaviors are not particularly suggestive of one resolution of relationships over another. 659

#### 660 4.4. Caciques and oropendolas, including Amblycercus

The caciques and oropendolas (~23 spp.) are inhabitants of 661 662 tropical forests, where their pendant nests and displays can make 663 them conspicuous, especially in the case of colonial species. They 664 span a wide range of sizes, from Cacicus sclateri (23 cm, 57 g) to 665 Psarocolius montezuma (up to 53 cm, 560 g; Fraga, 2011). Perhaps 666 because of small effective population sizes in polygynous species, 667 phylogenetic studies of the group have yielded well-resolved and 668 strongly-supported hypotheses of relationship, even when inter-669 nodes are short (e.g. this study, Price and Lanyon, 2002a, 2002b). 670 Our main concerns were to achieve complete taxon sampling and 671 to use nuclear loci to test some of the surprising findings of previ-672 ous studies. We also propose a number of taxonomic revisions, 673 many of them long overdue given results of previous studies (i.e. 674 Price and Lanvon, 2004a, 2004b).

675 Mitochondrial DNA, even with increased sample size, was not 676 able to recover the cup-nesting cacique. *Amblycercus*, as sister to 677 the typical caciques and oropendolas, but nuclear loci did so with 678 very strong support, as did the combined dataset. Like mitochon-679 drial data, the nuclear loci indicate that the genetic divergence of 680 Amblycercus from the other caciques and oropendolas is substantial. Nuclear markers also supported the position of Cacicus melan-681 682 *icterus* outside the rest of the typical caciques and oropendolas, and 683 the combined dataset placed it sister to them with strong support; 684 consequently, that taxon should be restored to Cassiculus (e.g. Fra-685 ga, 2011). The remaining caciques and oropendolas sort into two 686 clades, one containing all species currently placed in Psarocolius, 687 and the other comprising mostly Cacicus species.

688 Mitochondrial data placed Cacicus solitarius sister to Psarocolius, 689 but with only weak support. By contrast, nuclear loci strongly supported a sister relationship of Cacicus solitarius to the other Cacicus 690 spp., as did analysis of the combined dataset under ML (Bayesian 691 692 analysis recovers the same topology with weak support). 693 Consequently, our study found that Cacicus solitarius need not be 694 Q3 reassigned to Procacicus, as proposed by Fraga (2005). A very 695 surprising finding of previous studies was the close relationship between Ocyalus and Clypicterus (Freeman and Zink, 1995; Price 696 and Lanyon, 2002a, 2004a) and the position of those taxa well out-697 698 side of Psarocolius. Subsequent work (Price and Lanyon, 2004a), 699 that even more surprisingly found those genera imbedded within 700 Cacicus, has thus far been ignored in taxonomic revisions. We 701 found strong nuclear (and combined) support for placement of 702 Ocyalus and Clypicterus in the Cacicus clade; consequently, those 703 species should be reassigned to that genus. Elsewhere within 704 Cacicus, we recovered the same pattern of relationships found by

Price and Lanyon (2004a), except that we included *C. koepckeae*, which we recovered as sister to *C. sclateri* as anticipated (Cardiff and Remsen, 1994). Following Price and Lanyon (2004a), we included deeply divergent subspecies of *Amblycercus* and several *Cacicus* spp., which should probably be recognized as species. Some authorities (e.g. Jaramillo and Burke, 1999; Fraga, 2011; Gill and Donsker, 2012) recognize *Cacicus* (*uropygialis*) *microrhynchus* as a species and treat *C. u. pacificus* as a subspecies of *C. microrhynchus*, when in fact, mitochondrial DNA indicates that *pacificus* is more closely related to *C. u. uropygialis*.

Within Psarocolius, we recovered the same pattern of relationships found by Price and Lanyon (2002a, 2002b, 2004a) but added two species missing from previous studies.<sup>1</sup> We found that the newly sampled taxa, P. cassini and P. guatimozinus, are sister to one another, that *P. montezuma* is sister to that pair, and that those three taxa are sister to P. (bifasciatus) yuracares, all of which were placed in the formerly-recognized *Gymnostinops*. The sister relationship between Gymnostinops and P. viridis was a surprise when first discovered (Price and Lanyon, 2004b), although song characteristics supported the alliance (Price and Lanyon, 2002b). Indeed, that result has yet to be embraced by taxonomic authorities (e.g. Gill and Donsker, 2012; Remsen et al., 2012), who still list P. viridis between the much more distantly related P. atrovirens and P. decumanus. Divergences among all these taxa are very shallow, but all nodes were strongly supported. For the sake of clarity, we chose not to include multiple representatives of P. decumanus and P. angustifrons, even though both species contain divergent lineages (Price and Lanyon, 2002a, 2002b, 2004a). Both complexes require further investigation and taxonomic revision. Some authorities have treated P. angustifrons alfredi as a species (e.g. Sibley and Monroe, 1990), yet mitochondrial DNA indicates that P. angustifrons atrocastaneus is even more divergent from P. a. angustifrons than is P. angustifrons alfredi.

#### 4.5. Orioles

The orioles, a group of small arboreal or shrub-dwelling icterids, 738 many with distinctive orange and black plumage patterns, repre-739 sent the second-largest of the major clades within Icteridae, 740 yet all ~33 species are classified in one genus, Icterus. The orioles 741 have been the subject of intensive systematic study (Omland 742 et al., 1999; Lovette et al., 2001; Allen and Omland, 2003; Sturge 743 et al., 2009; Jacobsen et al., 2010; Jacobsen and Omland, 2011), 744 including very thorough sampling at the subspecies level, and 745 use of both mitochondrial DNA and nuclear introns. These studies 746 have generally found high concordance between signals and re-747 solved very short internodes (Jacobsen et al., 2010), but have also 748 uncovered instances of conflict between nuclear and mitochondrial 749 markers that are unlikely to be outcomes of incomplete lineage 750 sorting (Jacobsen and Omland, 2011). It seems that introgression 751 among the ancestors of a few species, some of which are presently 752 involved in different hybridization interactions, has complicated 753 the histories of their genomes. 754

Nuclear sampling in our study was limited to one representative from each of the three major clades within *Icterus*; consequently, we did not have much opportunity to, nor did we, encounter cases of conflict between nuclear and mitochondrial signals. Although our mitochondrial sampling was more extensive than in previous studies, the pattern of relationships we recovered was equivalent to, and no better resolved than, results of those studies from which the data was largely derived (e.g. Omland et al., 1999). We included *I. jamacaii*, the only oriole missing from previous phylogenies, as a COX1 sequence from GenBank (Table 1),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Note that *P. b. bifasciatus* was ostensibly treated in Powell (2012) but is not included here because the tissue sample was later found, based on voucher examination, to be *P. viridis*.

829

830

831 832

833

#### A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

765 in hope of resolving its position among troupials, a group of orioles 766 unusual for their large size, white irides, and blue-colored bare skin 767 around the eyes. A closer relationship of I. icterus to I. croconotus 768 than to I. jamacaii received strong support under ML, but not using 769 Bayesian methods. If accurate, this placement is contrary to treatment of I. croconotus as a subspecies of I. jamacaii in classifications 770 771 that recognize only two species of troupial (e.g. Sibley and Monroe, 1990). Inclusion of samples of I. cayanensis, I. chrysocephalus, and I. 772 pyrrhopterus in our study should not be interpreted as an endorse-773 ment of resolving species limits within that complex (D'Horta 774 775 et al., 2008) to those taxa, but rather, was done to illustrate repre-776 sentative divergences within it using names that appear in current taxonomic lists and other references. 777

#### 778 4.6. Grackles and allies

Grackles and allies compose the most taxonomically diverse of 779 the major clades within Icteridae despite the superficial similarity 780 of many species, especially those with all black plumage. Although 781 ours was more successful than any previous study, a definitive res-782 783 olution of genus-level relationships within the clade remains elu-784 sive, as neither whole mitochondrial genomes nor the nuclear 785 loci we sampled provided consistently robust support for all nodes. 786 Studies based on ND2 plus cytochrome b (e.g. Johnson and Lanyon, 787 1999; Eaton, 2006) found Nesopsar and Dives to be sequentially sis-788 ter to all other grackles and allies, whereas in this study whole 789 mitochondrial genomes placed Nesopsar in a poorly-resolved basal 790 position relative to Agelaius, Molothrus, and a strongly-supported 791 Dives-Euphagus-Quiscalus plus South American endemics clade. 792 Although the finding of a sister relationship between the South American clade and Dives-Euphagus-Quiscalus also received strong 793 support in combination with nuclear loci, it was dependent on the 794 795 signal from whole mitogenomes, and thus was novel to this study. Nuclear loci (together) supported the Dives-Euphagus-Quiscalus 796 797 clade and a sister relationship between Nesopsar and Agelaius, 798 but the latter relationship conflicted with placement of *Nesopsar* 799 sister to the Dives-Euphagus-Quiscalus plus South American 800 endemics clade, as found with the 118-taxon full mitochondrial 801 dataset. As a consequence of those antagonistic signals, the Nesop-802 sar-Agelaius pairing received inconsistent (48% ML bootstrap, 99% Bayesian posterior probability) support in the combined dataset 803 analysis, as did monophyly of the remaining grackles and allies 804 (52%, 99%), thus yielding an imperfectly robust resolution of basal 805 806 relationships in the grackles and allies, the topology of which (Fig. 4) is altogether unique to this study. Note that recovering that 807 808 topology was not dependent on placement of Nesopsar; in fact, 809 when it was excluded from the dataset, ML support for the mono-810 phyly of all grackles and allies exclusive of Agelaius increased to 811 73% (from 52%). We cannot explain the apparently differing signals 812 contained in the nuclear and mitochondrial genomes of Nesopsar, 813 but we have ruled out effects of overall base composition (Powell et al., 2013) or accelerated rates of replacement substitutions in 814 815 the mitochondrial genome.

Another goal of our study was to resolve robustly relationships 816 817 among the assemblage of species of the South American clade, which is exceptional for its variety of plumage patterning, mor-818 819 phology, habitat preferences, and reports of cooperative breeding 820 in many species (Fraga, 2008). The diversity of the group is re-821 flected in its taxonomy—with 13 genera, eight of them monotypic. 822 its 19 species account for nearly half of all genera in Icteridae. We 823 sequenced nuclear loci from most species, but analyses of those se-824 quences resolved only four nodes with strong support. Two of 825 those inferences were almost certainly erroneous because of the 826 following: they received strong support only with Bayesian analy-827 sis of the concatenated dataset; they were not found, even with 828 weak support, in trees recovered with mitochondrial data, combined nuclear and mitochondrial data, or any species-tree analyses; and they strongly contradicted a number of stronglysupported relationships found in other analyses. The noise and misleading signal from nuclear loci was substantial enough to nullify the signal from ND2 plus cytochrome *b* sequences, yielding a tree with a unique topology and only two strongly supported nodes within the clade (Barker et al., 2013). By contrast, trees inferred from ND2 plus cytochrome *b* alone (Johnson and Lanyon, 1999; Cadena et al., 2004; Eaton, 2006) had better support and were topologically similar to our best inferences. We found that whole mitochondrial genomes were able to resolve robustly most nodes in the group, even in combination with the nuclear dataset (though its inclusion weakened support values). The only case of strongly supported agreement between those markers was the sister relationship between *Xanthopsar* and *Pseudoleistes*.

Apart from stronger support for many nodes (especially with mitochondrial data: Fig. 1), the novel findings of this study with respect to the South American clade include recovery of a Macroagelaius-Gymnomystax-Lampropsar-Hypopyrrhus clade and inclusion of two species that were absent from previous molecular studies. As expected, Macroagelaius subalaris was recovered as sister to M. imthurni. By contrast, Curaeus forbesi did not group with C. curaeus in any analyses, but rather defined its own long branch in a grade between a strongly supported C. curaeus-Amblyramphus clade and Gnorimopsar. Morphologically, C. curaeus, C. forbesi, and Gnorimopsar are similar—for example, they all have distinctively lanceolate feathers, with robust and very shiny rachides, on and near the head (but note that distantly-related Hypopyrrhus also has these traits)and forbesi has been mistaken for Gnorimopsar, both in the field (Mazzoni et al., 2012) and in collections (Short and Parkes, 1979). In a few analyses, we recovered C. forbesi as sister to Gnorimopsar with very weak support, but mitochondrial data provided strong support for the graded set of relationships described above. The taxon clearly does not belong in Curaeus, so unless a wholesale taxonomic revision of the South American clade is undertaken to lump most of the group into a single genus, it seems that naming C. forbesi to a new monotypic genus is in order; we propose renaming it as Anumara forbesi (see Appendix A).

Elsewhere within the South American endemic clade, our results concur with past studies and so taxonomic revisions made in the past decade remain appropriate, including assigning several former Agelaius species to Agelasticus and Chrysomus (Lowther et al., 2004). Taxonomies currently differ in the naming of Oreopsar, either as Oreopsar badius or, following Lowther (2001), as Agelaioides oreopsar, a usage that recognizes the sister relationship between that taxon and A. badius. That case, and the South American clade in general, presents a challenge for taxonomists who dislike placing species with distinctly different characteristics (judged according to a subjective threshold) within the same genus, but who also wish to avoid naming monotypic genera. Results of molecular phylogenetic studies have not led to reappraisals of phenotypic similarity among the South American endemic species, so unless a different standard is adopted to measure the utility of generic naming, the taxonomy of the clade does seem an appropriate reflection of its diversity.

Another case in which taxonomic revision is in order is *Dives atroviolaceus*, which we found sister to *Quiscalus-Euphagus*, not to other *Dives*. Although exact placement of *D. atroviolaceus* relative to *Euphagus* and *Quiscalus* was somewhat unstable, its closer relationship to one or both of those taxa than to *Dives* received strong support. Consequently, *D. atroviolaceus* should be restored to its former monotypic genus, *Ptiloxena*. Fraga (2011) adopted this scheme based on behavioral characteristics and following the suggestion of Webster (2003), who measured skeletal divergences among species. Ironically (because it is in some ways opposite to our finding despite leading to the same nomenclatural change),

857 858

859

860

861

862

863

864

865

866

867

868

869

870

871

872

873

874 875

876

877

878 879

880

881

882

883

884

885

886

887

888

889

890

891

892

893

894

951

952

953

954

955

956

957

958 959

960

961

962

963 964

965 966

967

968

969

970

971 972

973

974

975

976

977

978

979 980

981

982

983

984

985

986

987

988

989

990

991 992

993

994

995

996

997 998

999

1000

1001

1002

1003

1004

1005

1006

1007

1008

1009

1010

1011

1012

1013

1014

1015

1016

1017

1018

1019

1020

1021

1022

1023 1024

1025

1026

1027

1028

1029

1030

1031 1032

18

A.F.L.A. Powell et al./Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

895 Webster (2003) argued for the distinctiveness of *D. atroviolaceus*, 896 and thus its renaming, based on its morphological divergence from 897 Quiscalus, and he suggested that the revised Dives and Quiscalus 898 were morphologically similar enough that they might be merged. 899 Quiscalus warrants additional phylogeographic study and revision of species limits because several species contain deeply divergent 900 901 lineages (see Powell et al., 2008).

#### 902 5. Uncited reference

903 O4 Yang (2007).

#### Acknowledgments 904

905 We are grateful to A.J. Vandergon, who did much of the lab 906 work involved in obtaining nuclear sequences, A.H. Vázquez-Mir-907 anda, who performed some extractions, and G.D. Weiblen, who al-908 lowed use of his lab for preparing toe pad samples. We thank the 909 museums that loaned tissues for sequencing that was new to this 910 project-the Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel University; 911 American Museum of Natural History; Field Museum of Natural 912 History; Natural History Museum of Los Angeles County; Louisiana 913 State University Museum of Natural Science; Museo Argentino de 914 Ciencias Naturales, Bernardino Rivadavia; Marjorie Barrick Museum of Natural History; Museu Paraense Emílio Goeldi; Florida 915 916 Museum of Natural History; and the Burke Museum of Natural His-917 tory and Culture-as well as the many others (listed in Table 1) that 918 maintain specimens associated with GenBank sequences that we 919 used. M.B. Robbins, A. G. Navarro-Sigüenza and A. Aleixo helped by checking identities of some vouchers. We also thank J.C. Avise, 920 D. Walker, J.M. DaCosta, K.E. Omland, and F. Jacobsen for providing 921 922 samples or sequences. A. Aleixo, E.C. Dickinson, and S. Gregory pro-923 vided advice on nomenclature. S.A. Jansa made useful comments on the draft manuscript. This study was supported in part by NSF 924 925 DEB-0316092 to FKB and SML and by the University of Minnesota.

#### Appendix A 926

Anumara (new genus); Type species: Agelaeus forbesi P.L. Sclat-927 928 er; Included taxa: monotypic; Etymology: this masculine name is a 929 formalization of the local Brazilian name, anumará, for the type species (van Perlo, 2009; reported as arumará, per W.A. Forbes, 930 by Short and Parkes (1979)); Diagnosis: The genus is diagnosed 931 by characters of the type species, forbesi (see Sclater, 1886; Short 932 933 and Parkes, 1979). An icterid (Family Icteridae) with all-blackish 934 plumage, smaller than similar Curaeus curaeus and somewhat 935 smaller than *Gnorimopsar chopi* but like them in appearance with 936 respect to having lanceolate feathers, with robust and very shiny 937 rachides, on and around the head and neck region. Bill about as 938 long as head, with straight culmen, flattened on top (especially 939 above the nostrils). Mouth lining red (Jaramillo and Burke, 1999). 940 Wing short and rounded; primary projection 5-8 mm (Short and 941 Parkes, 1979). Tail graduated; outer retrices shorter than central 942 retrices by 12-18 mm (Short and Parkes, 1979). Song consists of 943 two unmusical buzzes (Jaramillo and Burke, 1999).

#### 944 **Appendix B. Supplementary material**

Supplementary data associated with this article can be found, in 945 the online version, at http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013. 946 947 11.009.

#### 948 References

949 Allen, E.S., Omland, K.E., 2003. Novel intron phylogeny supports plumage 950 convergence in orioles (Icterus). Auk 120, 961-969.

- Alström, P., Olsson, U., Lei, F., Wang, H., Gao, W., Sundberg, P., 2008. Phylogeny and classification of the Old World Emberizinae (Aves, Passeriformes). Mol. Phylogenet, Evol. 47, 960-973.
- American Ornithologists' Union, 1983. Check-list of North American Birds, sixth ed. American Ornithologists' Union, Washington, DC.
- Barker, F.K., Barrowclough, G.F., Groth, J.G., 2002. A phylogenetic hypothesis for passerine birds: taxonomic and biogeographic implications of an analysis of nuclear DNA sequence data. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. B. Biol. Sci. 269, 295-308.
- Barker, F.K., Burns, K.J., Klicka, J., Lanyon, S.M., Lovette, I.J., 2013. Going to extremes: contrasting rates of diversification in a recent radiation of New World passerine birds. Syst. Biol. 62, 298-320.
- Barker, F.K., Vandergon, A.J., Lanyon, S.M., 2008. Assessment of species limits among yellow-breasted meadowlarks (Sturnella spp.) using mitochondrial and sexlinked markers. Auk 125, 869-879.
- Beecher, W.J., 1950. Convergent evolution in the American orioles. Wilson Bull. 62, 51-86.
- Beecher, W.J., 1951. Adaptations for food-getting in the American blackbirds. Auk 68. 411-440.
- Blake, E.R., 1968. Family Icteridae: American Orioles and Blackbirds. In: Paynter, R.A., Jr. (Ed.), Check-list of Birds of the World: a Continuation of the Work of James L. Peters. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, pp. 138-202
- Björklund, M., 1991. Evolution, phylogeny, sexual dimorphism and mating system in the grackles (Quiscalus spp.: Icterinae). Evolution 45, 608-621.
- Burns, K.J., 1997. Molecular systematics of tanagers (Thraupinae): evolution and biogeography of a diverse radiation of Neotropical birds. Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 8, 334-348.
- Burns, K.J., Hackett, S.J., Klein, N.K., 2002. Phylogenetic relationships and morphological diversity in Darwin's finches and their relatives. Evolution 56, 1240-1252
- Burns, K.J., Hackett, S.J., Klein, N.K., 2003. Phylogenetic relationships of Neotropical honeycreepers and the evolution of feeding morphology. J. Avian Biol. 34, 360-370.
- Cadena, C.D., Cuervo, A.M., Lanyon, S.M., 2004. Phylogenetic relationships of the Red-bellied Grackle (Icteridae: Hypopyrrhus pyrohypogaster) inferred from mitochondrial DNA sequence data. Condor 106, 664-670.

Cardiff, S.W., Remsen Jr., J.V., 1994. Type specimens of birds in the Museum of Natural Sciences, Louisiana State University. Occas. Pap. Mus. Nat. Sci. 68, 1-33.

Darriba, D., Taboada, G.L., Doallo, R., Posada, D., 2012. JModelTest 2: more models, new heuristics and parallel computing. Nat. Methods 9, 772.

- Dugand, A., Eisenmann, E., 1983. Rediscovery of, and new data on, Molothrus armenti Cabanis. Auk 100, 991-992.
- D'Horta, F.M., Cardosa da Silva, J.M., Ribas, C.C., 2008. Species limits and hybridization zones in Icterus cayanensis-chrysocephalus group (Aves: Icteridae). Biol. J. Linnean Soc. 95, 583–597.
- Dickinson, E.C. (Ed.), 2003. The Howard and Moore Complete Checklist of the Birds of the World, Princeton University Press, Princeton, New Jersey,
- Drummond, A.J., Suchard, M.A., Xie, D., Rambaut, A., 2012. Bayesian phylogenetics with BEAUti and the BEAST 1.7. Mol. Biol. Evol. 29, 1969-1973.
- Dufort, M.J., Barker, F.K., 2013. Range dynamics, rather than convergent selection, explain the mosaic distribution of red-winged blackbird phenotypes. Ecol. Evol. doi, http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/ece3.859.
- Eaton, M.D., 2006. A phylogenetic perspective on the evolution of chromatic ultraviolet plumage coloration in grackles and allies (Icteridae). Auk 123, 211-234
- Eaton, M.D., Soberón, J., Peterson, A.T., 2008. Phylogenetic perspective on ecological niche evolution in American blackbirds (Family Icteridae). Biol. J. Linnean Soc. 94.869-878.
- Fraga, R.M., 2008. Phylogeny and behavioral evolution in the family Icteridae. Ornitol, Neotrop, 19, 61–71.
- Fraga, R.M., 2011, Family Icteridae (New World blackbirds). In: del Hoyo, I., Elliott, A., Christie, D.A. (Eds.), Handbook of the Birds of the World, Tanagers to New World Blackbirds, vol. 16. Lynx Edicions, Barcelona, pp. 684-807.
- Freeman, S., Zink, R.M., 1995. A phylogenetic study of the blackbirds based on variation in mitochondrial DNA restriction sites. Syst. Biol. 44, 409-420.
- Friedman, N.R., Hofmann, C.M., Kondo, B., Omland, K.E., 2009. Correlated evolution of migration and sexual dichromatism in the New World Orioles (Icterus). Evolution 63, 3269-3274.
- Friedman, N.R., Kiere, L.M., Omland, K.E., 2011. Convergent gains of red carotenoidbased coloration in the New World blackbirds. Auk 128, 678-687.
- Gill, F., Donsker, D. (Eds.), 2012. IOC World Bird Names (version 3.2). <a href="http://">http://</a> www.worldbirdnames.org> (accessed 08.12.12).
- Gruber, K.F., Voss, R.S., Jansa, S.A., 2007. Base-compositional heterogeneity in the RAG1 locus among Didelphid marsupials: implications for phylogenetic inference and the evolution of GC content. Syst. Biol. 56, 83-96.
- Hellmayr, C.E., 1937. Catalogue of Birds of the Americas and the Adjacent Islands. Part X. Icteridae. Field Museum of Natural History, Zoological Series 13.
- Hofmann, C.M., Cronin, T.W., Omland, K.E., 2006. Using spectral data to reconstruct evolutionary changes in coloration: carotenoid color evolution in New World orioles. Evolution 60, 1680-1691.
- Hofmann, C.M., Cronin, T.W., Omland, K.E., 2007. Melanin coloration in New World orioles II: ancestral state reconstruction reveals lability in the use of carotenoids and phaeomelanins. J. Avian Biol. 38, 172-181.

1033 Hofmann, C.M., Cronin, T.W., Omland, K.E., 2008a. Evolution of sexual 1034 1035 dichromatism. 1. Convergent losses of elaborate female coloration in New 1036 World orioles (Icterus spp). Auk 125, 778-789. Please cite this article in press as: Powell, A.F.L.A., et al. A comprehensive species-level molecular phylogeny of the New World blackbirds (Icteridae). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ympev.2013.11.009

1091

1092

1094

1095

1097

1098

1099

A.F.L.A. Powell et al. / Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

- 1037 Hofmann, C.M., Cronin, T.W., Omland, K.E., 2008b. Evolution of sexual 1038 dichromatism. Carotenoids and melanins contribute 2 to sexual 1039 dichromatism in New World orioles (Icterus spp.). Auk 125, 790-795. 1040
  - Irwin, R.E., 1994. The evolution of plumage dichromatism in the New World blackbirds: social selection on female brightness? Am. Nat. 144, 890-907.
- 1042 Jacobsen, F., Friedman, N.R., Omland, K.E., 2010. Congruence between nuclear and 1043 mitochondrial DNA: Combination of multiple nuclear introns resolves a well-1044 supported phylogeny of New World orioles (Icterus). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 56, 1045 419-427.
- 1046 Jacobsen, F., Omland, K.E., 2011. Species tree inference in a recent radiation of 1047 orioles (Genus Icterus): Multiple markers and methods reveal cytonuclear 1048 discordance in the northern oriole group. Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 61, 460-469.
- 1049 Jaramillo, A., Burke, P., 1999. New World Blackbirds: the Icterids. Princeton 1050 University Press, Princeton, NJ.
- 1051 Johnson, K.P., Lanyon, S.M., 1999. Molecular systematics of the grackles and allies, 1052 and the effect of additional sequence (cytochrome b and ND2). Auk 116, 759-1053 768
- 1054 Johnson, K.P., Lanyon, S.M., 2000. Evolutionary changes in color patches of 1055 blackbirds are associated with marsh nesting. Behav. Ecol. 11, 515-519.
- 1056 Klein, N.K., Burns, K.J., Hackett, S.J., Griffiths, C.S., 2004. Molecular phylogenetic 1057 relationships among the wood warblers (Parulidae) and historical biogeography 1058 in the Caribbean Basin. J. Caribbean Ornithol. 17, 3-17.
- 1059 Klicka, J., Johnson, K.P., Lanyon, S.M., 2000. New World nine-primaried oscine 1060 relationships: constructing a mitochondrial DNA framework. Auk 117, 321-1061
- 1062 Klicka, J., Burns, K., Spellman, G.M., 2007. Defining a monophyletic Cardinalini: a 1063 molecular perspective. Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 45, 1014-1032.
- 1064 Kondo, B., Omland, K.E., 2007. Ancestral state reconstruction of migration: 1065 multistate analysis reveals rapid changes in New World orioles (Icterus spp.). 1066 Auk 124, 410-419.
- 1067 Lanfear, R., Calcott, B., Ho, S.Y.W., Guindon, S., 2012. PartitionFinder: combined 1068 selection of partitioning schemes and substitution models for phylogenetic 1069 analyses. Mol. Biol. Evol. 29, 1695-1701.
- 1070 Lanyon, S.M., 1992. Interspecific brood parasitism in blackbirds (Icterinae): a 1071 phylogenetic perspective. Science 255, 77-79.
- 1072 Lanyon, S.M., 1994. Polyphyly of the blackbird genus Agelaius and the importance of assumptions of monophyly in comparative studies. Evolution 48, 679–693. Lanyon, S.M., Omland, K.E., 1999. A molecular phylogeny of the blackbirds 1073
- 1074 1075 (Icteridae): five lineages revealed by cytochrome-b sequence data. Auk 116, 1076 629-639.
- 1077 Lovette, I.J., Bermingham, E., 2002. What is a wood-warbler? Molecular 1078 characterization of a monophyletic parulidae. Auk 119, 695-714.
- 1079 Lovette, I.J., Bermingham, E., Ricklefs, R.E., 2001. Mitochondrial DNA 1080 phylogeography and the conservation of endangered Lesser Antillean Icterus 1081 orioles. Conserv. Biol. 13, 1088-1096.
- 1082 Lovette, I.J., Pérez-Emán, J.L., Sullivan, J.P., Banks, R.C., Fiorentino, I., Córdoba-1083 Córdoba, S., Echeverry-Galvis, M., Barker, F.K., Burns, K.J., Klicka, J., Lanyon, S.M., 1084 Bermingham, E., 2010, A comprehensive multilocus phylogeny for the wood-1085 warblers and a revised classification of the Parulidae (Aves). Mol. Phylogenet. 1086 Evol. 57, 753-770.
- 1087 Lowther, P.E., 2001, New name for the Bolivian Blackbird, Bull, Brit, Ornithol, Club 1088 121.280-281.
- 1089 Lowther, P.E., Fraga, R., Schulenberg, T.S., Lanyon, S.M., 2004. Nomenclatural 1090 solution for a polyphyletic Agelaius. Bull. Brit. Ornithol. Club 124, 171-175.
  - Marshall, D.C., 2010. Cryptic failure of partitioned Bayesian phylogenetic analyses: lost in the land of long trees. Syst. Biol. 59, 108-117.
- 1093 Mazzoni, L.G., Esser, D., de Carvalho Dutra, E., Perillo, A., Morais, R., 2012. New records of the Forbes's Blackbird Curaeus forbesi (Sclater, 1886) in the state of Minas Gerais, with comments on its conservation, Rev. Brasil, Ornitol, 20, 44-1096 47.
- Miller, M.A., Pfeiffer, W., Schwartz, T., 2010. Creating the CIPRES Science Gateway for inference of large phylogenetic trees. In: Proc. Gateway Computing Environments Workshop (GCE 2010), 14 November 2010, New Orleans, 1100 Louisiana. Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, pp. 1-8.
- 1101 Omland, K.E., Lanyon, S.M., 2000. Reconstructing plumage evolution in orioles 1102 (Icterus): repeated convergence and reversal in patterns. Evolution 54, 2119-1103 2133
- 1104 Omland, K.E., Lanyon, S.M., Fritz, S.J., 1999. A molecular phylogeny of the New 1105 World orioles (Icterus): the importance of dense taxon sampling. Mol. 1106 Phylogenet. Evol. 12, 224-239.
- 1107 Orians, G.H., 1985. Blackbirds of the Americas. University of Washington Press, 1108 Seattle.
- 1109 Parker III, T.A., Remsen Jr., J.V., 1987. Fifty-two Amazonian bird species new to 1110 Bolivia. Bull. Brit. Ornithol. Club 107, 94-107.
- 1111 Powell, A.F.L.A., 2012. Molecular Phylogenetics of the New World Blackbirds 1112 (Icteridae). Ph.D. dissertation, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis and St. 1113 Paul
- 1114 Powell, A.F.L.A., Barker, F.K., Lanyon, S.M., 2008. A complete species-level phylogeny 1115 of the grackles (Quiscalus spp.), including the extinct Slender-billed Grackle, 1116 inferred from mitochondrial DNA. Condor 110, 718-728.
- 1117 Powell, A.F.L.A., Barker, F.K., Lanyon, S.M., 2013. Empirical evaluation of partitioning 1118 schemes for phylogenetic analyses of mitogenomic data: an avian case study. 1119 Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 66, 69-79.
- 1120 Price, J.J., 2009. Evolution and life-history correlates of female song in the New 1121 World blackbirds. Behav. Ecol. 20, 967-977.

- Price, J.J., Friedman, N.R., Omland, K.E., 2007. Song and plumage evolution in the New World Orioles (Icterus) show similar lability and convergence in patterns. Evolution 61, 850-863.
- Price, J.J., Lanyon, S.M., 2002a. A robust phylogeny of the oropendolas: polyphyly revealed by mitochondrial sequence data. Auk 119, 335-348.
- Price, J.J., Lanyon, S.M., 2002b. Reconstructing the evolution of complex bird song in the oropendolas. Evolution 56, 1514-1529.
- Price, J.J., Lanyon, S.M., 2004a. Patterns of song evolution and sexual selection in the oropendolas and caciques. Behav. Ecol. 15, 485-497.
- Price, J.J., Lanyon, S.M., 2004b. Song and molecular data identify congruent but novel affinities of the Green Oropendola (Psarocolius viridis). Auk 121, 224-229.
- Price, J.J., Lanyon, S.M., Omland, K.E., 2009. Losses of female song with changes from tropical to temperate breeding in the New World blackbirds. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. B. Biol. Sci. 276, 1971-1980.
- Price, J.J., Whalen, L.M., 2009. Plumage evolution in the oropendolas and caciques: different divergence rates in polygynous and monogamous taxa. Evolution 63, 2985-2998
- Raikow, R.J., 1978. Appendicular myology and relationships of the New World nineprimaried oscines (Aves: Passeriformes). Bull. Carnegie Mus. Nat. Hist. 7, 1-43.
- Rambaut, A., Drummond, A.J., 2009. Tracer v1.5. <http://tree.bio.ed.ac.uk/software/ tracer>
- Remsen Jr., J.V., Cadena, C.D., Jaramillo, A., Nores, M., Pacheco, J.F., Pérez-Emán, J.F., Robbins, M.B., Stiles, F.G., Stotz, D.F., Zimmer, K.J., Version 7 December 2012. A Classification of the Bird Species of South America. American Ornithologists' Union. <http://www.museum.lsu.edu/~Remsen/SACCBaseline.html>
- Ridgway, R., 1902. The birds of North and Middle America. Part II. Bull. U.S. National Mus, No. 50.
- Ronquist, F., Teslenko, M., van der Mark, P., Ayres, D.L., Darling, A., Höhna, S., Larget, B., Liu, L., Suchard, M.A., Huelsenbeck, J.P., 2012. MrBayes 3.2: efficient Bayesian phylogenetic inference and model choice across a large model space. Syst. Biol. 61. 539-542.
- Schwarz, G., 1978. Estimating the dimension of a model. Ann. Stat. 6, 461–464.
- Sclater, P.L., 1886. Catalogue of the Birds in the British Museum. Coerebidae, Tanagridae, and Icteridae, vol. 11. British Museum, London.
- Searcy, W.A., Yasukawa, K., Lanyon, S.M., 1999. Evolution of polygyny in the ancestors of Red-Winged Blackbirds. Auk 116, 5-19.
- Shawkey, M.D., Hauber, M.E., Estep, L.K., Hill, G.E., 2006. Evolutionary transitions and mechanisms of matte and iridescent plumage coloration in grackles and allies (Icteridae). J. R. Soc. Interface 3, 777-786.
- Short Jr., L.L., 1968. Sympatry of red-breasted meadowlarks in Argentina, and the taxonomy of meadowlarks (Aves: Leistes, Pezites, and Sturnella). Am. Mus. Novitates 2349, 30.

Short, L.L., Parkes, K.C., 1979. The status of Agelaius forbesi Sclater. Auk 96, 179–183.

- Sibley, C.G., Monroe Jr., B.L., 1990. Distribution and Taxonomy of Birds of the World. Yale University Press, New Haven, CT.
- Sturge, R.J., Jacobsen, F., Rosensteel, B.B., Neale, R.J., Omland, K.E., 2009. Colonization of South America from Caribbean islands confirmed by molecular phylogeny with increased taxon sampling. Condor 111, 575-579.
- Swofford, D.L., 2002. PAUP\*. Phylogenetic Analysis Using Parsimony (\*and Other Methods). Version 4. Sinauer, Sunderland, Massachusetts.
- Thomson, R.C., Shaffer, H.B., 2010. Sparse supermatrices for phylogenetic inference: taxonomy, alignment, rogue taxa, and the phylogeny of living turtles. Syst. Biol. 59. 42-58.
- Tordoff, H.B., 1954. Relationships in the New World nine-primaried oscines. Auk 71, 273-284.
- van Perlo, B., 2009. A Field Guide to the Birds of Brazil. Oxford University Press, New York.
- Webster, M.S., 1992. Sexual dimorphism, mating system and body size in New World Blackbirds Evolution 46 1621–1641
- Webster, J.D., 2003. Skeletal characters and the genera of blackbirds (Icteridae). Condor 105, 239-257.
- Wiens, J.J., 2005. Can incomplete taxa rescue phylogenetic analyses from longbranch attraction? Syst. Biol. 54, 731-742.
- Wiens, J.J., 2006. Missing data and the design of phylogenetic analyses. J. Biomed. Inform, 39, 34-42.
- Wiens, J.J., Fetzner, J.W., Parkinson, C.L., Reeder, T.W., 2005. Hylid frog phylogeny and sampling strategies for speciose clades. Syst. Biol. 54, 719-748.
- Wiens, J.J., Moen, D.S., 2008. Missing data and the accuracy of Bayesian phylogenetics. J. Syst. Evol. 46, 307-314.
- Wiens, J.J., Morrill, M.C., 2011. Missing data in phylogenetic analysis: reconciling results from simulations and empirical data. Syst. Biol. 60, 719-731.
- Wiens, J.J., Tiu, J., 2012. Highly incomplete taxa can rescue phylogenetic analyses from the negative impacts of limited taxon sampling. PLoS ONE 7 (8), e42925.
- Wilgenbusch, J.C., Warren, D.L., Swofford, D.L., 2004. AWTY: A System for Graphical Exploration of MCMC Convergence in Bayesian Phylogenetic Inference. < http:// ceb.csit.fsu.edu/awty>
- Yang, Z., 2007. PAML 4: Phylogenetic analysis by maximum likelihood. Mol. Biol. Evol. 24, 1586-1591.
- Yuri, T., Mindell, D.P., 2002. Molecular phylogenetic analysis of Fringillidae, "New World nine-primaried oscines" (Aves: Passeriformes). Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 23, 229-243.
- Zwickl, D.J., 2006. Genetic Algorithm Approaches for the Phylogenetic Analysis of Large Biological Sequence Datasets Under the Maximum Likelihood Criterion. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Texas at Austin.

1122

1123

1124

1125

1126

1127

1128

1129

1130

1131

1132

1133

1134

1135

1136

1137

1138

1139

1140

1141

1142

1143

1144

1145

1146

1147

1148

1149

1150

1151

1152

1153

1154

1155

1156

1157

1158

1159

1160

1161

1162

1163

1164

1165

1166

1167

1168

1169

1170

1171

1172

1173

1174

1175

1176

1177

1178

1179 1180

1181

1182

1183

1184

1185

1186

1187

1188

1189

1190

1191

1192

1193

1194

1195

1196

1197

1198

1199

1200

1201

1202

1203

1204

1205