JRAI Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute

Book and film reviews

Anthropology and history: African case studies

JOHNSON, DOUGLAS H. *Empire and the Nuer: sources on the pacification of the Southern Sudan, 1898-1930*. xxxviii, 320 pp., maps, tables, bibliogr. Oxford: Univ. Press, 2016. £70.00 (cloth)

Douglas Johnson's *Empire and the Nuer* is a fascinating collection of primary documents covering the period of the British conquest of Southern Sudan, accompanied by his expert contextualization and commentary. Focusing on the pacification of the Nuer – the last pacification campaign in Africa – the book aims to achieve several disparate, though not contradictory, goals. First, since this violent history shaped the political processes that followed in Southern Sudan, the collection promises to provide insights into political and military conflict up until the present. The focus on figures from the British side of the encounter aims to fashion an 'anthropology of administration'. Finally, because the Nuer are arguably anthropology's most famous case study, the collection is useful both in problematizing received views of the Nuer and in providing insights into the conditions through which Evans-Pritchard produced his classic works.

The book is organized principally around twenty-four primary administrative documents spanning the period 1898-1930. In line with the collection's aims and because documents on other topics have been published elsewhere, the focus is on the process of pacification. Five interviews conducted by Johnson between 1975 and 1981 with Nuer and Dinka who witnessed events constitute a mini-counter-archive, providing significantly different details, and certainly very dissimilar interpretations, than are to be found in administrators' accounts. An abstract of Evans-Pritchards' 1938 lecture on the problem of administration in Southern Sudan forms the book's epilogue.

Empire and the Nuer should be of interest to a variety of audiences. The documents likely are of greatest interest to historians of Sudan, though such specialists are likely to pursue a wider range of materials in the archives themselves. While specialists may seek more, however, there may be too much for non-specialists. Although I enjoyed the collection – particularly as supplemented by Johnson's expert curation and engaging commentary – this type of book does not beg to be read cover to cover, even if the history contained therein can be best appreciated in that way. Moreover, while a collection is fairly common in history, I find modest irony in the notion of a curated set of original documents: the process of curation naturally undermines their originality/representativeness. As in a highlights reel, a message is produced through the way that documents are selected and compiled. While Johnson's expertise makes him uniquely suited for this task, such curation is nonetheless somewhat antithetical to the special charm and value of archival research. Rich colonial archival materials are semi-logical hodgepodges composed more of mundane, everyday affairs than grand projects, and of documents originally produced for many different audiences and purposes. An organizational theme to lend justice to such messiness might look more like Borges's apocryphal *Celestial emporium of benevolent knowledge* in his essay 'The analytical language of John Wilkins' (1942; in *Other inquisitions, 1937-1952*, trans. R.L.C. Simms, 1964) than a

master narrative of conquest, even if those two themes are inseparable.

The collection certainly has value for anthropology courses in particular, not least of all because the Nuer are so well known. The collection provides ample opportunity to engage with the context of Evans-Pritchard's work, while also considering how differently positioned authors' points of view (e.g. E.P. versus colonial administrators) varyingly inflected quite similar material. Johnson also suggests audiences beyond the academy for whom these documents might hold special interest. Many of the documents are currently hard to find and sought by interested citizens in Southern Sudan. Johnson also suggests, perhaps a bit too hopefully, that foreign NGOs and aid workers might benefit from seeing the similarities between their ongoing stereotyping and those of colonial administrators a hundred years previously. I agree that increasing access to a wide audience, including Southern Sudanese, is a worthy endeavour, though the ambiguities in the documents themselves seem more likely to lend themselves to possible crypto-religious justifications of someone's interests rather than inspiring honest debate and understanding.

One thing the documents do strikingly well is provide affirmation of how many images of the Nuer, which have formed commonplace understandings in anthropology and elsewhere, were either products of the colonial process or stereotypes that arose within it, such as their 'difficult nature' (summarized in Evans-Pritchard's *bon mot* 'Nuerosis'); or their characterization as 'the fighting Nuer'; and the emphasis on their endless hostility with the Dinka (while the documents paint a picture of more fluid ethnic relations). For this, as well as Johnson's cogent framing and commentary, this book fully warrants the attention of many: whether more selectively by students and scholars of anthropology, who will certainly be interested in the context this provides to perhaps our most seminal case study, or more comprehensively by specialists in the region.

Jon D. Holtzman *Western Michigan University*

Knörr, Jacqueline & Christoph Kohl (eds). *The Upper Guinea coast in global perspective*. ix, 326 pp., maps, figs, illus., bibliogrs. London, New York: Berghahn Books, 2016. £78.00 (cloth)

The Upper Guinea coast in global perspective draws on insights from a number of disciplines, not only social anthropology, but also history, art history, and political science. Rather than focusing on the analysis of particular nations that has characterized African studies in the postcolonial era, this collection uses a variety of approaches to study the linkages between various groups and social forces that move across international boundaries. Most chapters reflect concerns with Upper Guinea's independent nation-states, but some of the works trace transnational phenomena back to the era of the Atlantic slave trade.

Jacqueline Knörr and Christoph Kohl's introduction begins with a definition of the region – building on Rodney's *A history of the Upper Guinea Coast* (1970) – which stretches along the Atlantic coast from the Gambia to the Côte d'Ivoire/Liberian borderlands. They provide an overview of the region's history and an extensive bibliography, as well as summaries of the essays in the volume. A more theoretical discussion of the issues raised by 'global perspectives' and transnational analysis, as well as of the insights such approaches could provide, would have made useful additions.

The first of four sections focuses on 'Creole connections'. Mouser (chap. 1) interrogates the idea of transnationalism through a micro-study of two coastal Guinean families, founded by British slave traders who married into Guinean trading families, and analyses the ways in which strangers integrated themselves, developed Creole identities, and eventually forged quite fluid trans-Atlantic family ties and senses of place. Kohl's (chap. 2) comparative study of Luso-Creole communities in Guinea-Bissau and Sri Lanka is a challenging one to develop in the short confines of a single chapter. King (chap. 3) examines the Creole community of Freetown, Sierra Leone, and concentrates on a new, more open, secret society in the wake of rural Sierra Leonians migration to the cities, but oddly enough never mentions the important Sierra Leonian secret societies of Poro and Sande.

The second section, 'Diasporic entanglements', examines issues related to immigration and the relationship of migration to a sense of national identity. Schroven (chap. 4) analyses the changing roles of Guinean diasporas in national political life. Rudolf (chap. 5) provides an insightful analysis of the ways in which national identities remain fluid for Diola immigrants to the Gambia who maintain ties to their home communities in the Casamance. Marcelino (chap. 6) offers an interesting essay on West African immigrants to the Cape Verde Islands, long a source of immigrants for the northeastern United States and Portugal. Finally, Drotbohm (chap. 7) studies the ritual celebrations that link Cape Verdean diasporas with their home communities.

The third section, 'Travelling models', offers transnational perspectives on a wide range of issues. Trajano Filho (chap. 8) analyses the origins and transformations of the word *tabanka*, as it moves from West Atlantic languages of Upper Guinea, into various Portuguese Crioulos spoken locally or in the Cape Verde Islands, and finally to Trinidadian English and other forms of Caribbean Creole, as a result of the Atlantic slave trade. In the process, its meaning changes from that of a mere household/settlement to a fortified community, to a form of mental illness. Davidson (chap. 9) presents a rich portrait of the role of 'sacred rice' in Senegal's and Guinea-Bissau's Diola communities, and how that affects their interaction with transnational rice development programmes. Murphy (chap. 10) discusses the problems of reintegration of women and children in post-conflict societies, focusing on Sierra Leone. Spencer (chap. 11) documents the efforts to protect freedom of expression in post-conflict Sierra Leone. Shepler (chap. 12) examines the problem of reintegrating child soldiers in Sierra Leone, focusing on questions of who has expertise and authority to guide such programmes.

The final section, 'Interregional integration', offers three case studies about transnational activities. The late Christian Højbjerg (chap. 13) offers readers a fascinating study comparing the ways that Mandingo minorities experience ethnic conflict in Guinean and Liberian border towns, tracing the importance of local histories in determining the nature of contemporary conflict. Bellagamba (chap. 14) describes a Gambian diamond dealer and his changing relationships with his home country and diamond-producing areas. Finally, Mark and da Silva Horta (chap. 15) offer an important comparative study of the impact of the seventeenth-century trade in blade weapons, especially in Guinea-Bissau and Senegal, and the nineteenth-century firearms trade.

Robert M. Baum *Dartmouth College*

Ralph, Michael. *Forensics of capital*. 189 pp., fig., bibliogr. Chicago: Univ. Press, 2015. £19.00 (paper)

In *Forensics of capital*, Michael Ralph develops a boldly original historical anthropology of liability, citizenship, and sovereignty in Senegal that begins with Afro-European contact in the fifteenth century (with earlier gestures to medieval Europe) and ends in the ethnographic present. He builds on William Pietz's idea of a 'forensics of capital' ('Material considerations', *Theory, Culture & Society* **19: 5-6**, 2002), referring to the juridical, normative, and epistemological protocols deployed in monetizing risk and debt (one of the 'metaphysical subtleties' of commodity fetishism that warrants deeper demystification). Ralph locates the evaluation of capital assets, human lives, and sovereign bodies within the developing infrastructure of modern capitalism, arguing that such an assemblage was crucial in linking Atlantic slavery to modern citizenship and sovereignty, and in establishing diplomatic standing between nation-states.

Ralph's book offers a highly ambitious rethinking of colonial African history and its postcolonial legacies, relating early Afro-European trade to the rise of military mercantilism on both sides of the 'partnership', one which he explores through 'fetish' contracts, interracial marriages, as well as developments in European banking and monetary theory. He further relates governmental techniques of assessing risk and security to colonial and postcolonial forms of citizenship and sovereignty. Just as the enhanced standing of Senegalese soldiers who fought for the French in the Second World War recovered earlier ritual economies of sacrifice and blood debt, so the Dakar headquarters of AFRICOM re-creates a typology of nations through prior frameworks of assessing freedom and security.

Ralph is clearly onto something important, and his insights will rattle, if not transform, conventional takes on the African postcolony. Each of his six substantive chapters provides a spatiotemporal permutation of the forensic paradigm developed in chapter 1, which is grounded in early modern 'fetish' rituals authorizing trade between Portuguese and Wolof merchants in the Senegal River valley and the central points of access that would become the coastal island enclaves of Gorée and St Louis. In a significant methodological reversal, Ralph accords these rituals *primary* status as the consecrating frameworks of Afro-European diplomacy and commerce. Rather than start with 'rational' profit-maximizing actors, he asks 'what if we begin our analysis of politics from the specific rituals that people use to authorize trade and to solidify binding diplomatic agreements?' (p. 14), arguing that such ad hoc ritual arrangements set the historical stage for the sovereign exchanges that followed over the next four centuries. In chapter 2, Ralph focuses on railways and telegraphs, showing how French considerations of risk on capital investments in the nineteenth century reshaped political relationships between Wolof kingdoms along the new communication routes and lines. Chapter 3 highlights the impact of Senegal's signature groundnut economy on

local social hierarchies and religious sodalities in the twentieth century as peasant households surpassed elite plantations in agricultural productivity; and the Murid Sufi brotherhood came to embody a rational (and taxable) infrastructure for organizing production. The final three chapters jump to the twenty-first century, focusing on the negotiation of Senegal's diplomatic standing after 9/11 as a 'peaceful democracy' (chap. 5); George W. Bush's re-securitization of Gorée during his two-hour visit on 8 July 2003, when his Senegalese audience was virtually 're-enslaved' in the island's football (soccer) stadium (chap. 6); and the non-economic production of social capital as unemployed youth, pathologized by the nation, spend hours perfecting their tea-making skills in the refined *attaya* ceremonies of a social demographic whose 'work without labor' (p. 130) lacks commercial value.

What exactly do these forensic snapshots reveal, and how are the chapters historically linked? Ralph identifies implicit connections between historic protocols of establishing credit-worthiness and political standing that are sometimes difficult to grasp because they elude conventional narratives and causal pathways. However, as he clearly demonstrates, they remain important today, undermining democratic accountability within nations like Senegal, which remain subject to World Bank and IMF conditionalities, and the beneficence of donor agencies. In the book's final paragraph, Ralph concludes: 'If a single theoretical lesson can be distilled from *Forensics of capital*, it is that any meaningful method for establishing the profile of a nation is both incomplete and contingent' (p. 141). Perhaps, but in getting there Ralph also *rethinks* the Atlantic parameters of modern capitalism and political economy – in suggestive and at times astonishing ways.

Andrew Apter *University of California, Los Angeles*

Werbner, Richard. *Divination's grasp: African encounters with the almost said*. xii, 340 pp., illus., bibliogr. Bloomington: Indiana Univ. Press, 2015. £29.99 (paper)

Divination's grasp was written over a long period, following repeated requests to Richard Werbner from Isaac Schapera (d. 2003). Here, finally, is the monograph on divination: the result of over forty years of deep and impassioned involvement in the lives and religions of people living around Moremi, Botswana. Werbner wants readers to appreciate the poetic and moral imagination through which Tswapong diviners explain the lives of their clients. Moreover, he sees the diviners as conducting a poetic form of anthropological analysis.

As a fellow student of divination, I found much to appreciate, but was puzzled and frustrated by several passages which perhaps Tswana-speakers or experts in Southern Africa would understand. This obscurity restricts the book's usefulness. The opening chapters omit any explanation of the phrase 'praise poetry', an important omission when in later chapters verses are repeatedly referred to as 'praises'. The substantial discussion (pp. 59-60, 72ff.) could have been flagged earlier. Problems that could lead to conceptual confusion are present throughout: examples include 'a baboon mixture in fat' and 'a brand struck by lightning' (p. 148). The latter might mean 'a brand/torch made from a branch of a tree that has been struck by lightning'. Such a lack of clarity here and elsewhere impedes an assessment of the book's wider argument.

In the main, Werbner is critical about witchcraft analyses that see it as a response to, or commentary upon, modernity; rather, *Divination's grasp* makes an intriguing distinction between 'moral peril' and what he terms 'witchcraft-as-normal' (pp. 120-1). In this account of Tswapong divination, witchcraft is talked over or around during divinatory séances so that it becomes a muted – thus a less important – topic. This makes an ironic contrast with Evans-Pritchard's work on the Zande (which Werbner discusses in chap. 1), in which witchcraft is revealed through divination.

Nevertheless, Werbner is to be applauded for presenting detailed case studies of divination, which are certainly lacking in the wider literature. However, the cases described here occurred in the 1970s, and since Werbner has continued to work in Botswana it is surprising that he adds little about what happened to the surviving parties in the following years, or how hindsight may have changed their views of what the divination sessions revealed. This omission is highlighted by chapter 8's presentation of retrospective views of a séance. What is more, Werbner claims that he is concerned with the interpretative process (especially thinking about moral peril) and not with the politics of divination, power, and confrontation. However, the cases of disquiet and family dispute he describes as delved into by the diviner Moatlhodi are as micro-political as they are micro-poetical. That the diviner was not the mediator and the events were not framed as being about politics does not mean that something political was not taking place. To

paraphrase the old slogan: 'the interpretation is political'.

The author's research is complemented and enriched by extracts from an archive of Schapera's fieldnotes, which Werbner holds. Throughout the book, references to these appear simply as 'Schapera MSS'. The lack of notebook and page numbers will make it difficult to locate the material quoted. For example, one might wish to check the source of the following quotation (p. 98) from the Schapera notes, which ends bafflingly: 'Suppose two men sent by the chief to walk about go about like detectives in different parts and hear axes'. As elsewhere in the book, the writing is elliptical, thus it is unclear whether the ambiguity is Werbner's or that of Schapera's informant Natale. Perhaps it should read: 'Suppose two men are sent by the chief to walk about and go about like detectives in different parts and hear *cases*'?

The other archival source is a corpus of sixteen praise poems associated with four divination tablets (classed as senior or junior, and male or female) and the different permutations possible when they are thrown. The book records tablet-sex inconsistently sometimes as m/f, sometimes as m/w. Additional extracts are quoted throughout, sometimes with lines of Tswana, but with no indication of the originals' extent. An appendix containing the entire corpus (perhaps on-line) would have revealed how much else remains to be examined. Werbner calls for such an archive (p. 115) to parallel Bascom's publication of Ifa verses, but it does not yet exist, so although the stanzas may be complete, the poems may not be (we are not told). Chapter 7 provides a more methodical list of verses for a variant type: hooved divination. This underlines the absence of a systematic listing for the other main types of tablet divination.

A great scholar like Werbner knows his subject intimately and deserves a second edition of this book, one that gives him the opportunity to expand on and clear up some of its unintended vagueness, thus making it more approachable for non-specialist scholars.

David Zeitlyn *University of Oxford*

Biographical insights

Elden, Stuart. *Foucault's last decade*. xiv, 247 pp., bibliogr. Cambridge: Polity, 2016. £16.99 (paper)

In his lecture of 31 January 1979 at the Collège de France, Michel Foucault warned his audience that, once again, there would be a change to the planned lecture and added: 'As you know, I am like the crawfish and advance sideways' (*The birth of biopolitics: lectures at the Collège de France, 1978-79*, 2008: 78). This sentence dates from the period that Stuart Elden rigorously scrutinizes in his elegantly written book *Foucault's last decade*, and it also points to a general problem faced by every attempt at writing an intellectual biography of the French philosopher and historian: the connections between all of Foucault's major writings are not straightforward and simple; there are multiple changes of direction to consider.

This holds especially true for the period between August 1974, when Foucault completed work on *Discipline and punish*, and his early death on 25 June 1984. As Elden notes in chapter 3, in this decade, Foucault mainly worked on *The history of sexuality*, a multi-volume project with an ever-changing shape, and, in conjunction with it, he also tackled the problems of governmentality (chap. 4), truth-speaking (chaps 5 and 8), and the technologies of the self (chap. 6). Instead of writing the genealogy of the modern '*dispositif* of sexuality' in *The history of sexuality* – which was to begin, as outlined in the first volume of 1976, with the Christian notion of the 'flesh' (vol. II) and from there advance to problematizing the 'masturbating child' (vol. III), then the 'hysterical woman' (vol. IV), and the 'pervert' (vol. V), until finally reaching the complex of 'population and race' (vol. VI) – Foucault delivered, in 1984, two books on *The use of pleasure* (*L'usage des plaisirs*) and *The care of the self* (*Le souci de soi*).

More irritating than the historical shift was the new conceptual framing of these studies: it seemed that Foucault had become more interested in how the self relates to itself, including categories of reflection and techniques of self-conduct, than in the *dispositifs* of knowledge and power that he famously had analysed in *Discipline and punish*. Elden, who has now published a second book on the six years before *Discipline and punish* entitled *Foucault: the birth of power* (2017) (see also chaps 1 and 2), wants to show that this change of plan should not be strongly interpreted as a crisis and discontinuity in Foucault's thinking, but rather as the outcome of a thorough research process that moved forward through numerous readjustments and self-corrections.

In eight chapters that draw on a wide range of material, published and unpublished, Elden reconstructs the movements in Foucault's thinking and writing – movements that, in a certain sense, fill in the gaps between his major book publications from that time. The newly

available lecture courses that Foucault held between 1971 and 1984 at the Collège de France play a crucial role, but interviews, articles, and lectures at other universities also offer important insights and information. Such a thorough reconstruction of Foucault's later writings is highly illuminating and, to a certain extent, necessary to understand what is going on and what is at stake precisely because the original plan was not carried out (chap. 7). Thus, rather than writing a genealogy of the *dispositif* of sexuality, Foucault rethought the history of sexuality in terms of a transformation of self-relations, meaning not a simple replacement, but a complex reworking of the ways subjectivity is construed. Despite all the differences between Greek '*aphrodisia*' and Christian 'flesh', Foucault later realized that a 'transformation of principles makes much more sense than the idea of a substitution of codes' (p. 148).

Elden's study additionally demonstrates how genealogy as a method works. In writing a genealogy of the *dispositif* of sexuality, Foucault dealt with Christian pastoral care and the problem of confession. As he soon noticed, Christian pastoral care is not only an element in the history of sexuality; it can also be viewed as a chapter in the genealogy of state power (chap. 4). At the same time, the problem of confession is linked to the history of truth-telling, which Foucault eventually traced back to the ancient Greek practice of *parrhesia* (chap. 8). Every historical event, every social phenomenon, contains a variety of aspects from which divergent trajectories can depart. It is to Elden's credit that he meticulously demonstrates the ways in which the genealogist Foucault 'advanced sideways'. His book, therefore, is highly recommended for anyone interested in Foucault's last decade.

Matthias Leanza *University of Basel*

Jensen, Joan M. & Michelle Wick Patterson (eds). *Travels with Frances Densmore: her life, work, and legacy in Native American studies*. xi, 448 pp., illus., bibliogrs. Lincoln: Univ. of Nebraska Press, 2015. £52.00 (cloth)

In this comprehensive book, historians Joan M. Jensen and Michelle Wick Patterson take a bold step in unpacking the enigmatic figure of Frances Densmore and her extensive collection documenting Native American life in the early to mid-twentieth century. Despite the many publications that have drawn on Densmore's collection, Jensen and Patterson are the first to compile a book focusing on Densmore the ethnographer. The authors form a formidable duo for this undertaking; both have published significant works on women in early twentieth-century North America, including a 2010 book by Patterson on the ethnomusicologist Natalie Curtis Burlin (*Natalie Curtis Burlin: a life in Native and African American music*). Their expertise is evident throughout the book as they provide critical context for Densmore's many photographs, recordings, notes, and letters. The beautifully crafted narration of Densmore's life retains clarity while providing detailed analyses of the complexities of her persona and work. The book offers a seamless interplay between themes of institutional authority, gender, and the cultural encounters of institutions, researchers, and Indigenous peoples experiencing settler colonialism. Together, Jensen and Patterson paint a vivid snapshot of the short but significant moment of rapid change captured in Densmore's work.

The opening of the book begins with an excellent introduction that presents the various lenses through which Densmore can be analysed, including those of a new woman, ethnologist, and traveller. The six chapters that comprise the first part of the book create a narrative arc that spans Densmore's career and legacy. The first chapter explores her earliest years as a self-trained anthropologist, highlighting how she carved a space for herself in the male-dominated field of American anthropology. In chapter 2, Patterson masterfully provides insight into Densmore's fraught relationships with her Indigenous informants. The chapter underscores Indigenous agency within Densmore's work, while simultaneously calling attention to her exploitative field methods, such as making recordings without her interlocutors' permission. This chapter forms a valuable contribution to the analysis of American anthropology's history, as well as to ethics in audiovisual archives, and questions of ownership of intangible cultural heritage; it would make an excellent addition to syllabi in anthropology, ethnomusicology, and Indigenous studies.

The four chapters that follow provide critical insight into the roles of institutions, funding, and Densmore's eccentricities in shaping the collection and her legacy. In chapter 3, Jensen traces Densmore's travels between 1920 and 1940. The chapter raises thoughtful questions about her ethnographic methods and provides insight into rapid cultural changes, such as the expansion of tourism and exhibition singing. Chapter 4 offers an intriguing perspective on the impact of the Great Depression on Densmore's

work. Jensen's analysis of Densmore's correspondence with the Bureau of American Ethnology and her supporters reveals how the intertwined forces of gender and funding shaped her collection. In chapter 5, Patterson provides an overview of Densmore's attempts to secure her legacy and work in the archives, including her insistence in overseeing the duplication and preservation of her recordings. To close the first half of the book, chapter 6 addresses the afterlife of the collection, noting the evolution of criticisms over the fifty years since her passing.

The second part of the book provides a selection of reprinted shorter works on Densmore and her collection that are prefaced with introductions that position them as conversations with the first part of the volume. Among those that I found to more successfully achieve the goal of developing a conversation was a reprint of Judith Gray's article on Densmore's cylinder collection from the *Folklife Center News* (2001), which ties in nicely with Patterson's chapter examining Densmore's efforts to curate her archival legacy. Scholars working with Densmore's collection will find that these reprints serve as a practical resource; however, I found myself wishing that the authors had discovered ways to more deeply engage with the texts they were reprinting so as to further the stated conversational goal.

Overall, scholars in Indigenous studies, anthropology, and ethnomusicology will find this book a practical resource for locating and interpreting Densmore's collection. In particular, future researchers will find that the 'Notes on sources' epilogue serves as a useful starting-point for locating the physical materials that are distributed across the United States. The authors explicitly state in their introduction that they do not attempt to speak for Indigenous American communities in their work; instead, the book beckons counter-narratives, particularly from the perspective of Indigenous studies, and provides a basis for reconsidering Indigenous agency in the authoring of Densmore's collection. As underscored by Jensen and Patterson in their conclusion, Densmore's afterlife is still unfolding.

Kristina Nielsen *Southern Methodist University*

Citizens, sovereignty, and the state

Albert, Victor. *The limits to citizen power: participatory democracy and the entanglements of the state.* x, 207 pp., tables, figs, illus., bibliogr. London: Pluto Press, 2016. £21.99 (paper)

The limits to citizen power looks at the unfulfilled promises of participatory democracy in Santo André, Brazil, within the context of three different policy-making municipal councils (Urban Development, Participatory Budgeting, and the Housing Council). This is an ethnographic account of the common problems in participation: the state-led management of meetings; political intimidation; bureaucratization; and technical language that minimizes the possibility of effective citizen participation. Victor Albert guides us through examples and literature, concluding that participation can be used to give legitimacy to decisions that are still 'regulated by the state and filled with civil society' (Nogueira, *As possibilidades da política*, 1998: 222, cited on p. 175), because, as he notes earlier: 'Participatory democracy [is] organized in spaces organized by the state' (p. 13).

The introduction and chapter 1 are particularly relevant to readers interested in Brazil's post-dictatorship politics. The author contextualizes participatory practices in Brazil and beyond and the role of international institutions, as well as domestic ones, such as new constitutions that support citizen participation. Albert also describes how the Workers' Party supports participatory practices. Santo André is the birthplace of Brazil's workers' movements, yet the public criticism of political and economic elites frequently has been muted since the surreptitious death of a former mayor, making this a great site for an ethnographic examination of grassroots meetings.

In chapter 2, the author describes 'rituals of participation', starting with the council members' induction ceremony and the voting processes. The analysis of participatory rituals extends throughout chapters 3 and 4. In chapter 3, Albert analyses the functioning of each different council; explains the processes of agenda-setting and decision-making; and gives space to key participants' narratives. The views discussed range from pragmatic opinions to a more frustrated perception that the state organizes meetings and participants are merely present (p. 83). The view that emerges, then, is that participation consists of a 'stage', or surface, where there are opportunities for the coexistence of diverse political views; and a 'backstage', where deep-seated inequalities taint the ability to create collaborative decisions. In chapter 4, however,

the author discusses how rituals are spatially ordered and how this may create possibilities for more effective participation.

Albert carefully describes meeting rooms, discussing how a cinema-style room empowers those at the front, whereas in a round-table discussion citizens are ordered in a more democratic way. He also suggests that there are more factors that explain why some councils succeed or fail, such as the leaders' personalities and participants' socioeconomic background, all of which influence discussions and outcomes. Nevertheless, councils with different settings and leadership styles still faced a similar outcome: consensual decisions.

The concluding chapters are more orientated towards problem-solving. Discussing power imbalances and false hopes across chapters 5 and 6, the author studies participants found in the backstage in order to reveal episodes of intimidation and fear. Participatory institutions in Santo André, he states, are still 'intimately caught up with the local state administration' (p. 167). Albert suggests some methods, such as secret voting and recorded meetings, which could provide more security for council members. In conclusion, he approaches participation as a process, where partaking should not be taken as a synonym for horizontality (p. 169), as it needs a 'set of organizational and cultural materials that are not so indebted to the existing political order' (p. 187).

This is a valuable political ethnography of contemporary politics in Brazil. As an ethnographic approach to bureaucracy, it sheds new light on old practices and for that reason raises many questions – some of which remain unanswered. The effectiveness of the suggestions offered by Albert to improve participation (e.g. secret voting or video recording) is not supported by evidence. Secret ballots could weaken accountability and video recording might lead to further intimidation in such a small social network. The use of the terms 'stage' and 'backstage' in the context of participation may suggest two separate realms, but in reality in participatory meetings employment and personal relationships entwine. Finally, since councils are supposed to represent different city segments and therefore interests at a given time, it is important to examine these meetings while also discussing which urban interventions could allow for flexible and reversible compromises. That said, anthropologists, political scientists, sociologists, and urban scholars will find this book a good source for both practical examples and an interesting theoretical framework for their own investigations into citizen participation in Brazil and beyond.

Andreza Aruska de Souza Santos *University of Oxford*

Bernstein, Anya. *Religious bodies politic: rituals of sovereignty in Buryat Buddhism.* xvii, 258 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. Chicago: Univ. Press, 2013. £22.50 (paper)

Anya Bernstein makes a compelling contribution to the anthropology and history of Buddhism in Russia in general and Buryat Buddhism in particular. Following John Snelling's *Buddhism in Russia* (1993) and Alexandre Andreyev's *Soviet Russia and Tibet* (2003), *Religious bodies politic* is the third English-language book-length study of Buddhism in Russia. As an anthropological study of contemporary Buryat Buddhism, the book may be seen as unique.

Taking a trans-boundary, yet person-centred and personalized, perspective, the book explores how the revolutionary events in Eurasia – from the Russian Revolution to the Cold War to the dissolution of the Soviet Union – manifested themselves in the life stories of particular Buryat monks. Supporting the argument of Nikolay Tsyrempilov (*Buddizm i imperiia*, 2013) that the location of Buryat Buddhists between the Russian imperial formations (the Russian Empire, the Soviet Union, and the Russian Federation) and the world of Mongol-Tibetan Buddhism allowed them to remain autonomous within both, Bernstein analyses the nexus of heterogeneous Eurasian spaces and revolutionary events through highly mobile Buddhist bodies, both dead and alive, rather than the more conventional group or individual actors. The role of bodies in the performances of religio-political and cultural sovereignty forms the monograph's core.

The book argues that certain persons and their bodies, rather than groups as a whole, became the sites for negotiating Buryat Buddhists' relations with the Russian/Soviet state and the larger Eurasian world in the context of radical social transformations. This is mainly supported by Bernstein's participant observation fieldwork in Russia and India as well as secondary literature in Russian. Chapters 1 and 2 provide a brief, yet well-informed, account of the history of Buryat Buddhism, positioning it within the broader field of Russian and Eurasian studies, but also connecting it to imperial and Soviet history, as well as to contemporary practices, debates, and Buryat Buddhist attitudes towards Russia and the Mongol-Tibetan world. Chapter 3 focuses on the

religious revival in Buryatia after the collapse of the USSR and the role played by rediscovered dead bodies and devotional objects in constructing new sacred geographies. Chapter 4 takes a closer look at Buryat monks and pilgrims in India and their quest to redefine the revival in Buryatia. Together with chapter 4, chapter 5 explores bodies and gender, with special attention to the meditative practice of *chöd*, during which practitioners offer their bodies as food to supernatural beings. Finally, chapter 6 unravels the discussions of money and morality at the crossroads of religion and economics in contemporary Buryatia.

Overall, Bernstein's argument is convincing, and the book indeed opens up new lifeworlds of Buryat Buddhism, while the anthropological methodology and the focus on bodies hold together the multi-threaded narrative. Acknowledging the book's anthropological focus, one might expect a slightly more nuanced analysis of composite spaces and practices of diversity management in the Russian Empire and the Soviet Union. A closer look at the discussions which were launched by Western scholars (D. Lieven, 'The Russian Empire and the Soviet Union as imperial polities', *Journal of Comparative History* **30: 4**, 1995; R.G. Suny, *The revenge of the past*, 1993) and developed during the 'imperial turn' in historiography on Russia could perhaps help position the case of Buryat Buddhists within a broader history of agents reproducing and navigating the heterogeneous imperial structures (see W. Sunderland, 'The USSR as a multinational state from the Revolution to the death of Stalin: Western scholarship since 1991', *Vestnik of Saint Petersburg University: History* **4**, 2016).

The use of Buryat and Buddhist as interchangeable terms throughout the book also may dilute the issue of Buryats' diversity. While the author acknowledges that many Buryats have little to no relationship with Buddhism, the latter is presented as a unifying factor for the whole ethno-national community, which is often not the case (D.D. Amogolonova, '*Buddizm v Buriatii*', *Strany i Narody Vostoka*, vol. XXXVI, 2015). Finally, the discussion of Buddhism during the Soviet and post-Soviet periods would have benefited from comparing the process of its bureaucratization to that of Orthodox Christianity, and, more broadly, from exploring how the functioning of official Buddhism as one of Russia's four institutionalized religions made its leaders similar to those of Islam, Christianity, and Judaism in their language, organizational ideas, and defensism (see A. Bennigsen, P.B. Henze, G.K. Tanham & S.E. Wimbush, *Soviet strategy and Islam*, 1989; P.W. Werth, *The Tsar's foreign faiths,* 2014).

Setting these issues aside, the book is a must for students and scholars of Buryatia and Buddhism in Russia. As a comprehensive anthropological study, it will also be of great interest to all those who are studying Russian and Eurasian diversity.

Ivan Sablin *University of Heidelberg*

Henig, David & Nicolette Makovicky (eds). *Economies of favour after socialism.* xiii, 239 pp., figs, bibliogrs. Oxford: Univ. Press, 2016. £55.00 (cloth)

Since the fall of state socialism, postsocialist Eurasia has continued to be framed through variations of the 'shortage economy' paradigm. Within the contexts of abrupt chaos and uncertainty, ethnographers described people's strategies of 'survival' and 'coping' through 'informal' channels that mitigated the deficiencies of state and market mechanisms. Alena Ledeneva's notion of an 'economy of favours' (*Russia's economy of favours*, 1998) encompassed much of this debate, portraying *blat*, and similar forms of illicit exchange, as coated in registers of assistance, while in fact channelling individual interests – a Bourdieusian 'misrecognition' game (Ledeneva, this volume, p. 25). However, as David Henig and Nicolette Makovicky note in their introduction, such approaches neglect the ethical and expressive dimensions as well as the very gratuity that favours are meant to achieve. Thus *Economies of favour after socialism* responds to the 'ethical turn' by showing how, when doing favours, social actors are not just reacting in a calculated way to a context of scarcity: they are also trying to *do good*, as well as to 'do' politics and economy.

The collection overall offers a bold critique of the kind of economistic thinking that has plagued much of the literature on postsocialism (including 'anti-corruption' studies, the new policy vogue in the region). It is equally an attack on 'reciprocity' as another catch-all explanation. The main provocation is given through Humphrey's chapter 3, which follows Pitt-Rivers' work on grace, and treats doing a favour as an independent, *sui generis* mode of action in its own right. Here, favours are distinguished not by their morphology, but by a 'moral aesthetic': 'whether an act takes the form of barter, a gift, or even a commercial transaction', doing it as a favour 'adds a "gratuitous" extra to any practical function it may have, and turns the act into

something incalculable' (p. 51). This places favours as sitting ambiguously, yet productively, next to more established concepts. They are akin to, and sometimes take the shape of, gifts, but with no return expected, except the reciprocity of sentiment. They also are informed by kinship and other social obligations, but single out a *specific* person (a favour is given only to *some* kin, or *some* friends). They can occur within market exchange, but with 'the small inner thrill of having been favoured' (p. 69). The result is a distinct mode of action which has political and economic consequences, 'without being fully explicable in terms of transactional cost-benefit analysis' (Henig & Makovicky, p. 4).

Subsequent contributors to the volume show how Humphrey's strict delineation of favours is ethnographically less tenable. However, taken together, these chapters amount to a radically decentred portrayal of economic action, which regularly escapes the functionalism of exchange and other easy reifications. For if something connects such diverse phenomena as Polish *znajomości* and Bosnian *štele*, it is the sense that the control over their actions' meanings and outcomes is not entirely in actors' hands – even if they all have to take part in the complex semiotics and choreography of (socially permissible) favouritism. Favours play out across generations (Humphrey, chap. 3) and history (Kaneff, chap. 7); they connect one to the unaccountable bounty (Rakowski, chap. 8) and God the Almighty (Henig, chap. 9); they lubricate the connections between the household and the state, but not without lubricating social actors themselves (Hann, chap. 6). Sometimes, they take the burdensome form of 'anti-favour' (Swancutt, chap. 5). The idea of the gratuitous 'extra' means that not everything can be accounted for: either in its intention, its value, or its consequences.

Ultimately, the volume reaches its analytical peak in the chapters that describe what happens when this incalculable gratuitous action meets its limits under new pressures for marketization. Preceding forms of social grace become entwined with intense monetization, and the very ground for doing favours shifts. Such situations put particular strains on social actors, who have to 'cut the network' of obligations and decline help in order to sustain the *right* relations (Reeves, chap. 4). It creates new arenas with contested meanings and no set etiquette, both of which require constant fixing (Makovicky, chap. 10), but it does not collapse all social action onto a single plane. Rather, new registers emerge that are both less stable and more complex, in which the lines between the calculable and the incalculable, obligation, price, and grace have to be carefully redrawn and re-navigated. It is within these interstices of gratuity and interest that favours appear both socially generative and theoretically exceptional. By re-examining classic economic anthropology debates through the lens of societies outside the canonical borders of comparison, this book does a favour to our understanding of conviviality more broadly – with an 'extra' layer of demands.

Ivan Rajković *Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology*

Kallinen, Timo. *Divine rulers in a secular state*. 202 pp., figs, illus., bibliogr. Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society, 2016. €42.00 (paper)

The scope of this unassuming book is much broader than its title suggests. The topics covered, spanning southern Ghana and specifically the Asante region, have mostly been studied by others already, but by assembling them under the term 'secularization', Timo Kallinen gives us a new look at the confrontation occurring all over Africa between local life-ways and the 'modern'. Secularization here is really a particular case of 'purification', a concept introduced by Bruno Latour and elaborated by Webb Keane. Purification, attempting to separate things and activities that are felt to be intrinsically different, inevitably results in 'hybrids' requiring further purification.

Skilfully weaving extensive fieldwork together with archival research and current theories, Kallinen reviews the history of both the Golden Stool and the Asante Empire's formation, arguing that scholarly explanations of royal rituals as mere reinforcements of the political structure ignore the nineteenth-century Asante view that ritual preceded the political and brought it about. A chief's essential function was to make sacrifices to his ancestors, whose reincarnation he was, and punish offences against them that would bring retribution upon the community. Such reincarnation was effected by patrilateral cross-cousin marriage, a topic that the author rightly says has been misunderstood and neglected by anthropologists. Through this form of marriage, patrilineally inherited great names could be given to matrilineal descendants and thus kept in the matrilineage; and chiefs could engender grandsons who, by combining the virtues inherited via the male and female lines, were considered their reincarnations. The channels of political authority in this 'matrilineal' society were thus specifically patrilineal.

Asante history in the twentieth century can be seen as a series of purifying recommendations intended to improve chieftaincy, including the office of Asantehene. Early missionaries thought that converts must dissociate themselves from fetishism, although 'fetishism' was simply the Asante way of life. Chiefs complained that their subjects no longer obeyed them. District commissioners worried that a collapse of traditional institutions would make indirect rule impossible. Administrators and missionaries together decreed the secularization of chieftaincy by imposing an arbitrary and unworkable distinction between 'good' and 'bad' customary obligations, thus making religion a matter of individual conscience rather than a function of citizenship.

In the 1930s it was deemed necessary to 'restore' the empire, now defined in secular terms. Administrators in the Gold Coast, as elsewhere in Africa, favoured a model of authoritarian rule by natural aristocracies, but other voices, including the anthropologist R.S. Rattray and such intellectuals as J.E. Casely-Hayford and J.M. Sarbah, advanced a Whiggish model of the traditional community as a natural democracy needing only to be improved for modern use. This liberal view sidestepped the question of sacrifice and the special relationship of the chief to his ancestors. In 1935 the administration forced into place a restoration marked as much by hypocrisy as by hybridity, in which the Golden Stool appeared as 'a national symbol sanctified by religious ideas rather than as source of divine power' for the Asantehene (p. 107). Chiefs were the spiritual heads of their people, but only for those who chose to practise 'the Ashanti religion' (p. 107).

Even secularized, chieftaincy presented a double problem for Nkrumah's Ghana, as both a violation of socialist egalitarianism and a source of political opposition. On the other hand, chieftaincy could splendidly represent national culture – 'culture' itself being a purification of what had been fetishism. Reduced to symbolic gestures, libations to the ancestors could make everybody feel good. Meanwhile, much of the population continues to believe in the agency of ritual: in fact some felt sure that the murder of three High Court judges in 1982 during the Rawlings regime was a sacrificial act. New, television-based Pentecostal/Charismatic churches confirm traditional beliefs by reviving the old missionary denunciation of chieftaincy and custom as demonic, but with a new twist, extending their condemnation to the modern political system, behind which they detect an evil empire (a deep state?).

The World Bank agrees, in a sense, with the Charismatics. Bypassing African governments as inefficient and oppressive leftovers from the colonial era, it outsources development projects directly to 'the people', amongst whom chieftaincy is supposedly a natural, organic growth: Rattray would be pleased. The Asantehene, now backed by the World Bank as well as his warrior ancestors and the Golden Stool, has become the go-to development chief for all of West Africa, while still performing traditional rituals and wielding arbitrary power at home (pp. 125-30). As foot soldiers of the World Bank, benevolent NGOs seek to purify ancestral culture of witchcraft beliefs, now seen as products of poverty and ignorance.

Wyatt MacGaffey *Haverford College*

Kastrinou, A. Maria A. *Power, sect and state in Syria: the politics of marriage and identity amongst the Druze*. xix, 268 pp., figs, illus., bibliogr. London, New York: I.B.Tauris, 2016. £85.00 (cloth)

Very little ethnographic research has been conducted in Syria, and this was so even before the beginning of the current war in 2011. In this respect, A. Maria A. Kastrinou's study, based on ethnographic fieldwork between 2008 and 2010, is of great significance, since she relates her main subject, the Druze (an Islamic religious minority in Syria), to the ways power and the state operate in the Syrian context.

Kastrinou's work belongs to a recent strand in the academic regional literature seeking to deconstruct the primordialist, achronic, and homogenized depictions of religious communities. Following Ussama Maqdisi's line of argument in his excellent study of Mount Lebanon in the mid-nineteenth century (*The culture of sectarianism,* 2000), the author views sectarianism as a *modern* story, produced by the interplay between indigenous and imperial histories, and deployed in local sociopolitical struggles. Sectarianism is thus deeply connected to both the modern state's creation and the formation of specific political subjectivities.

The book is an urban ethnographic study, organized along various axes and topics. It begins in the mainly Druze Damascene suburb of Jaramana. Following a close analysis of two families, as well as their houses' architecture, Kastrinou traces the socioeconomic transformations that Syria has undergone over the last decades, emphasizing the internal communal diversities. The Druzes of Jaramana

were not homogeneous in their beliefs and practices, but rather strategically deployed their religious identities within the social fabric of their lives. In a similar way, the author examines the cosmological beliefs and rituals surrounding birth and death, showing that they are also embedded within the context of contemporary social practice, as well as being sites for struggle among the community members. There is a special emphasis upon corporeality, as it is crucial for Druze cosmology and ritual (the belief in reincarnation is one of the distinguishing features of the Druze), but also because *becoming* a Druze is ethnographically shown to be a process, and thus negotiated and contested through bodily practices.

As group endogamy is a strong norm for all Syrian religious minorities, the study unavoidably also focuses upon the beliefs and practices surrounding marriage and weddings. Using the case study of a secular, middle-class, intellectual family, and showing us the repercussions for a non-endogamous marriage, Kastrinou demonstrates how marriage serves to reify the Druze as a distinctive 'sect', and how endogamy becomes a boundary for group inclusion and exclusion (p. 127).

Marriage is also present in the book's second part, where Kastrinou deals more directly with the national context and the regime. Here we are offered a detailed analysis of two state-sponsored folklore festivals in which the motif of marriage is recurrently used. Interestingly, in such festivals, explicitly sectarian identities, including the Druze, were openly celebrated, in contrast to the normative statist discourse. Yet this was a strategic deployment by the state, attempting to naturalize and neutralize potentially threatening sectarian identifications. Through examining the cultural policies of the regime, Kastrinou argues that the state uses an alternative discourse to nationalism, such as the embodied discourse of marriage or 'unity in diversity', in order to legitimate itself to both international and local audiences. This is why Kastrinou argues that the Syrian state is better viewed as a *state-of-empire*, since it not only manages difference but also renders difference possible solely under its patronage (p. 152).

As well as examining power relations in sites such as households, life-cycle events, and state-sponsored cultural policies, the author presents various case studies of young people and their responses to the authority of parents, sectarian communities, and the state. Putting an emphasis on the possibility of resistance and agency, she demonstrates the multiple ways in which youths negotiate, but also reinforce, power relations. Finally, Kastrinou focuses on a contemporary dance theatre group, providing a political reading of its performance, which centred upon the nuptial ritual. As this group receives European funding, she explores the relations between Syrian artists, intellectuals, and globalized market forces, and considers the promotion of specific issues, such as 'gender', in the artistic agenda.

Apart from the rich ethnographic material and the insightful interpretative analysis of notions and ritual practices, Kastrinou's study is characterized by theoretical virtues, since she challenges the conventional notions surrounding both 'sectarianism' and a series of issues such as 'civil society' and the 'state'. While some of her interpretations, such as the one concerning the stance of Syrians vis-à-vis the regime (pp. 139, 231) are open to debate, hers is a socially grounded analysis that places sectarian identities within the framework of political economy and lived social relations. *Power, sect and state in Syria* is a valuable contribution to the anthropological literature of the region.

Panagiotis Geros *Panteion University of Social and Political Science*

Ecospheres

Campbell, Jeremy M. *Conjuring property: speculation and environmental futures in the Brazilian Amazon*. xx, 231 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press. 2015. £19.50 (paper)

Property is a long-standing anthropological subject, one that is also often invoked in other disciplines and outside of the academy. Yet what property actually is – how it is created, by whom, why, and to what social and political effect – is rarely engaged with in the depth and sensitivity displayed in this ethnography of property-making in the Brazilian Amazon. In this volume, Jeremy M. Campbell reveals the complexity of property's social meaning, its multiple uses, and its effects in daily life.

Property is not simply a formal distribution of land by the state, Campbell argues. Neither is it absent in an area that might be dismissively characterized as a 'frontier'. Rather, property is struggled over, mobilized, and, as Campbell says, 'conjured' by Amazonian land claimants, who, like so many others around the world, lack formal legal titles. Property is a tool of capital and powerful groups, like Brazilian *grandes* (large landholders) in Castelo de Sonhos, the area of

western Pará where Campbell studied. However, it is also used by *os pequenos* (smallholders) there, who undertake their own property-conjuring practices that draw on, and are often roped into, those of the *grandes*. Relations around property and its 'conjuring' can generate both tension and unlikely alignments of interests in the complex rural society that Campbell illuminates.

Property is often understood as a way to claim resources, a precondition for both productive and sustainable land use. Yet it has other uses and meanings that are not focused on land use. In particular, Campbell shows how landholders use property in what he calls a '"proleptic" mode' (p. 129). They try to draw a largely absent state into the area by adhering to the different, and sometimes conflicting, logics of the various governmental schemes at work in the region: from the military dictatorship's deforestation-reliant colonization schemes, to new regimes of environmental governance. These constitute a 'development archive' (p. 31), as Campbell demonstrates, from which landholders draw to assert multiple land claims. The practices used to make these claims span, and interweave, the licit and illicit. Legitimate papers are mixed with those that are forged and made to look old (time spent in a drawer in close proximity to crickets can do the trick). Landholders hire crews to cut trails marking purported boundaries and destroying those of competing claimants. Smallholders are coerced into acting as legal front men for large-scale landholders, enabling the latter to control larger areas of land than is legally allowed. Assertions of productive land use are deployed alongside those of environmental protection.

The use of a range of tactics and logics is strategic: residents do not know which type of claim or evidence, if any, will be anointed with state recognition. In the face of this uncertainty, they undertake many of them. In the process, rather than simplifying relationships with land – as it does in some accounts – property acts to create 'a murky and vernacular thicket' (p. 55), which also reveals the incoherence of both the concept of property and the states that expound it.

This use of property also points to a theoretical contribution to the understanding of property and its meaning in Campbell's work. Property is often considered geographically, as a tool that works to claim resources and order physical space. In contrast, Campbell emphasizes its temporal dimension. In their work to create property, Castelo de Sonhos's residents also generate the particular sense of time that property entails. They create histories of land occupation and use, invoking envisioned futures: a time when the government will recognize and enforce their claims. A moral vision lies within property's temporality, with property acting as 'a premier marker of Western modernity' (p. 11) itself. Through property, the past of land uncertainty and the absence of the state is meant to be transformed into a future of progress and ordered governance. That residents can never seem to escape that disordered past marks them as less than modern, left behind by Brazil's economic development, and even as seen to be living 'before history' (p. 97).

'Conjuring' is, in this sense, an apt term to use. The word points to both the precarity and agency that Campbell reveals in this thoroughly readable and illuminating account of the social life of a fundamental anthropological concept. He shows property's centrality and indeterminacy in daily life as residents seek to forge governed futures in the Brazilian Amazon. The account will be of particular interest to scholars of Amazonia, land and property, and development, as well as those working in applied settings in these fields.

Maron Greenleaf *Dartmouth College*

Domenig, Aya. *The day the sun fell*. DVD/PAL, 78 minutes, colour. London: RAI, 2015. £50.00 (+VAT)

This politely provocative documentary juxtaposes two analogous periods of risk and uncertainty in Japan: the 1945 atomic bombing of Hiroshima by the United States and the 2011 triple-meltdowns of the Fukushima Daiichi nuclear power station. Some Japanese, like the author Haruki Murakami, have characterized the latter as Japan's nuclear attack on itself ('Speaking as an unrealistic dreamer', *The Asia-Pacific Journal* **9: 29: 7**, 2011). Film-maker Aya Domenig bridges the sixty-six-year crater between these two tragic events through a biography of her late grandfather, a Hiroshima-based doctor who happened to be outside the city on a house call during the bombing. The documentary suggests that the Fukushima Daiichi crisis broke out while Domenig was recording her grandmother's recollections of the 1945 events, thereby facilitating the filmic treatment of the two narratives.

Domenig tells the story of Hiroshima through period film clips of her father treating *hibakusha* (atomic bombing victims), through his old photographs and the reminiscences of her grandmother, as well as other archival footage. Additionally, the documentary highlights some of

the surviving Hiroshima nurses and local activists (in particular another doctor), who give a sense of what it was like for an entire region to grapple with the effects of radiation sickness – which at the time was an alien phenomenon to nearly everyone in Japan and medical professionals, not to mention the world at large. The most difficult-to-view scenes of the film include those that depict the grim carnage of atomic war: the keloid scars of radiation burns on women's faces and backs; traumatized children with missing patches of hair and other wounds; and dying men all but immobile on hospital beds, virtually unable to breathe. These scenes are narrated through the recollections of doctors, nurses, and others as they tried to make sense of this mysterious illness that killed not only those exposed to the blinding flash of the initial detonation and its shockwave, but also people who had arrived in the city days later and had not been apparently exposed to the violent effects of this new weapon. Poignantly, interviewees recount how locals in the wider region ascribed the terrifying, malignant blight to Hiroshima itself – from whence radiation emanated – and eventually victims there became ostracized widely in Japanese society, as if they were somehow to blame for having been exposed to radiation.

This historical material is juxtaposed with footage of informants describing the aftermath of the Fukushima Daiichi disaster as analogous to their experiences after the detonation of 'Little Boy' in 1945. Domenig also documents a demonstration in Yoyogi, Tokyo, against nuclear power and government policy, said to have been Japan's largest anti-nuclear protest. She includes the odd clip of Fukushima Daiichi and tsunami news coverage, but depictions of the power plant's meltdowns and the contemporary fallout come off as relatively thin here. Instead, the film focuses on interviewees' discussions of Fukushima, including several public lectures where activists like the Hiroshima doctor discuss the experience of radiation after August 1945 and how this is reflected and refracted in post-tsunami Japan.

Asked what Japan will be like in five years' time, one activist interviewee responds: 'Everyone will be a *hibakusha* . . . And actually that's a good thing. It's good provided that we question ourselves, and don't tell any lies. We have to show the world what it means to live as *hibakusha*'. This worthy sentiment captures what is successful about this documentary. While some extended scenes and overly long edits of the film-maker's grandmother, for example, sometimes feel excessively sentimental – perhaps bordering on self-indulgent – the documentary manages to compare the fallout from these two disasters in productive ways. Some of the most memorable quotations from the film, in addition to its evocative title – *The day the sun fell* – come towards the end. A former wartime nurse states: '[Nuclear proponents] guard plutonium as if it were their most precious treasure. They can't let go of it'. Then Domenig closes the film with a final word from the doctor who has witnessed human-scale nuclear devastation across the entire sweep of post-war Japanese history, from the close of the Second World War to the present day: 'For the sake of our descendants, we must put out the fire we lit while we are still alive'.

The documentary includes graphic scenes of war wounded, but would be appropriate for senior schoolchildren, undergraduates, and others interested in debates over nuclear weapons and nuclear power, in transwar Japanese oral history, and in Japanese culture generally.

Peter Wynn Kirby *University of Oxford*

Kirksey, Eben. *Emergent ecologies*. 304 pp., illus., bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2015. £19.99 (paper)

Throughout the past decade, Eben Kirksey has cultivated an approach to anthropology and the environmental humanities – multispecies ethnography – through publications and hosting gatherings of anthropologists, artists, and scientists called multispecies salons. *Emergent ecologies* successfully crystallizes that project in monograph form. Kirksey was trained in the University of California Santa Cruz's History of Consciousness and Anthropology programmes, and this book, with its ensemble cast of ants, frogs, fungi, macaques, and cattle (to name a few actors), is unmistakably Santa Cruzian in its more-than-human ethos. Kirksey also follows the people who adopt, breed, care for, feed, kill, love, sell, study, or otherwise relate with these beings. In fact, he does some of these things himself.

The book is set in forests, labs, galleries, and fields in Panama, New York, Maine, Florida, and Costa Rica, and is concerned with theory-building, methodological experimentation, and reimagining environmental ethics. Kirksey draws inspiration from Haraway, Stengers, and Tsing as he 'pokes and pushes' (p. 18) the ideas of prominent (white, male, and European) philosophers like Deleuze and Derrida. The philosopher Peter Sloterdijk is a recurring foil and the originator of one of the book's key concepts. For Sloterdijk, 'ontological amphibian' flags human exceptionalism; his idea is that we choose

among modes of existence, but other animals are trapped in ontological cages. Kirksey uses multispecies ethnography to appropriate and repurpose the term by focusing on nonhuman beings that flourish by 'switching from one element to another . . . invading and occupying emergent worlds' (p. 37). He shows how Ectatomma ants, chytrid fungi, African clawed frogs, rhesus macaques, and fringe-toed foam frogs thrive along the seams and in the gaps of worlds built and abandoned by people, while endangered species like the Panamanian gold frog are confined to sterilized environments.

Kirksey urges us to reject apocalyptic thinking and to cultivate hope and convivial communities instead. He also calls us to live responsibly and, sometimes, more intimately with other species (or 'critters'), a position which can sometimes lead to uneasy conclusions. For example, he meditates on whether or not it would be better for endangered frogs in 'cash-strapped zoos and conservation organizations' to live with 'multispecies families' (p. 154), who would care for them in (and, perhaps, sell them from) private homes. Kirksey wants us to look beyond charismatic species and consider unloved others – to recognize that taking a stand for one species might mean killing another. He asks: what do we love? Why? How should we love? (pp. 218-19). His advice: don't be clingy! 'Caretakers', he notes earlier, 'must learn species-species norms of tact, politeness, and what Matei Candea calls interpatience . . . animals like frogs demand a certain distance' (p. 153).

Two decades ago, George Marcus suggested that multi-sited ethnographies might construct their objects by following people, things, metaphors, stories, or conflicts. In this book, the ethnographic objects – emergent ecologies – are constructed by following the author as he chases promising leads and takes detours. An interest in an ant species thriving in the hybrid landscapes of postcolonial Panama leads to the country's endangered frogs, which brings us to a lab in Maine where scientists study the fungi killing those frogs. We learn that another frog species used in labs (*Xenopus laevis*) is suspected of carrying chytrids, so we are off to New York and then Florida, which has permissive laws for keeping and breeding animals. The chapters are essays that combine interviews, participant observation, archival work, and cultural analysis, serving as 'thick descriptions of ecosystem parts, which also serve as partial sketches of shifting and ephemeral wholes' (p. 217). Kirksey's travels link the parts. Unexpected and provocative are the various experiments, collaborations, and exhibitions he orchestrates along the way. He observes Ectatomma ants in a colony he has modified, creates a golden frog utopia in a repurposed refrigerator, gives door-to-door frog pregnancy tests (to humans), and adopts a frog named Steve.

Emergent ecologies is innovative, thoroughly researched, and well written – a labour of love. It is best at its most specific, when Kirksey's infectious curiosity and freewheeling fieldwork reveal surprising connections across biological theory, political economy, and cultural history. Conversely, the philosophical bent of the theory-building sections can overburden the text and lead to conceptual pile-ups. In chapter 2 alone, the reader must navigate the terms 'ontological amphibian', 'cosmopolitical assembly', 'interessement', 'trophallaxis', and 'entangled empathy'. That said, the book really grew on me and I was hooked by the final chapters.

A final thought: *Emergent ecologies* is a book by a cosmopolitan American scholar researched, written, and published during the years of the Obama presidency. It is, fittingly, about cosmopolitan life, hybridity, and hope. I wonder what new ecologies and forms of multispecies ethnography will emerge in response to our current era of nationalism, purification, and nostalgia.

Ashley Carse *Vanderbilt University*

Little, Peter C. *Toxic town: IBM, pollution, and industrial risks*. xxii, 242 pp., map, illus., bibliogr. New York: Univ. Press, 2014. £20.99 (paper)

Peter Little's timely ethnography explores the 'lived experiences and discourses' of the residents of Endicott, New York, IBM's 'contaminated birthplace'. He opens with a critique of IBM's promise to build a 'smarter planet' by infusing intelligent technologies into 'everything in our socio-natural world' (p. xiv). Little highlights the fundamental contradictions and ironies inherent in the company's pledge. How can we trust IBM to build a smarter planet when places like Endicott have been permanently altered by the company's toxic industrial legacy? Little's work has a profoundly Cassandra-like quality. He warns us that the toxic contaminants associated with high-tech production have poorly understood effects. Mitigation efforts may or may not offer satisfying or smart 'solutions' to the socio-natural problems associated with 'industrial pollution, deindustrialization, and other rampant neoliberal consequences of an economy based on the

ceaseless concentration of finance capital and the protection of shareholder interests' (p. 5).

Little investigates the ways that Endicott residents, many of whom were once loyal IBM employees, understand and experience the enduring 'problem' of high-tech contamination. His research takes place before and after IBM has worked with authorities to 'mitigate' the effects of the 300-acre toxic plume underneath the town. The plume contains trichloroethylene (TCE), a carcinogen used in industrial cleaning solvents in IBM's manufacturing facility. Residents are potentially exposed to TCE through the mechanism of 'vapor intrusion'.

Introducing the concept of a 'mitigation landscape' to describe places like Endicott, Little defines it as 'where citizens, knowledges, and technologies interact' and 'where risk decisions and management have not only taken place, but have materialized' (p. 21). Drawing on insights from science and technology studies (STS), he argues that the actors interacting in this mitigation landscape offer different 'explanatory models' of the risks posed by vapour intrusion, the goals of mitigation, and what it means to take 'responsibility' for generating toxic pollution. Endicott residents explain that nothing can ameliorate the stigma and permanent uncertainty associated with toxic exposure.

Little also pays serious ethnographic attention to 'what prompted residents to take action and what politics and values did or didn't inform citizen action' (p. 4). He traces the history of grassroots activism in Endicott and investigates the 'micropolitical ecology of environmental justice' at work in the community. When the National Environmental Justice for All tour visited Endicott in 2004, many of the white middle-class residents Little interviewed felt uncomfortable or ambivalent about framing their struggle as an 'environmental justice' issue. Some felt this would undermine their attempts to depoliticize contamination discourses in Endicott. Others feared that this would deepen the stigma attached to the community. Little also introduces the concept of 'conflicted environmental justice' to describe 'the micro-level ruptures that emerge with, and even in response to, the expansion of solidarity movements like the environmental justice movement' (p. 153). This concept may be useful for researchers working in contaminated communities that demonstrate a similar ambivalence to environmental justice narratives.

This last point speaks to one of the greatest strengths of Little's narrative, but also to one of the challenges of engaged ethnographic research. He does a wonderful job of allowing his local interlocutors to speak in the text. His goal is to 'make the voice of Endicott's mitigated residents more audible and meaningful' (p. 105), and he absolutely succeeds in doing this. Little expertly weaves together ethnographic anecdotes, concepts from critical social theory, insights into his own perspectives, and lengthy quotes from his interviews. However, in a few places, he stops short of applying to Endicott's residents the critical lens which he unflinchingly applies to institutions like IBM. When they engage in discursive practices that draw on racist constructs, he shows that these dynamics are at work by choosing quotes that clearly illustrate these undercurrents, but he does not fully unpack and adequately theorize the role that racism seems to play in their conflicted engagements with environmental justice discourse(s).

Little's innovative approach and his engaging narrative style make *Toxic town* a powerful contribution to contemporary ethnography. His work contributes to a well-established body of research on the toxic legacies of industrial development and offers new and compelling theoretical concepts. His concepts of a mitigation landscape and conflicted environmental justice will prove useful for scholars conducting research in similar settings. Readers will come away with a deep respect for Endicott's residents, and a useful sense of moral outrage that will lead them to question whether corporations like IBM can lead us to a more intelligent future.

Megan A. Styles *University of Illinois Springfield*

McElwee, Pamela D. *Forests are gold: trees, people, and environmental rule in Vietnam*. xxvi, 283 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press, 2016. £19.50 (paper)

This is a sophisticated, empirically rich, and beautifully written study of forest governance in Vietnam, which makes a significant contribution to the political ecology literature on forests. Its central argument is that forest governance in Vietnam has never been about conservation per se, but rather has always been more concerned with economic and social transformation, with people rather than trees: a process Pamela D. McElwee terms 'environmental rule'. This is traced meticulously in five chronologically organized chapters, each focusing on a different reincarnation of environmental rule.

Under French colonialism, forest policy focused primarily on timber extraction in 'reserved forests', resulting in widespread forest

degradation in the lowlands, whilst simultaneously successfully laying the blame for deforestation on ethnic minorities' swidden agriculture in the uplands. This stigmatization, as McElwee explores, has had a damaging legacy for upland minorities. Under socialist rule in the 1960s and 1970s, forests were managed in so-called 'State Forest Enterprises' (SFEs), areas of forests under management plans. Here, McElwee provides fascinating insights into how SFEs employed tens of thousands of lowlanders (never local ethnic minorities), who were neither particularly knowledgeable about forests nor well trained. Management plans themselves were not based on much ecological science either – rather, the real purpose of SFEs was to provide jobs and foster republican subjectivities amongst their workers, as well as ongoing timber extraction. In the 1980s and 1990s, the age of the global discovery of 'deforestation' as well as market reform and trade liberalization, attention began to focus on illegal loggers as the agents of deforestation – individual culprits resisted by individual heroes: forest rangers. No one questioned the efficacy of overall forest management structures and practices. In the late 1990s, with donor support, the Vietnamese government embarked on a large-scale afforestation programme. Whilst this is frequently hailed as successful forest 'recovery', monocultures of exotic eucalyptus and acacia trees do not equate to biodiversity conservation; in fact, the destruction of old rainforests continued unabated during this time. Moreover, tree planting was instrumental in widespread land grab and privatization, both of which completely transformed rural land rights as well as landscapes. Finally, McElwee discusses the emergence of market solutions since the 2000s, namely Payments for Environmental Services (PES) and the UN's REDD+ programmes, under which – yet again – environmental policies were subversively used for economic gain.

These changing eras of forest management are, with some variation, recognizable throughout the tropics, and it is very useful to have such a lucid historical account in one place. However, what makes this study particularly valuable is McElwee's consistent focus on the centrality of forest classification to forest governance. Under every regime, classification schemes not only revealed the underlying motivations of environmental rule, but also constituted powerful instruments in its implementation. In the colonial period, forests were classed as 'rich' or 'poor' – that is, according to economic categories; during the 1980s, 'bare hills' were identified as needing afforestation, denying their existing important social and ecological role; and under PES and REDD+, rubber and oil palm plantations were classified as forests(!), directly supporting corporate capital. McElwee thus makes an important contribution to understanding not just *how* states see, but also in whose interests.

In a sophisticated analysis of how categories shape perceptions, McElwee also discusses how contingent measurements of forest-cover change are classifications, making 'actual' rates of deforestation inherently unknowable, and asks, in the last chapter, 'what is a tree?' Yet this analysis sits at odds with a somewhat limited understanding of 'proper' forest management, which informs her concept of environmental rule. Environmental rule normally includes everything other than biodiversity conservation: watershed policies that are really about resettling ethnic minorities, as well as afforestation programmes focused on wood production and revenue creation. Yet there is a difference between using purportedly environmental policies for social control, and policies that have, after all, been central to forestry for far longer than biodiversity conservation. It would have been useful to discuss these different facets of environmental rule more explicitly, and to acknowledge that biodiversity conservation is just as much informed by human preferences as other management priorities. Some discussion of the longer-term social ecology of Vietnamese forests also would have been welcome, given how prominently official condemnation of swidden agriculture features here. Nevertheless, this is an important book: 'environmental rule' may well join James Fairhead and Melissa Leach's 'misreading' (*Misreading the African landscape*, 1996), K. Sivaramakrishnan's 'modern forests' (*Modern forests*, 1999), and Arun Agrawal's 'environmentality' (*Environmentality*, 2005) as a key concept in forest political ecology.

Pauline von Hellermann *Goldsmiths, University of London*

Weiss, Brad. *Real pigs: shifting values in the field of local pork*. xvii, 288 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2016. £20.99 (paper)

Brad Weiss admirably describes, discusses, and analyses virtually all aspects of field-pastured 'heirloom' breed pigs from the Piedmont region of North Carolina. *Real pigs* is a product of years of intense participation observation fieldwork by Weiss, carried out while working on local field-raised pig farms, in butchers' shops, farmers'

markets, restaurant kitchens, and classrooms. It portrays the economic, political, practical, and ethical realities of producing quality 'authentic' heritage pork for a limited market otherwise dominated by huge industrial hog operations. Weiss's study focuses on local farmers, chefs, and consumers, including the folks at Cane Creek Farm, and over a dozen farms across the Piedmont, as well as the Carrboro Farmers' Market and the Lantern restaurant.

Weiss's research attempts to answer questions such as why pigs and pork have become important to proponents of the local food and Slow Food movements; and how pigs in the Piedmont area became imbued with notions of authenticity. Central to his ethnography are the first-generation farmers who raise the Ossabaw Island Hog for a pastured-pork niche local market. This hog is probably descended from the Spanish hogs famous for their *Jamón Ibérico de Bellota*, which in all likelihood were deposited on Ossabaw Island off the coast of the state of Georgia in the mid-sixteenth century, 'well before the notion of distinct, recognizable livestock breeds was developed in Europe' (p. 113).

Although academic language predominates in Weiss's well-written theoretical phenomenological analysis sections, his clear, rich, ethnographic descriptions and quotations from actual people holding genuine values about real pigs more than make up for his use of sometimes esoteric jargon. To non-academic audiences the captivating profiles of his informants will likely be the book's highlight. Those with an interest in history will find his first-rate chapters 'Pigs on the ground' (chap. 1) and 'Heritage, hybrids, breeds, and brands' (chap. 3) both informative and enjoyable. Throughout the work his focus on social justice concerns for the pigs and their breeders are spot on.

Perhaps the most telling comment about the reality of 'real pigs' deals with the farmers themselves:

> Of the dozen farmers who sell pastured pork at farmers' markets in the region, only one – an African American ... – grew up raising hogs. Another hog farmer raises pigs on land ... that was used to raise tobacco almost exclusively until the 1990s ... The rest of the ['real'] hog farmers are first-generation farmers, almost all of whom moved to North Carolina from points north (p. 138).

In other words, niche-market pasture-raised real pig farmers are predominantly white first-generation farmers who moved into the area – a phenomenon noted elsewhere by other authors. Although Weiss sympathetically, yet objectively, discusses class and race issues surrounding pork production in North Carolina, he also notes that when it comes to real pigs, the African American farmers who raise pigs almost always either do so strictly for their own families' subsistence or, more commonly, do so only on a part-time basis (p. 14).

Chapter 2 takes up the question of terroir – the interconnections of taste and local place – while chapter 4 examines butchery, including the problems of legally disassembling a hog carcass for sale to the public. Chapter 5 discusses the quality of taste and, in particular, 'the *flavor* of pork fat as a way of exploring the important sensuous experiences of eating' (original emphasis), a discussion that adds ethnographic porcine richness to Michael Moss's penetrating analysis of the subject in *Salt, sugar, fat* (2013). Weiss's final ethnographic chapter 6 discusses key issues related to his prominent concepts of 'authenticity' and 'connection' in the world of pasture-raised pigs. He concludes by demonstrating how these concepts, as he had noted in his introduction, 'are woven through a much wider array of concerns in this [local] porcine network and beyond' (p. 11).

Brad Weiss does well what he intended to do: discuss the importance of real pigs to actual people. *Real pigs* is strongly recommended for readers who want to know about emerging specialized field-pastured hogs, and the cultural values associated with their localized breeding, raising, butchering, selling, and consuming. Readers interested in a more comprehensive picture of hog farming in America should, in addition, read *Hog ties* by Richard Horwitz (2002). Albeit written at a different time, Horwitz's book offers an interesting, important comparison and contrast to Weiss's. Readers with real porcine interests should in addition balance their readings with *Lesser beasts* by Mark Essig (2015), and *In meat we trust*, by Maureen Ogle (2013), the latter an attempt to straightforwardly put contemporary hog production into context by comparing it with the cattle and broiler (chicken) industries. In short, in tandem with the other works mentioned, Weiss's *Real pigs* provides a real picture of the real swine industry today.

Timothy G. Roufs *University of Minnesota Duluth*

Engaged anthropologies

lewallen, ann-elise. *The fabric of Indigeneity: Ainu identity, gender, and settler colonialism in*

Japan. xvii, 289 pp., plates, bibliogr. Santa Fe, N.M.: SAR Press, 2016. £45.95 (paper)

As a scholar who has been working with the Ainu people for approximately fifteen years, one question to which I have sought an answer for some time has been the ongoing dearth of more stringent demands for Indigenous rights from amongst the Ainu community. Some might venture that this is because the Ainu, who possess no legally defined territory per se, are an Asian people, and that, in comparison with other, Western settler colonial countries, as well as in terms of their relations with the surrounding majority *Wajin* Japanese, they exist in a less clear-cut, less polarized, bifocal social environment. This ambitious book, published by an Indigenous studies press, illustrates the historically repressive legal and social situation of the Ainu, while simultaneously providing an explanation for the Ainu movement's reticence, and offers a fascinatingly developed account of Ainu women's resistance to the Japanese colonial project.

As ann-elise lewallen emphasizes, passing as *Wajin* Japanese, for a variety of reasons, including perceived discrimination and other types of negative ascription (p. 3), is the preferred contemporary alternative for 90 per cent of those of Ainu descent. While lewallen's work remains silent as to the political ambitions of the remaining 10 per cent, she alternatively weaves a thoroughly convincing tale as to Ainu clothworkers' motivations, and to the benefits generated by the activities of these women as cultural bearers and artists in 'culturalizing' the political (p. 9).

The book's central claim is that Ainu women's maintenance of traditional values throughout colonial history, especially their upkeep of sacred relations with Ainu *kamuy* (spirits or deities) via the process of clothwork, enables a continuing and significant form of empowerment for the Ainu people. In inscribing genealogies onto cloth and injecting *ramat* (spirit) into these items, Ainu women are thereby inculcating Ainu values into their somatic memories, as well as achieving a reappropriation of state-regulated culture.

Indeed, the garments thus crafted by Ainu clothworkers for their loved ones in many cases end up serving as the regalia for Ainu delegates participating in international Indigenous political gatherings such as those occurring at the United Nations. Ainu women are thus ultimately serving to culturalize the political. In this way, and in using the traditional as a base from which to explore newer, more contemporary forms of expression, they are contesting state definitions of what counts as culture, and fulfilling their role as 'Indigenous moderns'. However, with recent increases in recalcitrant hate speech, this non-verbal discourse is one which recent Japanese politicians and the 'Net Far Right' would seek to deny. Ultimately, lewallen concludes that policy support for Ainu agency – including cultural praxis – remains an unresolved and pressing issue. With legislation to define Ainu Indigenous policy slated for implementation in the next two years, this message is one which takes on critical urgency.

Importantly, in chapter 3, lewallen details how, against a background of the state management of Ainu identity through blood-based discourses, Ainu kinship-making, which traditionally had been looser and more inclusive, has come to be threatened, even amongst the Ainu themselves, by biological perceptions of identity. In light of the imminent codification of Ainu legal rights, lewallen follows admonitions by Indigenous scholars Kim Tall Bear and Kēhaulani Kauanui in cautioning against the drawbacks of blood identification (see p. 116).

Scholars of Indigenous studies may find similar important parallels between lewallen's book and recent critical publications by Indigenous feminist scholars (e.g. A. Smith, *Conquest: sexual violence and American Indian genocide*, 2015), as well as with work on the systemic suppression carried out against Ainu women described in her short history in chapter 4 (see especially P. Wolfe, 'Settler colonialism and the elimination of the native', *Journal of Genocide Research* **8: 4**, 2006). Readers interested in the materiality of culture may find lewallen's account of Ainu choices towards repatriation of their heritage items housed in museums thought-provoking; her description of how Ainu have differed from Indigenous peoples of the Pacific Northwest by not seeking repatriation provides a compelling alternative account of Indigenous patrimony.

While those seeking a detailed anthropological or ethnological account of the Ainu may be disappointed with the lack of an overall picture of current Ainu demographics, or the relative absence in lewallen's manuscript of other forms of ethnographic description, these can be found instead in other works by her listed in the bibliography. Through this ground-breaking book, lewallen has proffered a timely and richly crafted contribution to the important debate on gender and Indigeneity, one which should provoke lively discussion amongst those researching Indigenous peoples.

Jeffry Joseph Gayman *Hokkaido University*

Shneiderman, Sara. *Rituals of ethnicity: Thangmi identities between Nepal and India*. xvii, 305 pp., illus., bibliogr. Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2015. £57.00 (cloth)

In *Rituals of ethnicity*, Sara Shneiderman explores the Thangmi people's culture and society through an ingenious pincer movement. In an account spread across ethnographic sites in Dolakha district (Nepal) and Darjeeling (India), with a few way-points in-between, Shneiderman reveals the diverse dynamics in the Thangmis' own curiosity as to who they are, and what matters to them. This stems from the differently situated political economic niches they occupy in Nepal – as marginal cultivators and performers of symbolically 'tribal' roles within regional rituals of an archaic ethnic and caste hierarchy – as compared to India, where generations of migrants (many as tea plantation workers) have formed associations that have pursued recognition in the eyes of the Indian state as a Scheduled Tribe, authenticated by culturally distinct customary practices, thereby entitling them to benefits.

This two-sited ethnography explores how mutual interests and tensions coalesce around the social production of culture. It explores alternative politics of difference concerning inequality and status symbolism under two different state logics of recognition and socioeconomic mobility. It is also intriguing that Shneiderman conducted fieldwork, with her companion ethnographer Mark Turin, during the Maoist insurgency (1996-2006). Consequently, included amongst the participants in the exchanges and debates among the Thangmi that they witnessed were local and national actors who were explicitly critiquing the terms of oppression that their people had endured since their first mention centuries ago in the Dolakha palace archives.

So what distinguishes the Thangmi? Shneiderman answers this question with scholarly sensitivity. In general, Himalayan ethnic and linguistic groups need to be understood as variations on a number of themes, which any particular group will recombine from the transformational whole (as per Lévi-Strauss on Amerindian mythology). A key element of the Thangmis' identity is their oral tradition. Unlike the neighbouring Tamang, for whom the tension between Buddhist textuality and shamanic orality is the central conundrum of collective multiplicity, the Thangmi had no literate authority. This makes it all the more intriguing that the Darjeeling-based seekers of cultural authentication are constantly in the business of textualizing and 'videoalizing' ritual practices and origin myths. The Thangmi gurus' version of their cosmic origin is similar to that of neighbouring shamanic traditions. In this originary account, humans are created not from solid materials such as metals, but from ashes and chicken droppings. (This section would have benefited from discussing Gregory Mascarinec's *Rulings of the night*, 1995, which sources shamanic cosmology to the *Kami* blacksmiths.)

Thangmi origins stories also share a mothering cow with their neighbours' myths of ethnogenesis. The various categories of Nepalese ethnic society formed around her distributed corpse, and the charter for the Thangmis' orality is that they consumed the sacred texts that emanated from the cow's entrails. Shneiderman observes that the gurus were unable to tell these tales without falling into a trance. It is this irresistible power of oral culture that then infuriates the Darjeeling cultural codifiers, who want a stabilized cultural output (rather than spontaneously improvised myth) when attempting to register as legitimately different, and thus validate their claims to exceptional forms of citizenship in India.

The book provides some genuinely provocative insights, yet certain questions arise over Thangmi sociality in Nepal. The idea that they have 'parallel descent' and that people are not too sure about their clan affiliation until they are forced to determine this before marrying needs much better explanation. The everyday flow of terms of address, of conveying respect or engaging in joking relations, of identifying coparceners of land and property, or of routine co-operation, are not explored or discussed in relation to the extensive literature on gender politics and affinal hierarchies among neighbouring ethnic groups. This may be connected to Thangmis' sense of being exploited by higher castes. We are told that the Thangmi had *kipat* (communal land rights), but this is not explored in any depth or discussed in relation to Lionel Caplan's important theorization of eastern Nepal's *kipat* as territories of political autonomy, rather than necessarily clan entitlement ('From tribe to peasant?', *Journal of Peasant Studies* **18: 2**, 1991).

By the book's end, we arrive at the cessation of Nepal's People's War and subsequent attempts to find multicultural forms of recognizing difference in Nepal's new republican guise, for which international donors promoting peace funded ethnic associational activities. Within this framework, we learn of the many levels at which culture draws people's attention, and, even if sometimes Shneiderman suggests that there is something abstractly called 'Thangminess', we

are confronted with competing ideologies of what people want this to be through rich and ethnographically convincing arguments.

Ben Campbell *University of Durham*

Sillitoe, Paul (ed.). *Indigenous studies and engaged anthropology: the collaborative moment*. 266 pp., illus., bibliogrs. Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, 2015. £65.00 (cloth)

Long ago I learned not to introduce myself to Canadian Indigenous peoples as an anthropologist: the word was invariably met by genuine hostility. In response to the repudiation of anthropology by many Indigenous communities and the rise of Indigenous studies in opposition to such Western disciplines, some scholars have endeavoured to maintain the utility and validity of engaged (sometimes called public, or applied) anthropology as a set of methodologies and perspectives that might support Indigenous communities, while being in dialogue with Indigenous studies scholars.

This wide-ranging collection by a diverse group of authors aims to explore recent intersections of engaged anthropology and Indigenous studies. The essays range geographically across South America, the Pacific, and parts of Africa, and include Indigenous, as well as non-Indigenous, scholars who have worked with and for Indigenous communities. Amongst others they include Theodossopoulos's account of becoming an engaged anthropologist among the Emberà (chap. 2); Calabrò's story of being an Italian anthropologist in a Maori setting (chap. 3); Sandri's discussion of situatedness amidst very complex identity politics (chap. 4); Cervone's considerations of what 'decolonized collaboration' might mean (chap. 5); Linstroth's reflection on doing urban anthropology with Amerindians in Manaus (chap. 6); and a Ghanian scholar-chief, George Dei, on African proverbs and their use in educational contexts (chap. 9). Collectively, the essays give a solid history of engaged anthropology with its methodologies and tensions, as well as discussing the concept of, and discourses on, Indigeneity, although, oddly the case studies omit developments in North America, particularly Canada, where the discourse of Indigeneity and the practice of engaged anthropology both have an especially strong presence. Nevertheless, the volume's essays are valuable in understanding the range of contexts, perspectives, and issues involved in this very politicized branch of the discipline and its Indigenous counter-currents.

Sillitoe's otherwise useful overview of issues in this complex set of intersecting fields is stilted when examining the definition of the term 'Indigenous', which is explored with more nuance in several of the essays. The introduction omits mention of the UN Working Group on Indigenous Peoples' definition of the term, while at the same time bringing the concept of English indigeneity into play (p. 8), but also fails to explain why that right-wing English claim doesn't work with the UN definition, or why such groups might wish to claim Indigeneity. Equally, Theodossopoulos's discussion of Indigenous education rather awkwardly suggests that we 'imagine seminars where it is necessary to undergo aspects of Aranda initiation to understand human-environment relations the Desert Aborigine way' (p. 20), seemingly unaware that there have been numerous university-accredited courses in Canada since the early 1980s which are taught by Indigenous peoples about Indigenous culture with a distinctly culture-based mode of teaching, often taking students onto the land, involving them in ceremonies, subsistence activities, and doing PAR (Progressive Aboriginal Relations) for Indigenous communities. The volume also lacks a strong overview of what a critical Indigenous studies perspective on engaged anthropology might look like from a faculty member in such a department, although there are strong glimpses of this in several contributions, and it is especially considered in Settee's chapter 10.

Related to such issues is the bigger question of whether, as Cervone asks, it is actually possible 'to produce an alternative anthropological knowledge that is not linked to the theoretical debates and purposes that historically have oriented this discipline' (p. 103). How do these different discourses connect? Indeed, do they? In some ways, this is a book about engaged anthropology as it exists in relation to Indigenous communities, rather than a dialogue between Indigenous studies and engaged anthropology as parallel academic disciplines. Important here is Calabrò's comment that 'when Māori and I talked about anthropology, we would often talk past each other, our perceptions of anthropology being related to distinct pasts and distinct presents' (p. 62).

Read this volume for its excellent coverage of a complex and intriguing set of conversations, methodologies, processes, and political contexts relating to a certain kind of anthropology, its engagements with Indigenous communities, and modes of inquiry. Read it for the passion with which its authors recall their fieldwork

experiences, but read it also with an ethnographic eye and watch people talking past each other.

Laura Peers *University of Oxford*

Eventful selves

Littlewood, Roland & Rebecca Lynch (eds). *Cosmos, gods and madmen: frameworks in the anthropologies of medicine*. vi, 214 pp., bibliogrs. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2016. £67.00 (cloth)

This volume's essays engage with the intersection of the cosmological and the medical. Religious communities are shown offering a number of responses to illness and suffering: providing a complicated community of support as in Lange's examination of the Christian communities that assist people who have received care from travelling evangelical surgery ships in Benin (chap. 5); promising access to healing resources and rituals as do some new healing communities in the United States that can re-create the very problems associated with addiction that they were meant to solve (E. Reynolds, chap. 6); or by providing spiritual solace and, of course, the promise of a miracle, as in R. Reynolds' consideration of the relationship that must be cultivated between Catholic believers and Panama's Black Christ (chap. 2). However, what are we to do with the relationship between the cosmological and suffering when, as a result of globalization, the number of both spiritual and healing frames begins to spread beyond the local context, becoming detached from expectations of 'the normal' and offering an ever-expanding palette of choices and alternatives? This is the question being addressed by the authors of this interesting edited volume.

The theme of disordered, overflowing religious and medical landscapes is prevalent throughout the collection. Orr's chapter 7 examines how the increasing presence of Protestant churches in post-conflict Peru signalled a special challenge to mental health care in that 'the evangelical offer of healing entered a field already saturated with [Catholic] religious frameworks for action in the face of illness' (p. 140). Read's analysis in chapter 3 of attempts to seek care for mental illness in Ghana also sees a context where 'in a pluralistic healing landscape . . . there is always the possibility of finding someone who possesses a greater power' (p. 59) to help the sufferer.

If the essays in this volume scrutinize examples of fields saturated with healing options, they are also fields saturated with disparate cosmological frameworks. Littlewood and Lynch, in the volume's introduction, see the study of cosmologies as capable of incorporating both the divine and the secular. Cosmologies 'are not fixed and unchanging notions but often made up of patchy concepts, polytheistic fragments, sometimes contradictory, not always acted upon and not always clearly defined with the culture itself' (p. 2). This encourages engaging with political economic meanings and material realities that often entwine in spiritual engagements with suffering and healing. This point is critical for understanding Armstrong's chapter 4 on 'Sakawa' – gangs of youths in Ghana who are rumoured to participate in illicit witchcraft and sacrifice in order to gain the power to manipulate Internet users into falling for on-line scams. She explores cosmologies that reveal how both literal bodies (the increasingly corrupted bodies of the Sakawa youth) and the Ghanaian state's metaphorical body become intertwined in this millenarian moment. Similarly, the concept of cosmology is essential to Littlewood's chapter 9, which examines how political, economic, and spiritual beliefs in Haiti combine to transform certain people with unrecognized mental illness into zombies. Thus 'cosmology' serves to capture the pluralistic nature of the ethnographic case studies: the global and the local, the new and the old, the emergent and the traditional.

Additionally, the volume's chapters reveal unresolved tensions in anthropology's search for functional interconnections between the cosmological/spiritual and illness/healing. For some, like Lynch (chap. 8), the cosmological becomes an ever-expanding, nearly all-inclusive change in the *zeitgeist* that includes everything from the emergence of a Western, Cartesian notion of the self in the sixteenth century to (mis)perceptions of risk, leading to the increasing medicalization of anxiety in contemporary society. Dein's chapter 10 advocates for an interpretation of schizophrenia from the standpoint of evolutionary psychology in order to argue that religious and cosmological thought is evolutionarily tied to the condition. Napier's contribution argues that the focus on certain kinds of cosmological perspectives – especially those that are broadly seeking to capture both the local tradition and the influence of the global – has the potential to reject animistic thinking and uniquely different forms of personhood (chap. 1). Indeed, it might be argued that Napier is writing in opposition to the theme of overflowing cosmologies and forms of suffering/healing, providing a cautionary narrative about the possibilities of being blinded

by the grand narratives that seek the shared commonalities across time and space.

One word of caution: despite the word 'madmen' in the title, only a few of the essays contribute much to transcultural psychiatry, psychiatric anthropology, or clinical ethnography. Indeed, even the contributions aimed at advancing the anthropology of medicine are, at best, uneven. However, if you are interested in a balanced examination of religious/spiritual/cosmological and medical/suffering/illness themes, then this volume will provide a useful springboard into novel ways of approaching their intersection.

Jack R. Friedman *University of Oklahoma*

Schechter, Kate. *Illusions of a future: psychoanalysis and the biopolitics of desire*. viii, 277 pp., bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2014. £14.99 (paper)

Illusions of a future is an ethnography of psychoanalysis as a domain of theoretical, institutional, and clinical practice in Chicago from the early twentieth century to the present. In a keenly observed and elegantly written account, Schechter traces the history of this psychoanalytic training milieu through the emergence of key figures; the influence they exerted through psychoanalytic training on subsequent generations of practitioners; and the progressive institutionalization of the discipline against the backdrop of momentous shifts in the political economy of health care provision in the United States.

A key paradox structures Schechter's analysis: how to make sense of the existence of psychoanalysts without patients? In other words, how can the robust sense of professional identity held by Chicago psychoanalysts be reconciled with their experience of a structural dearth of patients and sense of deep crisis in their field? Schechter brilliantly contextualizes the intertwined discourses of scarcity and crisis, carefully accounting for their production, whilst also tracing how they function epistemologically to craft and orientate the workings of this psychoanalytic epistemic community.

In contrast to France, Argentina, and elsewhere, in the United States, psychoanalysis expanded as part of, and not independently from, medicine. In the second half of the twentieth century, Schechter shows how psychoanalysis was progressively folded into the health insurance industry and government-funded schemes such as Medicaid and Medicare. The resulting expansion of the sector, however, exacerbated some contradictions tied to the standards of training set by US psychoanalysts' professional organization, the American Psychoanalytic Association. The increasing reliance on insurance and government funding elicited new demands for accountability and auditing. More fundamentally, it engendered a reframing of the 'standards' of psychoanalytic training. Debates over the appropriate frequency of sessions generated schisms between those intent on protecting Freud's legacy and the tradition of sessions four to five times a week, and those conceding to less intensive arrangements. The debate over session frequency connects to a central dispute between those defining psychoanalytic theory and practice in terms of the analysis of transference, and thus defending the analyst's detachment; and a new constituency of practitioners in psychotherapy – a more applied field, less stringently committed to Freudian precepts and grounded in an understanding of the analyst/patient relation as one based on empathy, dialogue, and mutuality. Schechter subtly points to the gendered politics inherent in this boundary work and the progressive 'de-medicalization and feminization' of the profession brought on by new training routes open to those not medically qualified and drawn from other professions, notably social work (p. 25).

Schechter carefully charts the schisms in the history of Chicago psychoanalysis, whilst also considering the theoretical implications of ensuing bifurcations and impasses. In the light of Derrida's understanding of psychoanalysis not as unified domain, but rather as a set of 'resistances' – including the resistances to analysis – outlined in his *Resistances of psychoanalysis* (1998), Schechter shows how failure is constitutive of, and not external to, the field itself. Further, the author skilfully connects the tensions between visions of a pure intensive psychoanalysis of transference and a relational empathetic psychotherapy to a context in which practitioners, regardless of theoretical leanings and genealogies of training, engage in ever more precarious and marketized forms of affective labour. The ethnographer shows how individual practitioners are caught between the desire for autonomy and the pragmatics of flexibility, as they increasingly struggle with, and adapt to, neoliberal rationales where risk has to be reframed as an opportunity (p. 178); crisis turns into cruel optimism (see also L. Berlant, *Cruel optimism*, 2011); and the demands of auditing regimes into illusions of a future.

Illusions of a future is a sophisticated and nuanced ethnography of the Chicago psychoanalytic milieu that charts its complex and fraught history, one which gave rise to neoliberal psychoanalysis. The book is an important addition to the anthropology of audit cultures and epistemic communities. It will be read alongside other anthropological analyses of the histories of psychiatry and psychoanalysis (e.g. D. Fassin & R. Rechtman, *The empire of trauma*, 2009; T.M. Luhrmann, *Of two minds*, 2001). Deflecting Foucault's somewhat monolithic rendition of psychoanalysis and following instead Derrida's emphasis on the resistances constitutive of the field, the book places psychoanalysis firmly within biopolitics. Beyond anthropology, this intervention will be of interest to a broad interdisciplinary constituency and open up new avenues for analysis and critiques of contemporary life.

Silvia Posocco *Birkbeck, University of London*

Schillmeier, Michael. *Eventful bodies: the cosmopolitics of illness*. 187 pp., bibliogr. Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, 2014. £60.00 (cloth)

What would it mean to understand illness not as an unfortunate physiological catastrophe, but instead as a powerful political event that destabilizes and rearranges social relations? This is the question behind Michael Schillmeier's *Eventful bodies*, a sensitively rendered account of 'forgetting', 'stroked', and 'infectious' bodies in Western/European contexts and the relationships they dis-order. In this book, illness is defined as 'cosmopolitical' because 'the "cosmos" of social realities before and after such bodily events differs significantly' (p. 1). This eventfulness is special because ill bodies 'unbutton social normalcy' (p. 1), in the process making visible the simultaneously institutional and affective devices upon which social orderings depend. Relying largely on secondary material analysed qualitatively and separated into three parts, the book urges a new approach to thinking about what it means to care for non-normative bodies and minds.

Part 1, 'Forgetting bodies', focuses on how dementia illuminates the troublesome 'disregard of non-knowledge' (p. 38) implicit in Western/European cultural models. Bodies with dementia subvert the Kantian legacy of equating morality with rational thought. Dementia is a cosmopolitical event and people with dementia are cosmopolitical agents because they emphasize that it is not reason and logical order which necessitate the capacity to remember, but the affective care work of being with others within networks that builds social worlds.

Part 2, 'Stroked bodies', continues in this vein with Schillmeier's exploration of how the body after a stroke exposes the limits of standardized packages of care. One stroked body might need something very different than another – their care requires modification and attention, highlighting how our embodied selves are 'on-going collective achievements of humans and things that need caring relations in order to feel at home' (p. 123), not cookie-cutter approaches.

'Infectious bodies', part 3, urges the reader to consider SARS (Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome) as a social process, rather than a disembodied idea of an exterior infectious agent attacking the social. SARS subverts our expectations of order as being something we can regulate. The nonhuman infectious agent travels through human networks and reminds us that 'we neither live in a human controlled cosmos, nor does the cosmos of life resemble the morality of nature as harmonious' (p. 133).

Taken together, these different 'bodies' show us that a person with an illness or infectious agent cannot integrate within the social order because he or she undoes social ordering itself. In my reading, I was excited by the potential of Schillmeier's methodology to join actor-network approaches with political-economic analyses. His use of cosmopolitics to refute the symbolic biopolitics of illness as a 'crisis' could help to upset the orderings of value present in life sciences capitalisms. For example, the assumption that illness must be eradicated and we must trust current economic arrangements to 'save lives' through 'innovation' could be rendered less powerful by reframing illness as cosmopolitical. That said, scholars in disability studies, feminist theorists, and anthropologists of illness and care already have been reframing illness and non-normative bodies in this way for a long time. However, with his formulation of cosmopolitics, Schillmeier offers us another rigorous and philosophically grounded analytic to both think with and use.

The book's argument is occasionally repetitive, and requires previous knowledge of pragmatism and the other traditions upon which it calls. The intellectual genealogy of 'cosmopolitics' and the implications of Schillmeier's adaptation could have been more clearly described. I would have liked to have seen more justification of why these theoretical devices, and not others, were the right tools for the job. For these reasons, the text may

have limited teaching utility unless for a very specialized graduate student audience. The third section of the book also did come across as somewhat 'tacked on' at the end – an appendage to prove that the author understands that it is not only humans who can have agency. The abrupt shift from ill bodies to infectious agents felt, to use a pertinent term, disembodied. Where does the human end and the nonhuman begin? If infections like SARS have agency, might the processes of cell death in dementia and blood blockages in stroke have cosmopolitical agency too?

These limitations aside, the book makes a meaningful contribution. Schillmeier creates space for a deeper look at how different 'bodies' disrupt homogenized categorizations of experience, reinvigorating processual accounts of the social. Further, he provides an analytical pathway out of 'suffering slot' anthropology (J. Robbins, 'Beyond the suffering subject', *JRAI* **19: 3**, 2013) by honouring those bodies for the cosmopolitical work that they do, rather than creating endless volumes on how we should feel 'pity' for them.

Marlee McGuire *University of British Columbia*

Scubla, Lucien (trans. M.B. Debevoise). *Giving life, giving death: psychoanalysis, anthropology, philosophy*. xiv, 367 pp., figs, bibliogr. East Lansing: Michigan State Univ. Press, 2016. $29.95 (paper)

Lucien Scubla's impressive *Giving life, giving death* is a rich, complex piece of scholarship. Its explicit theme is the way in which maternity – women's unique ability to create new life – has been dealt with, or, rather, has often been strikingly neglected, in anthropological (and other) theorization: 'Even though everyone knows that women bring children into the world and that men do not, not only the human sciences but modern Western thought as a whole, to which these sciences give expression, are determined to ignore this female prerogative and the original asymmetry of the sexes' (p. x). Scubla's detailed analysis of the anthropological, psychoanalytic, and structuralist thought surrounding (and often ignoring) this 'fundamental and primary asymmetry' (p. 110) extends to a more general exploration of the significance of our interpretation of the relationship between nature and culture for our understanding of human lives and their social structures.

The specific topics discussed in this broad, deep study range from family and ritual to violence and death, to classical scholarly concepts such as the Oedipus complex, as well as to various related matters that need to be addressed not only by cultural anthropologists, but also by basically everyone within the humanities and social sciences. The works critically examined include modern classics by Freud, Girard, Lacan, and Lévi-Strauss, as well as texts by theorists who are best known in France, such as Françoise Héritier and Alain Testart. It should be noted that the relatively large number of individual scholars and ideas commented on, often in great detail, leads to some compromises with the discussion's clarity and coherence; Scubla constantly moves from considering one figure to interpreting another in a way that occasionally blurs the narrative. In brief, the argument's structure could have been a bit more clearly organized. It also would have been helpful to have had a proper concluding chapter that summarized the central findings.

Readers may agree with Scubla that it is 'futile to deny the existence of a distinctively human nature and to set the given against the constructed' (p. 16). It is, precisely, a 'given' basic biological fact about our 'nature' that women bring children into the world (p. 54) – it is not just a social construct, as he repeatedly reminds us (p. 101). Thus, when criticizing (with good reason) naïve constructionism, Scubla is in the end engaged in something like philosophical anthropology based on his interpretations of anthropology's empirical data. A key question in this philosophical endeavour is how exactly the relation between nature and culture ought to be conceptualized as a factor shaping human lives. Clearly, culture, whatever it is and means, is a product of human nature – but we should not forget that, conversely, what human nature is and means for us is conditioned by culture. In order to investigate such philosophical issues more deeply, Scubla could have explored in some detail themes now only relatively quickly touched upon: for example, the distinction between relativism and evolutionism in anthropology or the question of whether culturally universal traits are either nomologically necessary or historically contingent (pp. 98-9).

While the 'opposition of nature to culture' may seem to have been 'naïvely adopted by professors of philosophy' and may have become 'one of the intellectual reflexes of all decent people, or more exactly of all half-educated people' (p. 157), this is only a partial truth. There have certainly been major figures in twentieth- and twenty-first-century philosophy who have *not* naïvely adopted any such dogma. For example,

the American pragmatists never endorsed it, but instead developed philosophical anthropologies to overcome it. This philosophical orientation is neglected: the non-reductive naturalisms or naturalized culturalisms proposed by philosophers like John Dewey would have added a valuable perspective on the ideas and arguments Scubla explores. Nonetheless, he is certainly right to remind us that the prevalence of the nature-culture dualism has not only scientific but also political and religious background influences (p. 161) – and that it has contributed to what he takes to be a widespread neglect of the fundamental difference between the sexes (p. 164).

Given how vitally important the conceptualization of the nature-culture relationship is for the understanding of the nature, methodology, and very aims of all the human sciences – and more generally any inquiry into human life – it would have been interesting to learn what Scubla might have had to say about those philosophers who have explicitly denied any fundamental dichotomy between nature and culture. At any rate, this book is to be warmly recommended to anyone interested in serious inquiry into the nature of humanity.

Sami Pihlström *University of Helsinki*

Tapias, Maria. *Embodied protests: emotions and women's health in Bolivia*. 160 pp., map, illus., bibliogr. Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 2015. £20.99 (paper)

In this short ethnographic book, Maria Tapias focuses on the multi-layered effects of a neoliberal agenda enacted throughout the 1990s in Bolivia. This research could be taken as an exemplar of the impact of neoliberalism in other Andean countries (one aspect being the dollarization of the economy). Through an ethnographic focus on Punata, a town close to Cochabamba, Tapias explores the effects of failing economic policies on the shaping of gender and womanhood. One of the central questions she addresses is why, in conditions of economic hardship and recession, certain working-class communities tend to do better than expected. The answer is that women perform a wealth of emotional labour in conditions of economic scarcity and distress, thus understanding this reveals how various types of socialities and reciprocal relations may (or may not) mitigate economic hardship.

The possibility of surviving financial instability depends on a delicate crafting of social selves, and the constant recalibration of the self within mutual expectations. Classic forms of support such as *compadrazgo* (the relationship between godparents) may still be at play, but everyday anxieties about generating a decent livelihood take their toll on, and acquire a language through, women's bodies and their affliction. Tensions between co-operative emotional ties and (un)reciprocal emotional relations highlight how emotional labour is critical to understanding the containment of economic hardship as well as households' fragmentations and the emergence of wider ethnic and racial conflicts. Where other analyses of precarity have dwelt on social behaviour (e.g. alcoholism), Tapias focuses on illness through the lens of kinship, which is here foregrounded as the exchange of fluids, substances, foods, and, ultimately, 'emotions', so as to highlight how economic hardship affects bodily conditions and relations. There is indeed a bodily fluidity to an economy of hardship and loss.

In anthropology, we have known for a number of years that precariousness can be studied as a translocal phenomenon and as an effect of late capitalist formations. Thus the analysis of the embodiment of emotions and the relationality in which they are enmeshed in Punata could be read as one more example in a conversation about the differences and resonances in an anthropology of insecurity. Ethnographically speaking, Tapias examines different moments, emotional outbursts, repressions, and ongoing tensions that are (or are not) translated into a local language of sicknesses. Debility as well as the recognition of a character's strength become the bedrock on which to build an understanding of why, while experiencing economic hardship, certain people are more adversely affected than others. It is not merely psychological resilience, but rather the capacity for relationality and sharing one's anxieties that provide a more informative spectrum on the *affectus economicus*. *Salir adelante* (to succeed/pull it off) is not only an individual but also an (un)reciprocal affair – it always has a social cost in a wider social network.

Thus, under the conditions of economic instability, the ability to share suffering with others is what makes for precarity's differential impact. Women's capacity to deal with emotions, debility, and loss – especially in market relations – can never be fully described by referring to their individual agency, but rather must include the constant bodily (re)crafting of reciprocal relations. Women may search for respite, undertake pilgrimages together, or seek saintly protection, while also asking that their economic endeavours be blessed. Hence, there is always a tension between the personal orientation for

improvement and self-advancement and a collectively understood network of reciprocity. The ongoing mastery and negotiation of social suffering shape females' (un)successful capacity to deal with the local effects of neoliberal policies. The concealment of, and secrecy about, emotions, not only in Bolivia, but also in transnational Bolivian migrant itineraries in Spain, is the angle that Tapias opens up to ethnographic inquiry.

The strength of *Embodied protests* is its ethnographic richness. Emotions can be charged, they can be transformed, and they have an effect on the *oikonomia* (household management) and on kin's lives. Perhaps if the author could have embraced the wealth of gendered studies on affects, affective labour, and the political economy of dispossession, we could see how this Bolivian material speaks to a wider debate on the transmission of affects and an anthropology of precarity – but that would have been a different narrative. This is a book of interest to students of gender and Latin America, medical anthropology, and kinship and the market.

Valentina Napolitano *University of Toronto*

Formations of knowledge

Gledhill, John (ed.). *World anthropologies in practice: situated perspectives, global knowledge*. xxiii, 233 pp., figs, bibliogrs. London: Bloomsbury, 2016. £64.99 (cloth)

The present volume serves as a benchmark for the recognition and coalescence of a multiplicity of anthropological traditions. In his editor's introduction, John Gledhill reviews disciplinary decentralization over recent decades within, perhaps paradoxically, an organizational framework of expanding regional and international collaboration. He cites João de Pina-Cabral on the resulting intellectual cross-fertilization that breaks down boundaries and generates welcome elements of a more unified world anthropology (in the singular). Preliminary commentaries and the substantive chapters build on previous collections that compare historically dominant approaches (F. Barth, R. Parkin, A. Gingrich & S. Silverman, *One discipline, four ways*, 2010) and demonstrate the complementarity of a wider diversity of anthropological perspectives (A. Boškovic*, Other people's anthropologies,* 2008; G.L. Ribeiro & A. Escobar, *World anthropologies*, 2006).

Case studies were selected from over a thousand papers presented at the 2013 Congress of the International Union of Anthropological and Ethnological Sciences. The World Council of Anthropological Associations – which has spearheaded the 'world anthropologies' movement – played a prominent role in the programme, as did the Association of Social Anthropology, host of the Congress in Manchester, England. This publication is No. 52 in the ASA monograph series. The impossibility of a fully representative sampling of chapters led to selections 'that reflect particular concerns and vantage points but also address some cross-cutting themes and engage with contemporary issues' (p. 3). Beyond their loose grouping in four sections – crisis, mobility, cultural politics, and public issues – attentive readers can find serendipitous points of overlap and resonance that merit attention. Much of the collection's value derives from implicit comparisons and contrasts encountered through localized perspectives on globalization processes, pertaining simultaneously to the perspectives of the anthropologists themselves.

The first chapters cover labour struggles against neoliberal hegemony. Susana Narotzky (chap. 2) contextualizes the disenchantment generated by failed promises that had justified and supported the integration of the Spanish steel industry into the European Economic Community. Malikka Shakya's (chap. 3) double focus on unionized resistance by garment workers in Nepal and mine workers in South Africa reveals how different strategies derive from the trajectories of distinctive colonial pasts as well as current conditions.

Chapters pursuing a topic in two or more countries are among the most compelling. Maria Kastrinou and Robert Layton (chap. 9) show how both the Anangu in Australia and the Druze in Syria draw on reincarnation beliefs to establish claims to autonomous identity and rights as minority groups in nation-states. Within a framework of universal human rights, Shalina Mehta (chap. 8) addresses inflections of minority rights for Muslim women in India (her own country) and in Iran. Carmen Silvia Rial (chap. 5) identifies varying career paths of Brazilian football players, most of whom came from humble backgrounds, depending on whether they joined teams in African or Asian rather than European countries (where stars often had personal managers acting as cultural brokers) or the United States.

Two chapters emphasize confrontations implicating ethnicity, race, and/or class within a single country. Peter Redfield and Steven Robins (chap. 10) highlight inequities in South African

sanitation infrastructure development, where, instead of flush toilets, alternatives offered in poor neighbourhoods exacerbated social status distinctions. Paul Chambers, Napisa Waitoolkiat, and Srisompob Jitpiromsri (chap. 11) model possible forms of conflict resolution over terrorism and counter-terrorism in southern Thailand, where, in a strongly nationalist Buddhist country, the regional majority population is Muslim and Malay.

Cristina Amescua Chávez's (chap. 6) account of Mexican immigrants' adaptations of their holiday rituals and cuisine in Atlanta, Georgia, is one of three exploring manifestations of 'intangible culture'. Pan Shouyong (chap. 7) distinguishes several initiatives promoting local identities within an ambitious national programme to create new community museums throughout China. Hiroki Takakura (chap. 12) was called on to carry out disaster salvage anthropology in an area devastated by the Japanese earthquake and tsunami of 2011; local groups welcomed his folk culture heritage survey, which contributed to their personal and community rehabilitation. Winnie Lem (chap. 4) reinforces themes developed in the other contributions. Touching on the study of Chinese labour migration, she cautions scholars to resist co-optation by neoliberal paradigms in their analyses and interventions.

Current events will confirm the timeliness of the collection as a whole. To mention a few: the challenge to Spanish national interests by Catalonian separatism; the violent expulsion of the Rohingya from Myanmar; even broader attacks and displacements in Syria; and the intensifying environmental hazards and disasters in many parts of the world. In such situations, the problems people must overcome in generating power from below – to shape discourse as well as institutional change – also pertain to the work of anthropologists.

Jim Weil *Science Museum of Minnesota*

Roddick, Andrew P. & Ann B. Stahl (eds). *Knowledge in motion: constellations of learning across time and place*. viii, 309 pp., maps, illus., tables, plates, bibliogrs. Tucson: Univ. of Arizona Press, 2016. £59.95 (cloth)

Sometimes the usefulness of a book only comes to reveal itself over time. Initially circumspect about the contents of this volume, I have found myself turning to it repeatedly over the past year to explicate or reframe various questions I have been grappling with in my own research. Perhaps this is to be expected for a book on education theory and anthropology: the volume has much knowledge to impart, and we have much to learn.

This edited volume deals with the archaeological and anthropological implications of Jean Lave and Etienne Wenger's *Situated learning* (1991), which aims to examine how knowledge is perpetuated and exchanged through 'communities of practice'. The introductory chapter by Roddick and Stahl provides an excellent overview of Lave and Wenger's work and develops, in an anthropological context, Wenger's argument in his individual work, *Communities of practice* (1998). Importantly, their view of the utility of these educational theorists to the study of the manufacture of things and practices is not content to remain within the constructivist framework of much theorizing in archaeology and anthropology, but also usefully incorporates recent developments in actor-network theory. The ANT approach is, however, balanced against a focus on power and scale in most of the contributions in the volume.

Notable contributions include Olivier Gosselain's (chap. 1) discussion of African potting practices in the Niger River Area, which usefully employs an ethnographic informant's metaphor of knowledge as a 'beanstalk' that grows in several directions (p. 61). From this, Gosselain argues for a relational, but directional, approach to understanding potting traditions. Patricia Crown's (chap. 2) and Barbara Mills's (chap. 8) contributions also discuss pottery, both in the prehistoric Southwest of the United States. Mills also argues for a relational network approach to the practice of cuisine, while Crown intriguingly discusses the role of secrecy in the circumscribing and transmission of knowledge and technique amongst potters. Elliott Blair's chapter 3 examines how communities of consumption cohere with material patterns derived from analytical scientific techniques. His analysis of glass bead manufacture and distribution in seventeenth-century mission sites in Spanish Florida identifies key patterns in how beads of differing manufacture were used and consumed.

The volume offers a welcome intersection between education and anthropology, a topic that appears to be a growing area of interdisciplinary research (e.g. T. Ingold, *Anthropology and/as education*, 2017). Lave and Wenger's work has evident utility to anthropological research, but is now well established in educational circles. One wonders how a new generation of educational theorists, such as Elizabeth Ellsworth (*Places of learning*,

2005) and Anna Hickey-Moody and Tara Page (*Arts, pedagogy and cultural resistance*, 2015), influenced by the work of Gilles Deleuze, Elizabeth Grosz, and Judith Butler, might come to affect anthropological research. Also what of older educational theorists, such as John Dewey and Elliott Eisner? The intersection between education and anthropology is evidently of the moment, and has the potential to bear much fruit. This book paves the way for important new interdisciplinary directions.

Andrew Meirion Jones *University of Southampton*

The medium is the message

Edwards, Elizabeth & Christopher Morton (eds). *Photographs, museums, collections: between art and information*. xiv, 267 pp., figs, plates, bibliogrs. London: Bloomsbury, 2015. £24.99 (paper)

With this highly enjoyable volume, Elizabeth Edwards and Christopher Morton have opened a new field of inquiry: the history of photographic collections in museums. This history is currently lacking, as the editors explain in their introduction, owing to the particular status that photographs enjoy in museums. Part of larger mixed assemblages, photographs sit low in the hierarchy of museological values, and museums have not always treated their photographic collections with the same methodological rigour as other objects. Consequently, the histories of photographic collections have not been acknowledged. As the editors point out, in its thirty years of existence, the *Journal of the History of Collections* has not published a single paper on the collecting of photographs.

The history of photography in museum collections is not as straightforward a subject as one might think. Photographs have been collected as images, but as objects of knowledge they have also had a role supporting other collections in museums. This double function has complicated the histories of their collection, as photographs have often been archived for their role as 'evidence'. The entanglement of these histories – or double histories, as the editors call them – has been clouded even further by the fact that photographs' 'originality' has always been in question. Since photographs can be reproduced, they have been exchanged, copied, cropped, mounted in various incarnations, resulting in their multiple appearances in different assemblages. The curation of photographs should thus be understood as part of a wider institutional context and as part of the divergent histories of images and objects in institutions.

The thirteen essays that this volume presents are based on a wide variety of institutional collections, comprising science museums and art galleries across a wide geographical distribution, and are presented in clearly delineated sections. In the first section, on the history of collections, chapter 3 by Casey Riley on the Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum in Boston describes how its founder, Gardner, was preoccupied with her legacy. Ordering the photographer Thomas Marr to document the visual and spatial arrangements of this fine-art museum in a range of photo albums, Gardner ensured the maintenance of her bequest according to her wishes. The albums, initially exhibited in the museum, entered its archives in 1979, acting not only as a record of the institution's past, but also as a prospectus for its future preservation.

As we learn from various essays in the section 'Curatorial practices', photographs' social lives indeed are intertwined deeply with collections' histories and futures. Damarice Amao (chap. 13) writes about the Surrealist photographer Eli Lotar, best known for his series *Slaughterhouses of La Villette*, arguing that the photographer's status in the history of photography was contested as his career was considered inconsistent. However, when the Musée National d'Art Moderne, Centre Pompidou, acquired the artist's personal archive, including negatives, correspondence, and notebooks, it dedicated a 1993 solo exhibition to the artist and thereby canonized him as a significant photographer. Moreover, archiving approximately 6,000 negatives led the museum to rethink its curatorial role and it came to value, for the first time, the negative as an art object, thus rethinking the category of art itself.

Most essays in the volume carefully address the photograph as image and object, even if that double quality of the photograph has impeded its collection. In chapter 8, on Charles Darwin's correspondence, the authors Geoffrey Belknap and Sophie Defrance demonstrate that photographs served a dual purpose in his work. Darwin collected and exchanged photographs with academic colleagues, assembling and accumulating scientific evidence, as well as exchanging his portraits with them, thereby establishing a community of academic supporters. Yet whilst Darwin's letters have entered his archive, the photographs never were and are lost.

Photographs used to illustrate scientific theory often were classified with other evidence, rather than as part of photographic collections. As the

editors note, 'the majority of photograph collections do not have a clearly articulated and recognized history of collecting anchoring them to a long cultural tradition' (p. 18). Especially now that many photographic collections are digitized, sometimes for no other reason than they can be, the loss of their materiality will make it even harder to document their institutional histories. We can only hope that with so many histories yet to be documented, this volume will serve to encourage researchers to write these histories before they are effaced.

Ferdinand de Jong *University of East Anglia*

Friedman, May & Silvia Schultermandl (eds). *Click and kin: transnational identity and quick media*. viii, 248 pp., map, bibliogrs. Toronto: Univ. Press, 2016. £27.95 (paper)

This volume makes a bold promise that is of obvious appeal to the anthropological reader: to examine how the twin vectors of rapidly expanding transnationalism and social media use conjoin to affect people's experiences and negotiations of kinship across a range of different cultural contexts. In setting out their approach, editors Friedman and Schultermandl chiefly speak of kinship as a problem of identity, describing it as an 'unfolding series of dialogues, instead of a taken-for-granted and narrowly defined focus on family' (p. 8). They posit that the essays presented in their collection indicate how the increasingly mediated experience of transnationalism is having a destabilizing effect on views of identity as absolute and whole; against which they foreground the ways that family and individual identity is continually changing.

The lively collection of essays in the volume certainly demonstrate a fascinating diversity of different on-line contexts within which notions of kinship can be understood and applied. Chapters 1, 2, and 9, by Enriquez, Zarpour, and Ng respectively, are particular noteworthy in their approach to themes of migration, providing emotive and at times poignant accounts of the struggles in making sense of ideas of ancestry and belonging that are precipitated by extended periods spent in a third country.

Many chapters in this volume are written in an extremely personal, reflective, and auto-ethnographic style, which sees the authors explore their own changing identities, family relations, and experiences of migration. In this sense, many of the accounts of changing identity and kinship portrayed in this collection arguably represent constructions of kinship as they are experienced by highly mobile, erudite, and literate persons. It is reassuring, then, to see the editors balance these accounts with contributions that demonstrate transnational kinship as eminently constraining, such as Enriquez's chapter on how undocumented young Mexican adults in the United States experience having a clear family connection with Mexico impressed upon them by their relatives, despite holding little desire to return to their place of origin.

The editors' aspirations for alternative ways of thinking through kinship is, of course, most welcome. However, by defining kinship as chiefly an issue of identity, they perhaps inadvertently limit the scope for such alternative views, as kinship is rendered primarily a problem of self-definition. Anthropological readers, many of whom are likely to consider kinship to be a foundational domain of their discipline, may well find themselves desiring more acknowledgement of some of the key anthropological debates surrounding kinship which have occurred in recent decades. These have helped to throw wide open the possibilities of how kinship is conceptualized. Given the interdisciplinary nature of the volume and its contributors, this omission can largely be forgiven. Nonetheless, one wonders whether the work of scholars who have questioned the validity of kinship as a concept altogether (D.M. Schneider, *A critique of the study of kinship,* 1984), or proposed alternative ways of understanding it such as relatedness (J. Carsten, *After kinship,* 2004) might have helped to further facilitate the analysis of the fascinating and varied accounts of relationships presented in the volume. There seems to be particular potential for such discussion, given that many of the individual contributions (such as Obermayr and Atay's respective chapters 4 and 6 on same-sex relationships, and McKee's chapter 7 on Korean adoptees in America) are exactly the kinds of examples of non-conventional kinship forms that have been instrumental in pushing forward such debates.

A further point of interest is the editors' decision to avoid established and widely used definitions such as 'social media' or 'digital media' to delineate the communication technologies under study, instead introducing the notion of 'quick media', which they describe as a term for cheap and ubiquitous communications platforms. Friedman and Schultermandl argue that quick media differ from other technologies (such as email) by having simplified interfaces, as well as greater portability and transferability, but also rely on two persons using the same platform. As such, they claim quick media have 'tremendous

potential with respect to the self-definition of kinship' (p. 10). One of the interesting aspects of the concept is its foregrounding of the temporal aspect of mediated relations. Indeed, part of this volume's contribution may well be in helping to provoke future discussions of how media's temporal qualities coincide with the distinct trajectories of kinship in the contemporary world.

Tom McDonald *The University of Hong Kong*

Shankar, Shalini. *Advertising diversity: ad agencies and the creation of Asian American consumers*. 314 pp., tables, illus., bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2015. £21.99 (paper)

Reflecting on her research, Shalini Shankar observes that definitions and values regarding 'normal' ethnoracial representations had changed since her study began in 2008, and would continue to change after its publication. She might not have expected these to change quite as much as they have in such a short space of time. Writing during Obama's presidency, she notes that: 'In an era that the popular press has heralded and liberal academics have critiqued as "post-racial", the importance of race is thought to be declining' (p. 41). I read that line seven months into a new administration, in the wake of Charlottesville, and just as the chair of the UN's Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination called on the US Government 'to investigate thoroughly the phenomenon of racial discrimination targeting, in particular, people of African descent, ethnic or ethno-religious minorities, and migrants'. The current situation makes a thoughtful book about race in America all the more welcome.

Although Shankar focuses on Asian American advertising, her main title, *Advertising diversity*, suggests a broader outlook. Thus, the book explores the processes, relationships, and negotiations that lead to particular representations of race and ethnicity within commercially motivated communications. Readers interested in other categories of difference should find much of interest in her examination of 'ethnoracial assemblages' (p. 13) arising from constantly evolving, complex interactions between clients, agency personnel, actors, census and marketing data, speech, language and imagery, media, and consumers.

The book is organized into six chapters with titles referencing stages in advertising campaign development: the pitch, account planning, creative, account services, production and media, and audience testing. Each chapter begins with a vignette drawn from extended observations of one Asian American agency's work on a campaign targeting Chinese, Korean, and Asian Indian segments of the American market. Chapters then draw more broadly on fieldwork undertaken in New York, Chicago, Los Angeles, and San Francisco with large multinational agencies as well as smaller Asian American specialists. The agency material is supplemented by observations from industry events and the author's 'ethnotextual' (p. 31) analysis of advertisements that were discussed with her participants.

Shankar distinguishes between general market and 'multicultural' advertising, the latter referring not to the inclusion of multiple cultures in ads, but to the targeting of particular racial and ethnic groups – mainly African American, Latino, and Asian American – through content and media choices.

Although Asian Americans are by far the smallest of these minorities, representing around 5 per cent of the US population, Shankar traces their growing value to advertisers as a 'model minority' and as 'model consumers'. The book examines how agencies used US Census data to make the business case for targeting Asian American audiences in particular areas, and how Asian American agency staff constructed value for clients through their embodied, 'intuitive' expertise and distinctive social capital as well as their data-driven market knowledge.

Shankar explores the process of 'transcreation' (p. 35), an emic term encountered in several Asian American agencies that emphasizes that brand values designed for the general market are not simply *translated* for an Asian American audience, but involve *creation*, the tailoring of those values through in-culture and in-language advertising signs that will increase Asian American consumer identification with them. This process is vividly illustrated in the chapters on creative and account services, and in the discussion of casting issues in the production and media chapter.

Advertising diversity should speak to readers interested in race and how it is performed and represented in organizational and commercial contexts. Representations are well served by various images of Asian advertising, although I would have welcomed better-quality reproductions and/or URLs so readers could examine this material in more detail. Other books may offer deeper, more comprehensive ethnographic accounts of advertising agency practice within and beyond the United States; there is relatively little here on the pitching process, for example, and I found the treatment

of account planning relatively narrow. Nonetheless, Shankar offers some fascinating insights into advertising industry practices and relationships, particularly from the perspective of smaller, 'niche' agencies constantly compelled to argue the value of the market segments they serve. In this context, I was fascinated by this book's focus on telephone/conference calls rather than face-to-face meetings with clients, as this did not seem so pronounced in other accounts. Shankar notes that various meetings were 'above my security grade' (p. 33), and that she only managed to meet one client during an agency visit, but I could not help wondering whether the limited face-to-face contact she observed might in itself be a performance of the value clients placed on their Asian American markets and agencies.

Stephanie O'Donohoe *University of Edinburgh Business School*

Modernity and China

Engebretsen, Elisabeth L. & William F. Schroeder (eds). *Queer/Tongzhi China: new perspectives on research, activism and media cultures*. xiii, 274 pp., maps, bibliogrs. Copenhagen: NIAS Press, 2015. £32.00 (paper)

Tongzhi (comrade), the egalitarian honorific in socialist China, has in recent years become a self-affirming term for Chinese LGBT people. This usage is meant to replace both the more commonly used term *tongxinglian* (homosexual), which carries the stigma of both medical abnormality and moral deviance, and other negative, derogatory connotations used in a variety of local dialects. This new usage of *tongzhi* sometimes also serves as the Chinese translation of the English term 'queer', which, since the 1990s, has been reclaimed by LGBT activists and scholars as an empowering expression, although alternative translations of queer such as *Ku'er* (cool kids) also exist in Chinese.

Queer/Tongzhi China, edited by Elisabeth L. Engebretsen and Willam F. Schroeder, is a collection of essays, reports, and interviews on the current state of *tongzhi* communities in China. The contributors include activists, film-makers, and academic scholars from Europe, the United States, and China. Despite the uneven quality of individual contributions, together the essays raise serious questions about the translation between queer and *tongzhi*, both at the level of language and of social movement, while providing a complex picture of queer politics in contemporary China.

In this volume, the central questions that non-native anthropologists ask are as follows. Could Western-style queer activism, based on the politics of coming out, be used effectively in China? If Chinese *tongzhi* cannot come out as their Western counterparts do, is there queer activism in China? Where does the difference between China and the West lie?

Schroeder (chap. 4) argues that scholars should pay attention to the historical context in which different activities, strategies, and social organizations came into being, and avoid imposing Western standards of political activism on organizations in China. Based on his participatory observation, and taking into consideration the tight state control in China, where involvement in political movements could lead to criminal prosecution, he argues that even weekend recreational activities organized by a *tongzhi* social group bear the political potential to bring about a better future. While its members might insist on non-confrontational strategies and non-political positions, this social group makes a political difference through persistently creating alternative affective ties. In a thoughtful piece on her research on *lala* (lesbian, bisexual, and transgender women) life in Shanghai, Kam (chap. 10) observes that the meaning of marriage is very different from that in her native Hong Kong: 'The social expectation of marriage is much higher in China than in Hong Kong. Marriage effectively controls everyone and defines their social positions' (p. 187). These different social norms, Kam argues, 'give rise to different forms of activism' (p. 187). Engebretsen (chap. 6) uses three concrete examples of grassroots activism – a social gathering to celebrate the Stonewall anniversary in Beijing in 1996, Shanghai Pride in 2009, and a pride parade in Changsha in 2013 – to demonstrate how 'guerrilla'-style activism (as some Chinese queer activists describe it) has worked since the 1990s.

Huang (chap. 7) examines the nuanced differences between Chinese *lalas* who identified themselves as T and the transgender identity, and argues that Chinese *mianzi* (face) culture makes it possible for a T-*lala* to maintain a masculine masquerade without changing her inner self. *Mianzi* culture also requires her to maintain a flexible gendered appearance among her family members and in her work environment. After learning that the women she knew in the end decided not to transition, Huang contends that a T-*lala* should not be identified as transgender simply because of the Western

category, or for the benefit of queer activism. The *lala* community is much better off without making the distinction between T and transgender.

The chapters by activists and scholars based in China in this book present valuable and concrete accounts of how the flexible strategies have worked in publicizing LGBT issues and building up Chinese *tongzhi* communities. Deklerck and Wei (chap. 2) report on their own experience of creating 'Queer Comrade, China's only independent, long-running LGBT webcast' (p. 19), following the principle of focusing on positive LGBT images and insisting on approaches that avoid confrontation with the state authorities. Fan (chap. 5) explains how queer film-makers and film festival organizers circumvent government censorship. Fan's interview with Cui Zi'en in chapter 13 offers a valuable guide for understanding Cui's pioneering queer work in both film and literature. Using the example of the Chengdu Gay Care Organization, Wei Wei (chap. 11) describes how a grassroots queer community helped to raise HIV/AIDS awareness and prevention through working with international health groups.

Altogether, the collection is a resourceful guide for scholars interested in queer politics in contemporary China.

Wenqing Kang *Cleveland State University*

Hansen, Mette Halskov. *Educating the Chinese individual: life in a rural boarding school*. 222 pp., bibliogr. Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press, 2015. £35.84 (cloth)

Chinese education in the post-reform era has drawn much attention from the global community, yet relatively little fieldwork-based research has examined educational life within non-elite, mainstream rural high schools. Based on long-term fieldwork in a rural boarding school, *Educating the Chinese individual* presents a sophisticated ethnographic account of students' and teachers' lived experiences and how these are tied to broader processes during China's rapid social transformations. Mette Halskov Hansen explores educational discourses and practices related to the role of the individual, centring on one state school in Zhejiang province. Her central argument is that life in this rural boarding school reflects a particular type of individualization in contemporary China, namely, as her concluding chapter terms it, 'authoritarian individualization'. Essentially, the party-state promotes the rise of the individual in some spheres while retaining tight control over the individual in other spheres: the neosocialist individual who strives for success in the neoliberal economy while at the same time submitting to the authority of the state.

The chapters in this book reflect different research methodologies such as participant observation, textual studies, and interviews. Thus they present three perspectives on the processes of individualization within the context of this rural high school: '[T]he pre-sanctioned and official state vision and ideology of the individual; how individualization and unsanctioned views of the individual are in practice and implicitly taught; how individuals themselves respond to, and help create, processes of societal individualization' (p. 12). These chapters demonstrate how 'groups of people, such as administrators, teachers, students, and parents, ideally strive together toward the common goal of producing learned, competent, moral, and nationalist citizens' (p. 129).

The first chapter focuses on discipline and agency in the boarding school, through exploring how the physical environment, daily organization, and disciplinary techniques of the institution together create an educational space for producing an individual who adheres to rules and focuses on the one-and-only legitimate task: to study. Yet in this second-rate rural school in the rich coastal province of Zhejiang, rules and regulations are not strictly implemented, and students' agency also manifests in various ways: for example, by expanding individual space through new technologies and on-line communities.

Chapter 2 examines how ideals of the educated person and moral citizenship are taught, mainly in two courses, Language and Literature and Thought and Politics. The official curriculum promotes the ideal of the neosocialist individual who can act innovatively to thrive in the market economy while at the same time endorsing party-state rule and uniting in Chinese patriotism. Chapter 3 takes a close look at school organizational practices and student life, with a focus on exploring the tension between hierarchy and democracy through the examples of the cadre system and the student association. Both are typical institutions within contemporary Chinese schools that train students to become neosocialist citizens, and both are caught up in the dilemma of representing students' interests while also monitoring and disciplining students on behalf of the school authorities.

Chapter 4 examines the state school's fixation on personal achievement as an important part of cultivating neosocialist individuals. It does so through the example of how such schools utilize 'pep rallies' to counter any waning motivation among these students, who are under intense

educational pressure. The ideal individual envisioned in motivational speeches at these rallies takes full responsibility for his or her life and family, controls his or her emotions, strives for success, but leaves broader social structures and power relations unquestioned. Presenting the perspectives of young teachers, who themselves also grew up in post-reform China, chapter 5 portrays their experiences of struggling with 'the requirement of promoting to the upcoming generation the intertwined ideals of individual decision making and collective political loyalty' (p. 154), as well as with the construction of a compressed generation gap in which students are seen to be becoming increasingly selfish.

At times I would have wished to have seen more about what kind of 'individual' the school is making in relation to the 'collective' in different dimensions: for example, the complicated relationships between the individual/student and the family, as well as students' own, perhaps ambivalent, beliefs and feelings about the state and the nation. Nonetheless, Hansen's beautifully written ethnography provides a convincing account of life in a rural high school community in twenty-first-century China. This work shows the value of in-depth ethnographic analyses of schools in understanding Chinese social transformation and illuminates the role of education in nation-states' projects of moulding the ideal citizen more broadly. It is an excellent resource for scholars and students in anthropology of education and China studies.

Jing Xu *University of Washington*

Jankowiak, William R. & Robert L. Moore. *Family life in China*. x, 219 pp., bibliogr. Cambridge: Polity, 2016. £15.99 (paper)

Producing a book on family life in contemporary China can be particularly challenging given the rapid changes that have taken place in the last century, and in light of the country's regional and ethnic variations. William R. Jankowiak and Robert L. Moore, two accomplished anthropologists, take up this challenge in *Family life in China*, a volume in Polity's 'China Today' series.

Providing an ethnographic and historical overview on the Chinese family, Jankowiak and Moore define it as 'an ever-changing and relatively adaptable institution' (p. 3). They focus on how the family has altered, sometimes dramatically, in response to wider social changes, and try to provide open-ended answers to the question: 'What role does the memory of the traditional Confucian family play in the lives of Chinese today?' (p. 3).

Before illustrating the transformations in Chinese family life, the authors outline the fundamental principles that shape the ideal Confucian family (chap. 1). By describing the marriage arrangements in Cao Xueqin's famous Qing Dynasty (1644-1912) novel, *The dream of red mansions*, they conclude that the key principles are 'patrilineality, virilocality, patriarchy, and deference to elders' (p. 4). However, the Chinese family is an umbrella concept that has to recognize and incorporate variations from region to region, and from one ethnic group to another. Although many alterations in the contemporary family echo a world-wide trend in which extended families are replaced by nuclear families, in China this trend is definitely a consequence of industrialization and urbanization (p. 8). Moreover, it is important to note that the social transformation of the Chinese family has been significantly shaped by the state, especially after the establishment of the People's Republic of China in 1949. It was after this point that a flood of new ideas (especially Marxism), initially introduced into China from 1919 onwards, came to have a rapid and extensive impact on every part of the country (pp. 179-81). This explains why the volume focuses most of its analysis on the changes after 1949.

The book's main chapters examine different aspects of, and alterations in, the Chinese household. Chapter 2 focuses on the core of family: kinship and its transformations. The authors introduce two alternative models of the contemporary family's social organization: the corporative model, which views the family primarily as 'an economic entity composed of rational, self-interested members'; and the private-life model, which emphasizes the 'subjective or internal life of the individual' (pp. 20-4). Both patterns are helpful for understanding the reconfiguration of Chinese kinship principles. However, the latter model provides a more measured understanding of how the Chinese family, as a structural unit, is also the arena in which ongoing cultural and psychological transformations are encountered.

Chapter 3 shifts the discussion to the different responses to changes in courtship and marriage practices among three ethnic groups: the Uyghurs, Tibetans, and the Mosuo. Chapter 4 analyses transformations of courtship and marriage in general; while chapter 5 discusses the rise of the affection-based marriage, and how the trend towards 'romantic relationships' undermines Confucian principles. Parenting

philosophy and its modifications are the main topics of chapter 6. Chapter 7 considers intergenerational relationships. In the concluding chapter, building on the diverse cases discussed in the book, the authors point to some common trends embedded within the transformations taking place, including a preference for more individualistic, affection-based and reciprocal relationships among family members, with women's power being enhanced in almost all family structures, and new definitions of filial piety springing up. These trends show not only changes in traditional values, but also how Confucian ideals continue to influence family life in a more nuanced way.

Providing syntheses of both academic literature and their own fieldwork data, the authors give vivid and rich accounts throughout the chapters, providing a useful analysis of the relevant literature and the various theories on this topic. I would have liked to have seen the authors offering more detail on why some texts on the Chinese family reach very similar conclusions, while other works come to extremely different assumptions. Such a discussion would help readers better understand the complexity of the changes that the family in China continues to experience. Nonetheless, *Family life in China* presents a dynamic and historical view of the family, making it a good addition to any anthropology course's kinship reading list. I also would recommend it for introductory courses on Chinese culture and for non-academic audiences who do not have a deep knowledge of the topic.

Yun Tang *Southwest Minzu University*

Zang, Xiaowei. *Ethnicity in China*. xxviii, 236 pp., map, table, bibliogr. Cambridge: Polity, 2015. £15.99 (paper)

The notion that the People's Republic of China (PRC) is a multi-ethnic country is only slowly establishing itself beyond Chinese-focused scholarship. In fact, more than 100 million people in the PRC are today officially classified as 'minority *minzu*' (*shaoshu minzu*). In its early Communist association, *minzu* was a close relative of the Soviet 'nationality', but recently it has been increasingly translated as 'ethnic group' in an attempt to do away with this connotation. Xiaowei Zang's book is a study of China's policy towards its minority *minzu* since the 1950s. It begins with a chronological table, followed by a preface and seven chapters.

In the first chapter, the author provides basic information about the Minzu Classification Project in the 1950s and the resulting categorization of China's population into a Han 'majority' and fifty-five 'minorities'. In chapter 2, Zang focuses on the question of ethnic inequality. He analyses the policies that target the development of minority regions, and the individual-orientated affirmative action policies, concluding that neither have been successful in decreasing the income disparity between the Han and the members of minority *minzu*. Chapter 3 is devoted to the question of what the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) has done to 'preserve' minority cultures. The essentialized and bureaucratized notion of culture that Zang employs here includes, among others, literature, customs, sports, and religion. While Zang focuses critically on whether the government has done enough to preserve what it defines as minority cultures, the reader might also wish to see a more analytical discussion both of the process of distilling culture from ethnic groups and of the power structures in which this process is embedded.

The next chapter outlines the CCP's policy on regional autonomy for minority *minzu* and offers an overview of the opinions in and outside China on how successful the policy has been. It also highlights the tensions inherent in the dual power system in China, where government-formulated policies always remain subordinate to the interests of the Communist Party. In chapter 5, Zang discusses the political, social, and economic differences *between* the minorities, and *within* each of them, demonstrating further that the seemingly universal minority policy is applied in a highly flexible way depending on the government's assessment of these differences. In chapter 6, he focuses on two conflict-ridden regions, Tibet and Xinjiang, and asks why their rapid economic development has failed to do away with ethnic discontent and separatist tendencies. In the last chapter, the author analyses China's minority policy against the backdrop of international debates on minority rights and transnational governance.

Zang's particular focus in *Ethnicity in China* is on the impact of the Confucian ideology of cultural amalgamation (*ronghe*) on minority policy. He locates major tensions in this policy in the juncture where the underlying ideal of amalgamation meets both with the related unwillingness on the part of the central government to implement group-based rights for China's minorities and with its fixation on economic development as a universal remedy for ethnic tensions. Regrettably, Zang does not contravene the perspective of the Chinese state in representing ethnicity in China; rather he focuses

exclusively on *minzu*, a categorization which is only a part of much more complex processes of ethnicity. Also it appears that the author, with his discussion of ethnicity as a set of objective markers such as ethnic costumes, food, festivals, and 'unique facial features', is oblivious of the debates on ethnicity which have engaged scholars in the fields of, among others, social anthropology and social psychology since at least the late 1960s.

Ethnicity in China, Xiaowei Zang writes, is addressed to 'the ordinary citizens in the West' (p. 110). As such, it should perhaps not be blamed for providing little new information for the students of ethnicity in China or for the sometimes lack of depth in its argument. Still, one could contend that the epistemological categories with which Zang works – for example, those of 'minority cultures' and 'ethnicity', which appear to be taken directly from official jargon – should nevertheless be critically contextualized. This would help highlight the historical contingency of power relations which they reflect and reinforce. Engaging with processes of ethnicity historically and beyond the PRC's scope of vision would do more justice to the book's title and to the dynamic topographies of ethnicity in China.

Agnieszka Joniak-Lüthi *LMU Munich*

Settled strangers

Leichtman, Mara A. *Shi'i cosmopolitanisms in Africa: Lebanese migration and religious conversion in Senegal*. xvii, 294 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. Bloomington: Indiana Univ. Press, 2015. £22.99 (paper)

Exploring the spread of Shi'ism in Senegal, Mara Leichtman's book is a vital intervention in debates on Islam, as well as on migration, mobility, and cosmopolitanism in general. *Shi'i cosmopolitanisms in Africa* takes Shi'i Islam as its subject, situating its deliberations around Shi'ism in a Sunni-majority context. Discussing cosmopolitanism as a 'heuristic concept' and a 'contested category of practice' (p. 5), Leichtman critically reflects on renderings of Islam as inherently counter-cosmopolitan. She probes into 'the process of becoming Shi'i in Senegal' (p. xi) and transnational Shi'i influences through the examination of two communities and their distinctive historical trajectories: the Lebanese diaspora and Senegalese Sunni 'converts' to Shi'i Islam. Leichtman scrutinizes Lebanese migrants' cosmopolitan practices and the Shi'i community in Senegal as 'grounded in the local' (p. 6), revealing not only how localization and globalization, but also the religious and the secular, are closely intertwined.

This study of 'south-south migration', prefaced by an introduction, is composed of two sections. The book's first half, 'The making of a Lebanese community in Senegal', is concerned with a four-generation-long history of Lebanese migration to Senegal and traces this group's gradual change from being a migrant community to becoming an ethnic group. Drawing on Peter van der Veer's concept of colonial cosmopolitanism (in S. Vertovec & R. Cohen, eds, *Conceiving cosmopolitanism*, 2002: 165-80), chapters 1 and 2 discuss how the Lebanese were 'defined as much by others as by self-definition' (p. 40) under French rule (1880s to 1960) and in the post-independence era. *Politique de races* was intrinsic to French colonial policy, accompanied by 'the colonization of consciousness' (cf. J. Comaroff & J.L. Comaroff, *Of revelation and revolution*, 1991), and Leichtman recounts how it materialized in confessional divisions, roughly splitting Islam into African *Islam noir* and Arab Islam. Further, she details how the self-identification of the Lebanese has revolved around hybridity, multiple citizenships, and 'belonging' to more than two nations – that is, Senegal, Lebanon, and France. Many of them thus have called themselves Afro-Libanais or Senegalese of Lebanese origin. Through the story of the Lebanese Shaykh 'Abdul Mun'am al-Zayn, chapter 3 examines confessional coexistence and 'religious fluidity' (p. 99) in Senegal, as well as Shi'a Islam's global connections more broadly. 'What happens when religion migrates?' (p. 140), asks Leichtman in part 1's closing chapter, which explicates the relationship between migration, religion, and politics by addressing '(trans)nationalism' among members of the Lebanese diaspora who have never visited Lebanon.

Part 2, 'Senegalese conversion to Shi'i Islam', is 'an ethnography of a religious movement' (p. 145), and an analysis of the interactions between the Lebanese and Senegalese Muslims, which demonstrates how the immigration of the former group affected the host society. Chapter 5 explores the attempts to establish Shi'i Islam as autochthonous to Senegal. This happens, for example, through its vernacularization, which encompasses 'the intellectual process by which Shi'i Islam is adjusted and interpreted against Sufi ideology and Senegalese culture' (p. 164). Chapter 6 deals with individual narratives and nuanced accounts of proselytization. Leichtman defines conversion as 'a change in religion over

time, involving a transformation of one's religious culture resulting from multiple factors including social networks with other believers, a discovery of key religious texts, and a response to a particular location in both time and place' (p. 168).

She locates the conversion stories in a broader social context and describes how 'cosmopolitan Islam' is mobilized in making autochthony claims. This is driven by myriad motives and equally varied perceptions of Shi'i Islam, denoted as, for example, 'an active' or 'peaceful' Islam, or 'an Islam of opportunities abroad', or one that grants women more rights than the Sufi orders. Chapter 7 elaborates further on autochthony and the construction of Shi'i minority identity. Recognizing fundamental Shi'i practices as native to Senegal is to prove their indigeneity and aims at adjusting Shi'i Islam to a local environment instead of integrating it into a global movement.

Leichtman's book brings to the fore the interplay between cosmopolitanism and Islam, offering extensive insights into the emergence of 'a universalising while differentiating identity that supersedes previous colonial categories of "race" (for Lebanese) and "ethnicity" (for indigenous Africans)' (p. 236). Her examination of Shi'ism in an African context is a welcome addition to migration studies and the growing body of research on Muslim cosmopolitanism(s), resonating with Doreen Massey's astute observation that 'the local is always already a product in part of "global" forces' (*Social division of labour*, 1995: 184). This contribution comes at an important time – one of mass migration, the 'refugee crisis', and anti-Muslim rhetoric – in which the questions about religious coexistence and Islamophobia seem more apposite than ever.

Katarzyna Puzon *Humboldt University*

Mannik, Lynda (ed.). *Migration by boat: discourses of trauma, exclusion, and survival*. viii, 279 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogrs. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2016. £92.00 (cloth)

Seven women from West Africa drowned trying to reach Spain in a small vessel the day this review was written. Forced out by war, conflict, poverty, and a lack of opportunities in their countries, thousands of people – just like these women – are ready to risk their lives in small, overloaded vessels that are quite often old and in poor condition. *Migration by boat* is a very timely edited collection which contributes to making visible the men, women, and children who have travelled this way and have been excluded on arrival or have disappeared in the sea.

Although people have been migrating by boat for centuries, the legality of such migration has proved increasingly contentious since the Second World War. Indeed, migration itself has become politically contested. The 1980s marked a shift towards increasingly hard-line policies against migrants, with media representations fuelling fears of invasion and using a language of securitization that frames migrants as a threat. The possibilities of legally entering the European Union, but also Australia, the United States, and rich countries world-wide, have dramatically decreased; this has not, however, deterred people from attempting to cross borders. On the contrary, they take more and more risks to try to traverse national boundaries, and are ready to pay an ever-increasing price in the hope of success.

This volume tackles the dominant discourses on migration by boat through analyses of fiction, visual arts, and other media. In bringing together articles by an international group of scholars, one of its major strengths is its cross-cultural scope as it offers the possibility of exploring similarities and singularities in the representations of migrants in different places. The contributors discuss the multiple ways in which stereotypical representations of migration by boat marginalize the people involved and even depict their endeavour as an irrational act (see especially Horsti, chap. 4). They explore how the oscillation between securitization and humanitarianism, which lies at the core of the contemporary politics of migration, and the dialectic in place between hostility and hospitality (Salerno, chap. 7) shape how arrivals are conveyed in the media and in cultural productions. At the same time, the volume offers a set of analyses of how productions of social memory in museums, memorial sites, and through films, performances, and literature give voice to the people involved in migration by sea, thereby challenging the dehumanizing policies and contributing to transforming or, at least, qualifying public perceptions. The authors share a common concern for action and belief in the possibility of changing reality. In this sense, they all engage in a welcome discussion that extends beyond academia proper.

The different chapters provide a reflection about the labels employed to name and categorize people who migrate by boat (refugee, asylum seeker, migrant, illegal migrant, etc.). There is also careful examination of the water-related metaphors that tend to be used in the media about arrivals by boat (i.e. flow, flood, wave, etc.) and when describing the effects they

have on places of arrival (i.e. swamped, washed away, inundated, etc.): terms that channel fear and anxiety (Mannik, chap. 9).

The volume is organized into four sections. The chapters in the first, 'Embedded memories for public consumption', examine how migration by boat is remembered through literature and museum exhibitions. Those in the second section, 'The artist and the illegal migrant', explore the capacity of different artistic productions (fiction, art installations, monuments, and performance pieces) to provide an understanding of the contemporary border regimes in Europe and Australia as well as the experiences of irregular arrivals by boat. The third section, 'Media, politics, and representation', focuses on media representations and the ways in which they shape public opinion. The last set of chapters in 'Stories of smuggling, trauma, and rescue' provide an interesting counterpoint to the stereotypes and representations already examined by focusing on the experiences not only of those who migrate by boat and their so-called 'smugglers' – displaying a subtle analysis that adds complexity to the varied relationships between people-smugglers and refugees (Hoffman, chap. 11) – but also of the inhabitants of the places of arrival.

As a whole, this collection constitutes an insightful examination of the contradictions between representations and lived experiences of migration by boat. The volume will be of particular interest to scholars working on migration and borders, but, by providing ample case studies of historical and contemporary representations of migration by boat, it also will appeal to academics interested in media and communication studies.

Carolina Kobelinsky *CNRS*

Oonk, Gijsbert. *Settled strangers: Asian business elites in East Africa (1800-2000)*. xix, 270 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. London: Sage Publications, 2013. £47.00 (cloth)

The success of South Asian traders in East Africa has been attributed to their reliance on familial networks and 'middlemen minority' status (E. Bonacich, 'A theory of middleman minorities', *American Sociological Review* **38: 5**, 1973). This book takes a fresh look at the question of South Asian entrepreneurial success from an original angle. A historian who has conducted long-term research on the major Gujarati trading elite families in East Africa, Gijsbert Oonk examined Zanzibari archives dating between 1875 and 1912, and found that they included 1,627 bankruptcy cases. This, he argues, indicates that for every success story, there were numerous failures, with traders returning home to India. Success was not a given: those traders who grew and prospered did so against the odds. Despite this, Oonk shows, familial success led to heroic family myths about the original founders, who were said to have braved the oceans in small fishing dhows.

The book reveals several other interesting features of this particular migration story. First, we learn that the initial migration was to Zanzibar, which had a Muslim ruler, and only later did traders move into other parts of East Africa. Initially, they followed the trade winds, going home across the Indian Ocean every year, before they finally settled in Africa. Second, we are told that Hindu merchants were reluctant to bring their wives, and this might explain the disproportionate success of Muslim Gujarati traders, especially Bora Ismailis, who brought their womenfolk over early on. A third point of interest revealed by the author is that whereas initially India was the focal centre of family businesses, over time disillusionment set in, and it came to be regarded as a backward and corrupt place unconducive to business, while mercantile interests thrived elsewhere – whether in London, Dubai, or Singapore. A final significant point is that following the end of British colonial rule, there were major political attempts by East African Asians to claim their rightful place in the newly independent East African countries as nation-builders, but these attempts invariably failed. Many South Asians were deprived of their property and businesses, even before their expulsion from Uganda by Idi Amin. Their contribution to their adopted countries is still ignored in school books and in national rhetoric. In the Ugandan case, they were asked to leave within six weeks, stripped of all their property and wealth.

The signs were already on the wall before the end of colonization, however, and the big mercantile families had begun to establish businesses and to buy property in London, or elsewhere, while making sure they possessed multiple passports. They and their businesses became truly international. During their stay in East Africa, the author argues, Hindus in particular (mainly Lohanas) abandoned many of their restrictive customs, including vegetarianism and strict caste endogamy. They adopted Western dress, particularly in business dealings, and supported schools modelled on British public schools, which led to further education at British universities.

Ethnographically and historically, the book thus presents a fascinating, novel picture of the large and successful East African Asian mercantile families. Theoretically, I found it less satisfactory. First, although the author speaks of 'diaspora' and points to the absence of a myth of return in this particular case, in fact the mercantile elite were a tiny minority within the East African diaspora, which numbered in the tens, and even (in the case of Kenya) hundreds, of thousands. We learn little about the fate of the rest, nor of their continued links to India. Diaspora theory itself has also moved on with the contributions of Hall and Gilroy to this debate. Second, I missed works on 'twice migrants' in the United Kingdom – apart from Parminder Bhachu's excellent study *Twice migrants* (1985), which is mentioned. There are other works on Patels, Lohanas, and Oswalds, and, certainly, anthropological monographs on East African Asians or Asians elsewhere on the continent that are noteworthy by their absence. There is also a rather rudimentary understanding of so-called 'ethnic entrepreneurship'. The author mentions the reliance on credit and trust in the expansion of businesses, but this has been theorized more fully in my own work, for example, and is frequently associated with the debate on ethnic enclave economies. Finally, considering Aihwa Ong's *Flexible citizenship* (1999) and her discussion of the use of multiple passports in diasporic trading families would have added a further dimension to the analysis. The book also suffers from repetition and often reads more like a thesis than an integrated monograph. Nonetheless, for those working on diaspora trading networks and the history of East Africa, it is an important resource.

Pnina Werbner *Keele University*

Salazar, Noel B. & Kiran Jayaram (eds). *Keywords of mobility: critical engagements*. 188 pp., bibliogrs. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2016. £78.00 (cloth)

As the world of mobility changes, so do the words that describe it. Four decades ago, Raymond Williams's *Keywords* (1976) did not include 'mobility'. This fascinating new volume now unpacks the term through eight keywords: capital, cosmopolitanism, freedom, gender, immobility, infrastructure, motility, and regime. A succinct summary of mobility studies by Noel B. Salazar introduces the volume and its approach: not an all-encompassing list, but a set of keywords that 'offers a coherent critical perspective on mobility' (p. 7). Each single-authored chapter then reviews a keyword's genealogy, reflects on its use via mobility, and provides, rather sparsely spread, ethnographic illustration.

In the first chapter, Kiran Jayaram analyses 'capital' in relation to mobility, while also looking at mobility as a form of capital in and of itself. Urging scholars to ask whether capital is a precursor or a product of movement, Jayaram suggests that it be defined as a 'process whereby a person or thing moves with the intention of generating profit' (p. 27). That people's capacity to do so is unequally distributed becomes clear in Hege Høyer Leivestad's chapter 7 on 'motility': the potential to move. Motility is more than 'measuring' capacities here and includes experiences of waiting, fears of mobility, and the role of the 'not-yet' of anticipated movement. This way, the author suggests, we can explore the limitations to aspiration, and it may be here – between *actual* and *potential* mobility – that motility's importance becomes obvious: not everyone who wants to move also has the capacity to do so.

With origins in ancient ideas of world citizenship, 'cosmopolitanism' connotes a mobile and hybrid world. Malasree Neepa Acharya (chap. 2) suggests that to explore its inherent tensions, ethnographies must look at its movers and bottom-up 'agents of change', such as elites and diaspora entrepreneurs. Cosmopolitanism's Eurocentric assumptions coexist with the cosmopolitan ghetto and subalterns, making it oscillate between universalism and diversity. Following Latour, the author proposes that reconciling these poles requires the universal recognition of a 'plurality of Otherness' (p. 47), rather than universal patterns of sameness. Next is chapter 3, in which Bartholomew Dean divides 'freedom' into two usages: people's freedom to be mobile, and the question of what people gain from moving (or staying). Despite its merits, the chapter's complexity hints at a tension in this volume between the style of a keyword entry and a chapter's theoretical aim. Amid countless cross-references, and a writing style that makes it difficult to comprehend the key argument, the reader frequently loses orientation.

Alice Elliot (chap. 4) then differentiates between 'gender' as *classification* (of two sexes), and gender as a relational concept or negotiated *process*. Gender certainly affects mobility, but how does mobility affect gender? Elliot argues that mobility does not only shape gender and social hierarchies; it is a form of gender in its own right. As moving people cultivate particular gendered selves through mobility, 'exterior movement and interior transformation' correlate

(p. 85). 'Immobility' also can transform, as Nichola Khan's chapter 5 shows. She touches upon liminality, capitalism and the restrictions of labour migration, and discusses the psychological aspects of immobility, before underlining the hope for change, resistance, and emotions that immobility can inspire. Asking what lies between mobility and immobility, Khan bypasses this bipolar division, thinking 'through theory ethnographically' to unearth transformative immobility among people (p. 109).

In Mari Korpela's chapter 6, 'infrastructure' is the 'framework within which people can, or cannot, move' (p. 113). Pertaining to both agency and structure, infrastructures facilitate movements and form part of unequal regimes, often as an 'invisible background' (p. 127). Despite a growing diversity of mobility infrastructures, the state still has much power to control, enable, or prevent people's transnational mobility. Some infrastructures underpin the 'regime', as Beth Baker's chapter 8 discusses: it enacts power, in part, through 'producing or limiting actors' mobilities; a rationalized system for the regulation of movement (p. 153). Exploring the case of undocumented youth in the United States, she demonstrates how people can subvert regimes they are governed by. To Baker, regimes of (im)mobility are always regimes of inequality.

The volume closes with two afterwords, one by Brenda Chalfin, who echoes the editors in saying that anthropology '"does" keywords differently' through a sustained encounter with ethnographic evidence (p. 172). Although the volume is a major success in that respect, one feels that its authors struggled to fulfil the ambitious aim of providing genealogy, summary, *and* ethnographic comparison simultaneously. This collection should inspire new questions about the relationship between ethnographic writing and the 'keywordization' of highly specialized fields.

Andreas Hackl *University of Edinburgh*

Wekker, Gloria. *White innocence: paradoxes of colonialism and race*. xiii, 226 pp., illus., bibliogr. Durham, N.C.: Duke Univ. Press, 2016. £17.99 (paper)

Gloria Wekker's *White innocence* is a study of the 'paradoxes of colonialism and race' in the Netherlands. It is also part and parcel of current social struggles in Dutch society – especially relating to Dutch citizens' engagement with the questions of race, racism, and hegemonic whiteness. This well-written book examines racism and the construction of whiteness in a country in which race has long been misunderstood and anti-racism has been marginalized as 'missing the point'. Taking a critical discourse and autoethnographic approach, Wekker concentrates not only on the Netherlands, but also on the production of knowledge, especially in academia. A well-known specialist in gender studies as well as on race and ethnicity, Wekker scrutinizes the Dutch taboo against speaking about race, zooming in on the affective and political afterlife of Dutch colonialism – a topic that has for too long been neglected in the mainstream social sciences in the Netherlands.

As Wekker points out, many white Dutch claim not only ignorance, but also *innocence*; and she argues that there is a 'rather general consensus' that race as a concept does not matter in the Netherlands (p. 80) – leading to a situation in which white racism is seen as something of the past or as located elsewhere. While she makes many valid points, more attention could have been paid to those scholars who have developed critical perspectives on what has been called the 'culturalization of citizenship' and racism's normalization (cf. M. Balkenhol, *Tracing slavery*, 2016; J.W. Duyvendak, P. Geschiere & E. Tonkens, eds, *The culturalization of citizenship*, 2016 – to name but two).

Nonetheless, I agree with Wekker when she points out that many scholars have remained attached to a non-racial view, presenting Europe as an exceptional space where race does not matter (cf. F. El-Tayeb, *European Others*, 2012). Moreover, she correctly contends that social research in the fields of ethnicity and integration in the Netherlands has suffered from a lack of reflexive analysis and therefore from a form of analytic naturalization (cf. P. Mepschen, *Everyday autochthony*, 2016), and sets out to understand why this is the case. Her book explores the paradox that race seems to be everywhere in the Netherlands – aggressively so – while it is simultaneously denied and evaded. She relies strongly on Said's notion of the 'cultural archive' (*Culture and imperialism,* 1993) and claims that 'a racial grammar, a deep structure of inequality in thought and affect based on race, was installed in nineteenth-century imperial populations and that it is from this deep reservoir, the cultural archive, that . . . a sense of self has been formed and fabricated' (p. 2).

Of central importance in the book is the concept of 'white innocence'. Adopting the role of a 'scavenger theorist' – borrowed from queer

theorist Jack Halberstam – Wekker explores how race, class, gender, and sexuality intersect in Dutch racist politics and how a particular, white subject comes into being: ignorant of past and present crimes, almost always faultless, and therefore innocent. In chapter 1, she focuses on the intersections of sexuality and race in everyday racism in the country, demonstrating that a fascination for the black female body goes hand in glove with the production of a particular kind of Dutch whiteness that 'persists in imagining itself as either always already non-racist or finds an exquisite and unabashed enjoyment in holding on to its white privilege' (p. 49). The examples she gives here and throughout the book will shock many non-Dutch readers. That they will hardly surprise white Dutch audiences exemplifies Wekker's central point: white innocence enables a culture of acquiescence that is also, and at the same time, a culture of permission and compliance. In other chapters, Wekker continues with this analysis and shows how contemporary sexual racism – including some articulations of sexualized Islamophobia – are grounded in older colonial, Orientalist fantasies and policies that have shaped the Netherlands' cultural archive.

This book has been a long time coming and there is no doubt that Wekker's work is changing the way scholars approach the question of race. *White innocence* has also had an important impact on Dutch social movements, especially influencing young anti-racist activists. There is, however, room for critique: I would have liked to have seen more analysis of the ways in which racial hierarchies come to be reified by representing (white) power as 'a possession rather than a relationship' (G. Yancy & P. Gilroy, 'What "Black Lives" means in Britain', The Stone, 10 October 2015, *nytimes.com*). Wekker's methodological focus on autoethnography also could have been reflected upon more deeply. That said, this monograph is an exemplary work of critical scholarship and Wekker's approach will no doubt contribute to making much-needed waves, both in and outside academia.

Paul Mepschen *University of Amsterdam*